



Sec. Lib. 6



Elementary Education Resource Library
RSPLE-MACISE
Central Institute of Education
University of Delhi
Delhi 110007

INDIAN UNIVERSITIES COMMISSION.

UNIVERSITY OF THE PUNJAB.

PART I.

ABSTRACT OF EVIDENCE.



SIMLA .

PRINTED AT THE GOVERNMENT CENTRAL PRINTING OFFICE

1902.

Table of Contents.

Serial No.	Name of witness.	Date of examination.	Page.
1	The Hon'ble Mr. C. L. Tupper, B.A., CSI, Financial Commissioner of the Punjab and Vice-Chancellor of the Punjab University.	14th April 1902	1—8
2	The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur Mr. P. C. Chatterji, M.A., B. L., Judge of the Chief Court, Punjab.	" " "	9—11
3	S. Robson, Esq., Principal, Government College, Lahore.	" " "	13—18
4	The Revd. Dr. J. C. R., Ewing, M.A., D.D., Principal, Forman Christian College, Lahore	" " "	19—22
5	Dr. A. W. Stratton, Ph. D, Registrar of the Punjab University and Principal, Oriental College, Lahore.	15th April 1902	23—29
6	The Revd. J. W. T. Wright, M. A , Principal, St. Stephen's Mission College, Delhi.	" " "	31—34
7	Dr. Geo. Serrell, M. A , LL D , Bacc.-at-Law, Principal, Law College, Lahore.	" " "	35—36
8	Colonel S. H. Browne, C I E., I M S., M D., M R. C. P., London (Honorary Surgeon to the Viceroy), Principal and Professor of Medicine, Medical College, Lahore.	" " "	37—38
9	Lieutenant-Colonel D. St. J. D. Grant, I M S., M B., M.A., B.C.II, Professor of Chemistry and Toxicology, Medical College, Lahore, and Chemical Examiner to Government, Punjab.	" " "	39—40
10	Lala Hans Raj, B A., Principal, Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College, Lahore.	" " "	41—45
11	Lala Lajpat Rai, Pleader, Chief Court, and Secretary, Managing Committee, Dayanand Anglo Vedic College.	" " "	47—51
12	T W Arnold, Esq., B A., Vice-Principal and Professor of Philosophy, Government College, Lahore.	16th April 1902	53—55
13	Dr. C. C. Caleb M B., M S., Professor of Physiology and Botany, Medical College, Lahore	" " "	57—60
14	Dr M A Stein, Ph. D, Inspector of Schools, Rawalpindi Circle	" " "	61—64
15	A. S. Hemm, Esq., B A., M. Sc., Professor of Science, Government College, Lahore.	17th April 1902	65—69
16	The Revd. H. C. Vetter, M.A., Vice-Principal and Professor of English, Forman Christian College, Lahore.	" " "	71—74
17	The Revd. J. H. Orinson, M.A., M D, Professor of Biology, Forman Christian College, Lahore.	" " "	75—76

Serial No.	Name of witness.	Date of examination	Page.
18	H. T. Knowlton, Esq, Principal, Central Training College, Lahore.	17th April 1902	77—78
19	M. Hakim Ali, Principal, Islamia College, Lahore.	" " "	79
20	S Abdul Qadir, B.A., Professor Islamia College, Lahore, representing Graduates' Association, Forman Christian College, Lahore.	" " "	81—85
21	F. J. Portman, Esq., B. A., Professor, of History, Government College, Lahore.	" " "	87—89
22	Muhammad Shah Din, Esq, B. A. Barrister-at-Law, representing the Anjuman-i-Islamia, Lahore.	" " "	91—94
23	Sheikh Muhammad Shah, Pleader, Chief Court, representing the Anjuman-i-Islamia, Amritsar.	18th April 1902	95—96
24	M. G. V. Cole, Esq, M. A., Principal, Khalsa College, Amritsar.	" " "	97
25	J. G. Gilbertson, Esq, M. A., Superintendent, Mission High School, Lahore.	" " "	99—100
26	Harkishen Lal, Esq, B. A., Barrister-at-Law, representing the Government College Graduates' Union.	" " "	101—103

WITNESS NO. 1.—THE HON'BLE MR. C. L. TUPPER, B.A., C.S.I., Financial Commissioner of the Punjab and Vice-Chancellor of the Punjab University.

Witness explained that his memorandum (Paper No. 1 in Part II) is based on the view he ventures to take of the history of the Punjab University and of the moral obligations which are connected with the position to-day. Witness referred to the account of the University in the general Volume of the Punjab Gazetteer.

The object of the witness is to indicate what are the limits within which alterations can be made. Certain trusts are imposed legally and morally. How far can these trusts be interpreted to correspond with the ever growing needs of higher education?

The question of a Punjab University arose in 1865 and was much discussed between 1865 and 1869. Sir Donald McLod addressed the Director of Public Instruction in 1865 to the effect that the time had come for the Department to encourage vernacular literature. The subject was taken up with enthusiasm by the *Anjuman-i-Punjab* and meetings were held. The following extract indicates the attitude of Sir Donald McLod:—

Extract from pages XIX and XX of the Introduction to the Punjab University College Calendar, 1874-75.

* * * Government and the Educational Department, while approving generally of the proposals made, began to fear that the development of native opinion had been somewhat forced by the influence of individual European officers, and were half prepared to conclude that the movement was, to a great extent, sensational rather than real. Instead, therefore, of at once remedying the evils in the existing system which were complained of, by adopting the proposals made by the Anjuman, the Government thought it better to let the matter rest awhile, to see if the enthusiasm for educational reform would continue or die out.

The names of the members of the European Committee formed in support of the proposed University are significant:—

Extract from Appendix A, page 113 of the Punjab University College Calendar, 1874-75.

President

THE HON'BLE SIR DONALD MCLEOD, K.C.S.I., C.B.

Members

A. A. ROBERTS ESQ., C.B., C.S.I.
F. H. COOPER, ESQ., C.B.
COLONEL R. MACLAGAN, R.E.
T. H. THORNTON, ESQ., D.C.L.
C. U. AITCHISON, ESQ., C.S.
G. W. LEITCHER ESQ., M.A., Ph.D.
BADEN POWELL, ESQ.

Secretary.

LEHEL GRIFFIN, ESQ.

Witness is acquainted with six of these gentlemen and can quite understand from what he knows of them the full significance of the remark quoted above.

It was on the strength of the memorandum issued by this Committee that subscriptions were invited, so that when any question arises as to how the funds can be used this document forms part of the evidence. The following is an important extract from it:—

Extract from Appendix A, page 115 of the Punjab University College Calendar, 1874-75.

The University of Lahore will therefore be founded with the following aims:—

- (a) To allow the people of this country a voice in the direction of their own education
- (b) To discipline the minds of students by a course of study in their own classical languages, and of such portion of their literature as would form a natural transition to a really intelligent acceptance of modern ideas.

- (c) To develop in every way such originality in literature as may already exist in the country, not impeding the progress of the movement by unnecessary rules and restrictions.

The next phrase is that of official correspondence. A meeting was held in consequence of which a letter was sent to the Government of India asking for a Punjab University. The proposal was at first negatived as premature. This led to some remarks from Sir Donald McLeod, from which the following are quotations :—

Extract from a letter No. 486, dated 12th November 1868, from T. H. Thornton, Esq, Secretary to the Government, Punjab and its Dependencies, to E. C. Bayley, Esq, Secretary to the Government of India, Home Department.

4 The basis on which this movement has been founded, His Honour desires me to state, is the desire on their part to be allowed some really effective share in directing the progress of education, and in regulating the constitution and aims of educational institutions in this province, with a view to impart to them a more national and popular character than they consider the existing institutions, as a rule, to possess.

5. By far the greater part of the subscriptions and donations collected, with a view to the attainment of this end, have been derived from the native chiefs having political relations with this Government, and it is certain that, if matters take a course which they approve, further assistance may be looked for from them when urgently called for.

* * * * *

9. The question involved then, in the present discussion, appears to His Honour to be practically whether the leading men of the Punjab shall or shall not be allowed a prominent and really effective share, under the general control of Government, in regulating the educational efforts of the Province, though to those who may view the subject from a purely European point of view, and are deeply imbued with the intellectual training, and accustomed to move in the intellectual atmosphere of the Universities of Great Britain, the matter may naturally present itself in a different light

Even then the Supreme Government were not convinced, and subsequent to the above and another letter Sir Donald McLeod had a chance of discussing the matter with the Viceroy, Sir John Lawrence, and other persons. Afterwards he wrote a minute in which he again set forth the two main objects of the University —

Extract from a Minute by the Hon'ble the Lieutenant-Governor, dated the 30th February 1869.

4. The main objects which the Punjab Government, prompted by the people themselves, has in view are in fact two — First, to give to the leading and most enlightened portion of the Native Community a share in directing the educational efforts of the Government, as affording the only means of really popularising our educational system. And, secondly, the creation of a more effective machinery than has heretofore existed for forming a vernacular literature imbued with the knowledge of the West, and creating a series of educational works in literature and science suitable for imparting that knowledge to the rising generation.

In the same note the Lieutenant-Governor made the following interesting remark :—

12. * * * It is desired and hoped that the examiners shall on every occasion be obtained from amongst persons unconnected with the Educational Department of the Province

Notwithstanding the distrust with which Sir Donald McLeod at first regarded the agitation he became in the end convinced that it was a real movement and that the intelligent and upper classes were vitally interested in the question of education.

The special objects were defined in a manner practically identical with the first of the present University statutes. At that time the discussion was fresh in the minds of the authorities and they closed the controversy with a notification defining the conditions under which they considered themselves at liberty to dispose of the

The Statutes.

funds. These conditions have an equal force at the present time. The following is the portion of the notification dealing with this point :—

Extract from Notification No. 472, dated the 8th December 1869, in the Punjab Government Gazette, dated the 23rd December 1869

Statutes of Lahore University College—

1. The special objects of Lahore University College shall be :—

- (1) To promote the diffusion of European Science, *as far as possible*, through the medium of the vernacular languages of the Punjab and the improvement and extension of vernacular literature generally ;
- (2) To afford encouragement to the enlightened study of Eastern classical languages and literature, and
- (3) To associate the learned and influential classes of the province with the Officers of Government in the promotion and supervision of popular education

The above are the special objects of the institution ; but at the same time every encouragement will be afforded to the study of the English language and literature, and in all subjects which cannot be completely taught in the vernacular, the English language will be regarded as the medium of examination and instruction

The next stage is that of legislation Sir Charles Aitchison was the most prominent member of the Committee to support the University scheme in its early days. It was he who saw through the Council the Bill which is now the Act of Incorporation. In the course of his speech he referred to the objects of the scheme of the University as follows :—

Legislation.

Extract from the speech of the late Hon'ble Sir Charles Aitchison, Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab, delivered in the Legislative Council on the 5th October 1882

Besides endeavouring to revive an interest in Oriental learning, to teach as far as possible through the vernaculars, and to stimulate the production of original vernacular literature, one of the chief aims of the proposed University, which should never be lost sight of, was the introduction of a popular and national system of education on the principles of the Education Despatch of 1854, by giving the people a large and direct voice in the regulation of their own educational affairs. This was very strongly insisted upon by Sir Donald McLeod, who desired as far as possible to promote spontaneity of action on the part of the Native Community, and who was opposed to their being too much guided by the opinions and advice of European gentlemen. In the University as now to be established this popular element is fully secured. The learned and influential classes of the province will, by the statutes be associated with the Officers of Government in the promotion and supervision of popular education. The Senate will be a consulting body in all questions of education, including primary education. It will assume, in fact, the position of a Board of Education for the Punjab, and become in educational matters an embodiment of the principles of local self-government as recently enunciated by the Government of India

It will be observed that the aims of the University had been defined years before the term Local self-government was used, and that the term was used and the principle supported by a man thoroughly acquainted with the conditions of the country. In another part of the same speech Sir Charles Aitchison said :—

I will no longer trespass on the indulgence of the Council though there are several distinctive features of the proposed Punjab University to which attention might usefully be directed, for example, its freedom and catholicity, whereby students of every language race or colour, no matter where educated, can be admitted to its privileges and honours, provided only they come up to the standard prescribed, its teaching capacity, its literary function

The above sentence is specially important because questions are now and then raised as to the admission of private candidates to the University examinations. Apparently the idea of Sir Charles Aitchison was one of great freedom and catholicity

After the Act had been in force for some time, Sir Charles Aitchison had again occasion to discuss the question alluded to above. The following are extracts from two of the Resolutions on the subject :—

Extract, paragraph 5, from the proceedings of the Hon'ble the Lieutenant-Governor, in the Home (Education) Department, No 51, dated the 14th April 1886

The term "Oriental University" had by this time been abandoned, and "Lahore University" substituted. The reason for this was afterwards fully explained by Sir Donald McLeod in his inaugural address* of 11th January 1870 at the first meeting of the Senate of the Punjab University College.

* "The use of the term 'Oriental' did not commend itself to my judgment, as I deemed it certain that without a large mixture of European literature and science with the studies to be promoted by the establishment of the proposed institution, the object in view could not possibly be obtained and after some discussion that designation was given up."

Extract from the Proceedings of the Hon'ble the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab in the Home (Education) Department, No. 52, dated Lahore, the 15th April 1886.

18. * * * That, as explained in Resolution No. 51, dated 14th April 1886, the obligations of the University towards Oriental learning so far as they affect its general funds are those set forth in the preamble of Act XIX of 1882, which embodies the substance of the principles expressed in the rules of the Punjab University College on which the University movement was commenced, but that there is no obligation, express or implied, to spend these funds on an Oriental College or in any other particular way than the Senate, having due regard to its other obligations under the Act, may from time to time determine, and that the particular manner in which the Oriental College or any other school or college which the University may establish is to be administered is a matter solely for the judgment of the Senate.

It is to be inferred from these and other remarks that the Punjab

Scope of the University.

University is not essentially an Oriental University nor essentially a Western University. It gives encouragement to Oriental and Western studies alike. Resolution No. 52 deals with the general endowments of the University. There was a separate Resolution dealing with donations for specific purposes; to that witness was not referring. Regarding the general endowments the conclusion which Sir Charles Atchison came to after a very careful examination of the case was in the words embodied in Resolution No. 52 of 15th April 1886 quoted above.

The President—The chiefs and people of the Punjab took an active part in the constitution of the University and the element of compact must be borne in mind in suggesting any changes.

Witness—The point on which I wish to lay special stress is that one of the original objects was the association of the people of the province with the officers of the Government in the supervision of education.

Witness continuing said that he had referred at length to the associ-

Development of the college system

ation of the University with Government in matters of education at the close of the third paragraph of his memorandum and had used the following words: "the judicious recognition of it in a practical way may encourage the very remarkable spirit of self-help in educational matters by which collegiate education in this Province is characterised, and may help to bring the Government more into touch with aspirations which deserve considerate treatment, all the more because they are not always similar to our own." In illustration of this he had caused a statement to be prepared of the fourteen colleges which have been opened and recognised by the University during the last 20 years which he presented to the Commission*. The list shows an extraordinary growth of college education. Some of these colleges are sectarian and denominational. There are two Missionary Colleges, one Aryan College, one Mahomedan College, one Hindi College, one Sikh College and three colleges established by the Native States. The experience to be drawn is that the interest of the people of the Punjab in education has not flagged, whereas in 1865 they were ready to find funds to establish a University they are now spending money on the maintenance of the different sorts of colleges they require. The Punjab University, having regard to its history, should welcome the establishment of these colleges with the greatest cordiality. Large sums have been spent by the Native States, Patiala spent five lakhs on building, Kapurthala has a budget provision of Rs. 28,000. A full account of these colleges will be found on pages 516 to 531 of the University Calendar. This has a bearing on a point referred to in another part of the memorandum, namely that the heads of recognised colleges should always be *ex-officio* fellows. The heads of these colleges are in communication with the communities and will help the Government to get into touch with them. No distinction need be made between 1st and 2nd grade colleges. There is no objection to a school having an extra college class.

The question of the Oriental College is highly controversial. It formed

The Oriental College

the subject of one of the Resolutions of Sir Charles Atchison quoted above. The conclusion at which witness has arrived is that the University is bound to maintain the Oriental College in view of its original connection with Oriental learning, and more than that it serves a very useful purpose. But

* See Punjab papers, Part II, page 9

for the Oriental College it would be difficult to furnish schools with Oriental teachers. Probably it would be necessary to add a class or classes to the Central Training College. Dr. Stratton would be more competent to speak on the subject of the maintenance of the Oriental College.

The Oriental School is a different thing, and witness is open to conviction on the question whether that school should be maintained out of the funds of the University. There would be a saving of about Rs. 3,000 a year if the school were dissociated from the University. Unaided or aided institutions might take over the school, for instance, the Khalsa College might manage the Gurmukhi classes.

The Law College is a weak spot in the University. It is a most difficult subject. The matter has been for a long time under consideration and the upshot of the complicated Regulations which exist under the Legal Practitioners' Act and the University statutes is that the students are forced to pursue their Law and Arts courses simultaneously. That spoils both the courses. Complications have arisen partly from the fact that the University was originally only allowed to grant Licenses and subsequently was allowed to grant degrees. It is necessary to work in co-operation with the Chief Court and to take into consideration their requirements. It is a very complicated and difficult subject, and witness hopes to be able eventually to lay before the Commission a formal memorandum dealing with this particular matter at greater length. A question has been raised regarding the establishment of a Law College elsewhere than at Lahore. When witness went to Delhi that proposal was made before him by St. Stephen's College, but after a careful consideration it was negatived. There was a great deal of discussion in the Senate about the proposal. The Vice-Chancellor, Sir Charles Roe, gave his opinion against the proposal. One of his reasons was that the Chief Court can exercise a better control at Lahore. Details of the Law School are given on page 515 of the Calendar. The principal is Dr. Serrill. There are six Law Lecturers. The number of the students has fallen off very materially of late, and the University has asked the Government to renew the grant-in-aid which it made some years ago and withdrew when it found that the institution was more than self-supporting. The College is a whole time institution. Only the principal devotes all his time to the College. The professors practise in the Courts.

Paragraphs 5 and 6 of the memorandum deal with suggestions for an Honours' course. Educational Officers are in the best position to advise on the point. Centralised teaching and an Honours' Course. However excellent a thing it may be to have professors who are intended for higher teaching only, it would involve a great change in the present system. At present Pass students are arranged in three divisions—first, second and third—beyond the Pass if they go up for the M.A. degree then it is there that their real higher work begins. To change all this would be difficult as it would involve the taking away of men from their own colleges to be taught in some other institutions. Speaking from western experience witness thinks that an Honours' course tends to degrade the Pass course. At present the stage of education is collegiate rather than University and professional. It might be arranged that some colleges should give instruction in one and others in another special subject. For instance there is great waste of time, power and money in providing the needful staff and plant in a number of colleges for science teaching. It would be a good thing to get all the science teaching done in one institution. It would be well if inter-collegiate lectures could be arranged for in other subjects; but at present the colleges are severed from each other by a variety of circumstances, among them being the fact that some of them are sectional and denominational, the very differences which have done so much to create and foster them. Until the higher aims of the University are more generally and definitely recognised they could not be induced to combine freely in an inter-collegiate system. A beginning may be made, in course of time, by University Professors being engaged to deliver a certain number of lectures during the course of the year.

If the Government were to found a Central School of Science which would teach Science up to the University standard to the whole province would have

no collegiate individuality of its own but would allow the credit of its successes to reflect on the particular colleges from which the Science students would be drawn, some of the most important objections would be met, but it is nevertheless doubtful whether the colleges would be prepared to accept such a scheme.

At present very few students take up higher studies, but it is desirable to be somewhat ahead of the demand. The strongest argument in favour of an Honours' course is that it would enable the stronger students to read more extensively and would prevent them from being kept back by the weaker. But the time is not yet ripe for an Honours' course. Witness would be glad in course of time to see the Government College a college for honours' men, but that is not practicable under existing conditions.

It is doubtful whether spheres of influence should be limited by locality.

Spheres of influence

For instance people in distant parts of India might wish to follow the Punjab course of Oriental learning. Probably the Punjab University would not wish to affiliate any institutions in Bengal or the United Provinces, nor would such institutions wish to be affiliated to it. It would be wisest to let the spheres of influence gradually acquire their own limits. The difficulty of supervising distant colleges might be partly met by the co-operation of the different educational departments. The spheres would in general arrange themselves by provinces, but a rigid rule would result in hard cases.

A number of candidates from the United Provinces pass the Entrance of the

The age limit.

Punjab University. The reason that they come is not that the examination is much easier than that in their own Province, but because there is a difference in the age rule. The Punjab University discussed the question of the age limit long ago and came to the conclusion that it was not desirable. It is not right that the regulations of different Universities should interfere with one another, and the question of the admission of students from different Universities should be settled by a conference between the Universities concerned. There should be

Harmony between Universities.

general harmony between the different Universities. It is inconvenient that examinations should be held outside the University limits; for instance that the Punjab University should hold examinations at Lucknow. Such examinations would be held entirely beyond the possibility of control. Witness does not know why the practice exists. He has not heard of students coming to the Punjab University from the Central Provinces. Dr. Bourne pointed out that the number of United Provinces students taking the Punjab Entrance is too great to be accounted for by the age limit. Witness said he would be happy to make inquiries into the matter if the Commission desired it.

Some time ago Mr. Robson urged the desirability of introducing affiliation rules. A statement was prepared of all the affiliation rules in force in all the

Affiliation.

Universities, and after it had been most carefully considered, a set of rules was drafted. They were placed before the Senate, and on the 14th May 1901 were postponed *sine die* on a motion for which witness was largely responsible. The reason was as follows. There had been some ill-feeling between the Hindu College at Delhi, in connection with the opening of which these rules were taken into consideration, and the St. Stephen's Mission College. It is not necessary to go into the allegations which they have made against each other. But when the affiliation rules first came from the Syndicate to the Senate Mr. Madhan Gopal acting on behalf of the Hindu College at Delhi on, no doubt, general grounds moved that the rules should be referred back to the Syndicate for further consideration in the Faculties. Witness feared a discussion of a racial and religious character. It appeared also that there was some misapprehension regarding the rules; there seemed to be a fear that they were designed to check the growth of the unaided and independent sectarian institutions. Witness said then and says now emphatically that if he believed the affiliation rules would produce any such effect nothing would induce him to support them. He afterwards asked the Hindu College gentlemen to tell him frankly what their substantial objections were to these rules. They said that their first objection was to the right of affiliation being vested in the Syndicate rather than in the

Senate, and, secondly, they were afraid of rules in the matter of fees. As regards the first objection, the wisest course would be to yield to it. Witness hoped ultimately to keep the work of affiliation in the hands of the Syndicate on account of the danger of importing into the Senate bitter sectarian disputes. However, if the Senate is strengthened in the way that witness has suggested in his memorandum and be made representative of all interests which he has contended that it should be, then he would be prepared to leave to it the decision on questions of affiliation. The decision may be made subject to the sanction of the Government. The Senate as a body would be capable of dealing with the question of affiliation. It would be difficult but not impossible for them to do so. They would have to exercise the power on the recommendation of the Syndicate. Colleges are at present recognised by the Syndicate for the purpose of awarding scholarships, etc. A rule to that effect will be found in the College Directory in the footnotes of pages 517-18 19 of the Calendar. In one or two cases the Senate revised the operations of the Syndicate, and that gave rise to canvassing of an improper kind.

The proposed affiliation rules did not allow private students except (1) females (2) *bonâ fide* teachers and (3) persons engaged in medicine or engineering and (4) candidates who have failed after a full course. There are many in that position. Witness has heard it said that some colleges send up their duller students as private candidates so that in case of their failure no disgrace should attach to the college. It is an evil which ought to be fought against as much as possible. It is almost a fraud on the regulations [Mr Bell said it existed in the case of schools not of colleges]. Government servants should also be admitted as private candidates on the understanding that the Head of the Department certifies that he is satisfied that the candidate has been *bonâ fide* pursuing a course of study.

Witness said he is prepared to take up the question of affiliation vigorously. Mr Bell remarked that a number of colleges have been recognised by the University but Government scholarships cannot be held in them until their efficiency has been ascertained.

Members of the Senate should be invited to sit on the Text book Committee and at the annual Educational Conference and the Government should ask their advice, as it asks the advice of the Director of Public Instruction, in deciding important questions in the subjects mentioned in the Statutes.

The rule requiring discussions in the Senate to take place in the vernacular, as far as possible is very inconvenient and is hardly necessary at the present day. The discussions should take place in English but it should be left to the option of any member of the Senate to ask for an explanation in Urdu of the substance of what has been said. Members should have the privilege which is accorded to the members of the Legislative Council, of putting in written speeches in English composed by themselves in their own language and translated for them by an officer of the Senate. The present system leads to tedious reduplication and attendance is not popular among European members. The present tendency is for the Syndicate to do all the work and too little is left to the Senate. Witness is opposed to election for the Senate. He prefers nomination as in the case of the Legislative Council. Public sentiment in the Punjab still prefers nomination to election as the more honourable thing. Witness attaches importance to having as Fellows junior men who are fresh from the experience and traditions of Oxford or Cambridge. The University would gain great advantage from their enthusiasm and knowledge. He also attaches some importance to the suggestion in paragraph 10 of the memorandum that the Syndicate should have the power of co-opting by unanimous vote for short periods. The power could be used to include young Government officers and thus induce them to take an interest in the affairs of the University. It is desirable that there should be some one on the Syndicate able to represent every point of view, and for this purpose co-opting for special purposes might be resorted to. It is essential that the status of a Fellowship should not in future carry with it the status of a Darbari but those who are Darbaris now in consequence of holding Fellowships should retain the privilege. The successors of the Ruling Chiefs who were the founders of the Punjab University College or its eminent benefactors should be nominated Fellows for life by the Chancellor.

Witness said that in the same way as he had associated the name of Sir Donald McLeod with the inception of the University and that of Sir Charles Aitchison with its introductory legislation, he would associate the name of Sir Mackworth Young with its recent development. In December last Sir Mackworth Young gave a long address in which he dealt with the weak points of the University. It has been referred to a sub-committee of the Syndicate. The following are some of its most important points —

(1) Sir Mackworth Young suggested that the question papers after leaving the hands of the examiners should be considered by moderators. The matter has been considered and the feeling of the Syndicate is against it. It has the disadvantage of admitting more men into the secret and of diffusing the responsibility for secrecy. It is difficult to prevent premature leakage of examination questions. If the system were carried down to the schools there would be a danger of persons being approached for improper purposes.

(2) Witness quite sympathises with Sir Mackworth Young's objection to the existing rule. In examinations above the Middle School and Entrance when a student fails by not more than five marks in one subject only, the examiner is asked whether he will give these marks. It depends entirely on the personal equation of the examiner. A rule has been devised to meet the difficulty adapted from the Medical School. The proposal is that when a candidate fails in only one subject and obtains considerably more than the minimum aggregate, he may be permitted to proceed with his course subject to re-examination in that one subject.

(3) Witness agrees with Sir Mackworth Young's remarks regarding the need for boarding houses. The matter is receiving attention. As regards the Law College, Dr Serrel is sending up a scheme.

(4) This raises the question of what has been done to fulfil the first and second objects of Statute I. More might have been done than has been done, at the same time the record has not been altogether a barren one. Witness presented a list of 27 books published under the auspices of the University, all but three of which are written in either Hindi or Punjabi. Witness referred to his own scheme that teachers should give occasional *quasi* professional lectures which should be translated into the vernacular.

(5) The last point raised by Sir Mackworth Young is very interesting, it relates to the construction of a University Hall. The main difficulty hitherto has been as to the site. Witness will press the matter forward and hopes soon to get some practical result. Witness would like for the promotion of *esprit de corps* a hall for the use of the University, in addition to an examination hall, to provide a home for Unions like those of Oxford and Cambridge. Witness would like to see good debates started and is not afraid of discussion. A good library should be established in the proposed buildings. Some time ago it fell to witness to inspect the Punjab Public Library and he found that its readers were mostly University students. This library should be transferred to the University, supplemented and used both for the students and the public at large. The University has a small library for the use of professors.

Witness is not in favour of graduates electing any members of the Senate. Non-election is for the Punjab the better plan. The time has not come to change it. With the present system of Fellows being Darbaris, there would be a danger of influence being brought to bear for the sake of the seat in the Darbar. Witness is opposed to Fellows being *ipso facto* Darbaris, the two are conferred for different reasons. The privilege should not be continued to future Fellows.

Appointments to the Senate should in future be for five years. This does not apply to ruling chiefs who are Fellows on different terms.

Terminable Fellowships.

**WITNESS NO. 2.—THE HON'BLE RAI BAHADUR MR. P. C. CHATTERJI,
M. A., B. L. (Calcutta), Judge of the Chief Court of the Punjab.**

Witness said he had little to add to his written statement (No. 2 in Part II).

Teaching in the Oriental College could be made more efficient than it

The Oriental College

is at present by introducing other higher subjects of study in the various languages. The branches of Law and Medicine which are taught in the Oriental College should be studied more thoroughly. There is a difference of opinion on the subject and witness fears he will not be able to carry his opinion far. Syed Hossain Bilgrami asked whether improved teaching would increase the number of students of whom there are at present very few. Witness said that the Vedic system of medicine is becoming more popular, but that students will not come to listen to low paid teachers. At present Rs. 30 and Rs. 15 are paid to the teachers of the Ayurvedic and the Yunani systems respectively. For these small salaries, it is not possible to provide efficient medical teaching. There are men now available who are proficient in the systems and who could be procured if adequate pay were offered. A man has recently been obtained from Calcutta whose lectures are much more popular. He teaches in Sanskrit and Urdu. He has good certificates and was medical adviser to a Maharaja. The good men are known by repute in their community. At present students are only taught theoretically and to prepare medicines. Chemical and practical instruction could be given if there were more funds. The Ayurvedic system is not all of it hundreds of years old, there have been more recent additions. The two indigenous systems should be studied in the Oriental College so that the students of the English system of medicine may also know one of them. They can then apply their combined knowledge to the improvement of both systems. In reply to Mr. Pedler witness said that he did not agree that the ingredients of the vernacular systems are unknown. The Oriental College is practically the only institution of its kind in India and ought to be maintained for the study of Sanskrit, Arabic and Persian. Sanskrit had almost fallen into disuse when the College was founded. The system under which the Principal of the College is also Registrar of the University was introduced by Sir W. Rattigan 15 years ago. It would be better to have a man entirely at the disposal of the University. From a monetary point of view the College does not pay—but that is not the chief point of view.

Indigenous systems of Medicine

men now available who are proficient in the systems and who could be procured if adequate pay were offered. A man has recently been obtained from Calcutta whose lectures are much more popular. He teaches in Sanskrit and Urdu. He has good certificates and was medical adviser to a Maharaja. The good men are known by repute in their community. At present students are only taught theoretically and to prepare medicines. Chemical and practical instruction could be given if there were more funds. The Ayurvedic system is not all of it hundreds of years old, there have been more recent additions. The two indigenous systems should be studied in the Oriental College so that the students of the English system of medicine may also know one of them. They can then apply their combined knowledge to the improvement of both systems. In reply to Mr. Pedler witness said that he did not agree that the ingredients of the vernacular systems are unknown. The Oriental College is practically the only institution of its kind in India and ought to be maintained for the study of Sanskrit, Arabic and Persian. Sanskrit had almost fallen into disuse when the College was founded. The system under which the Principal of the College is also Registrar of the University was introduced by Sir W. Rattigan 15 years ago. It would be better to have a man entirely at the disposal of the University. From a monetary point of view the College does not pay—but that is not the chief point of view.

The latest law regulations give some privileges to persons holding title

Oriental Titles and admission to the Bar.

degrees. The Chief Court used to hold the examinations and they were subsequently made over to the University subject to the control of the Chief Court. The "First Certificate" entitles the holder to practice as a Mukhtiyar, and the "Licentiate in Law" to be a Pleader. For the Licentiate the candidate must have passed the First Certificate Examination and must fulfil certain other conditions or receive the permission of the Chief Court. The Judges have framed rules under which the candidate must be (a) a B. A. or a Mukhtiyar of ten years' standing, or (b) a Mukhtiyar of seven years' standing and a Shastri or Moula Fazil, or (c) a Mukhtiyar of five years' standing and a B. O. L.

There should be a single Law College under the control of the University.

The Law College.

The other Arts Colleges should not be allowed to have Law Colleges of their own. The University spends a great deal more money on the Law College than other colleges could afford. The expenses are not less than Rs. 10,000 or 12,000 a year. The pay of the whole-time Principal is Rs. 700 a month, and that of the other five Lecturers ranges between Rs. 100 and Rs. 150 a month. This means a thorough instruction. The question of allowing Mofussil Law Colleges came up on the application of St. Stephen's College, Delhi. The main point was that law classes can be conducted after the F.A. and therefore that law students left the college before graduating. The University held that law

instruction ought to be thorough and that it was not desirable to flood the country with ill educated lawyers. No local college could give a thorough education and the proposal was therefore negatived. Witness would not allow students to read law before completing their Arts course. Three or four years ago the Law Faculty placed a scheme before the Senate for cutting down the law course from three years to two years, but the Senate at the instance of Sir W. Rattigan and Sir C. Roe disallowed it. A two years post graduate course would remove all reasonable ground for complaint. Students do not attach much importance to law lectures if they are doing B.A. work. Law students are obliged to attend to their lectures because they have to pass three examinations. The first year's examination is of a preliminary character, the second year's is what is called the First Certificate Examination if it is on the Chief Court side, or the Intermediate Examination if it is on the LL.B. side. The third year's examination is for the LL.B. or the Licence in Law. The law college lectures are in the morning and evening. This avoids the college hours. The Lecturers are legal practitioners and are occupied during the day. There is now one whole-time Lecturer who could give lectures during the day. The decrease in the number of law students has brought about the bad financial position of the University. The diminished popularity of law studies is due to the fact that the profession of Law is overcrowded and is not so remunerative as formerly. Rs. 200 a year is allowed for the library it is far but not good. The Law school will soon be again in need of a Government grant.

If there were funds it would be possible to start a teaching institution which would not interfere with existing colleges for either post graduate or science instruction. There is no provision for teaching in some branches of science. Mofussil colleges would not participate in the benefit. [The President explained the Allahabad scheme to surmount this objection.]

In considering any scheme for recognising teachers the point must be borne in mind that it would be very undesirable to diminish the prospects of graduates of getting employment.

For reasons explained in his memorandum (page 14 Part II) witness objects to the existing senate being disqualified *en bloc*. If graduates are allowed to elect some fellows they might be appointed for a number of years to test how the system works. There is no election by graduates at present but it should be allowed to a certain extent. The object of giving this privilege to the graduates is to induce them to take interest in the affairs of the University. The difficulty is whether the candidates would vote intelligently. In Calcutta there is some undesirable canvassing, but it is to be hoped that in course of time a better spirit will be infused into the graduates in the matter of electing candidates. Witness is not very keen on the point but thinks that some concession should be given to the graduates the proportion to be elected might be $\frac{1}{3}$ rd or $\frac{1}{4}$ th but witness has not considered the point.

No matter should come before the Senate unless it is recommended by the Syndicate and the Senate should have the power of revising the decisions of the Syndicate. There are no complaints as regards the constitution of the Syndicate. Twenty members are elected by the various Faculties. Witness has not heard of any complaint that outside colleges are not sufficiently represented in it. The difficulty in their case is about attending the meetings. All sections including the missionary bodies, are well represented.

There ought to be rules for the affiliation of colleges. The Vice Chancellor has stated the difficulties: (1) whether the power should rest with the Syndicate or Senate, and (2) the question of fees. With regard to (1) the Senate ought to have the power the Syndicate is only an Executive Committee of the Senate and the latter should not be ousted without good reason. Affiliation questions should be brought before the Senate by the Syndicate. There would have been no opposition if this had been allowed.

In the matter of fees. If a college is endowed and thoroughly efficient, there is no reason to require it to charge a particular rate of fees. The President pointed out the difficulty that the new colleges may interfere with properly efficient existing institutions. Witness thought that if the new college were also efficient, this might not be to the injury of education. Dr. Mackichan said that witness was putting an extreme case and that practically low-fee colleges were not in general endowed to such an extent as to allow them to be efficient. In reply to Dr. Mackichan, witness said that scholarships might meet the needs of poor students but that if a benefactor wanted to endow a good cheap-fee college, it would not be right to prevent him from doing so. It is scarcely proper for the University to say "education shall not be cheap". It is entirely opposed to a Native feeling which is that education should always be free. In old days the teacher not only provided free education for his students, but also paid for their food. Even now the same system is observed in the *tols*. There are no doubt drawbacks in having two institutions running side by side, the one with high fees and the other with low fees, but if the latter has endowments and can afford to charge low fees, the University should not say to it "don't charge low fees". On the whole, it would not be beneficial to say that a college shall not be affiliated because it does not charge certain fees. To prevent venture colleges from charging cheap fees the affiliation rules must be enforced and means must be taken to make them efficient. Results are some indication and there should also be inspection. Syed Hossain Bilgrami pointed out that there is no prospect of a college being run by a benefactor. Witness replied that he had said in his note that for improved teaching the money must come from the Government.

Teachers make the best examiners but there are complaints that, without attributing undue partiality, the students of the teacher-examiner get an undue advantage. The University is strong on this point.

There is no imperative necessity to start an Honours' Course in addition to the Pass Course unless there are sufficient funds for the purpose. If the B.A. course is not wide enough for a good man, he should be allowed to take more subjects, if he does not want to take more subjects then the M.A. Examination is sufficient.

There should be no age limit fixed for the Entrance. This question has been discussed from time to time since July 1886 and was ultimately decided in the negative in March 1891 after a good deal of consideration. It was found as a matter of fact that the number of students under 15 were very few.

The following figures refer to passes in the Matriculation Examination in 1901:—

1 candidate under 11		
15	"	13
17	"	14
114	"	15

Regard must be had to the conditions of the country. It must not be forgotten that students are married very early. If a very late time is fixed for Matriculation their educational career will be unduly prolonged. The President pointed out that a boy of 11 or 12 is not fit to begin college life. Witness said he himself was in favour of 14 but that the majority were against a limit. Witness has known some who joined under 14 and did very well. If any limit is fixed, it should not be more than 15, witness would prefer 14 or better still no limit at all.

The subjects of the University course might be reduced and the examination made more thorough.

The subject of Theology would be objectionable and would lead to endless controversies and difficulties

Theology

If a student fails in one subject but passes well in the aggregate he should be allowed to qualify by passing subsequently in that subject alone. It would be a pity to make him go up for all his subjects again if he has done well in them. The question is a difficult one and the above appears to be a good compromise.

WITNESS NO. 3 —S. ROBSON, Esq., M.A. (Edinburgh), Principal of the Lahore Government College.

Witness presented two general notes, also a note on the arrangements of College terms and University Examinations, and a summary of the remarks he made on the occasion of the visit of the Commission to the Government College (Part II, pages 21 to 49)

Witness said that he wished to emphasise the following matters :—

- (1) The quality of the students as they come from the schools.
- (2) What is done with them in College.
- (3) The character of the examination to which they are subjected on leaving college.
- (4) The constitution of the University.

The first point is vital. Unless there is a solid foundation, the superstructure must be worthless. What is pre-eminently required in order to improve the condition of school education, are teachers with higher qualifications, with better pay, and with a provident or pension fund. They must also be required to reside on or near the school premises. More intelligence in the methods of teaching is the most crying need of early school life. Other needs are more holidays, suitable playgrounds, no examination before the school final, examinations so conducted as to discourage cramming a separate matriculation, an age limit, stricter discipline and recognition of schools. It is not necessary to enlarge on these points—they are self-evident. To improve the qualifications of teachers better pay must be given. It is unreasonable to expect good teachers on the pay of coolies. The lowest pay of a teacher in English schools is about six rupees a month, nominally eight rupees. Mr Bell said that very few teachers in English schools get less than Rs. 8. Witness said that from bottom to top good men are required and must be paid for. There is great need for intelligent teaching, boys should be taught to think and observe for themselves, and not have text-books crammed into their heads in such a manner as to kill the power of thinking. Owing to the school system boys seem entirely to lose the power of thinking for themselves. Little boys—perhaps too young to be learning at all—are kept hard at work in school for five or six hours every day, for six days every week and for nearly 52 weeks every year. They get only a fortnight's holiday. For children so young the method of teaching is monotonous and wearisome, and the slow grind lasting for ten years without a break seems absolutely to paralyse all power of thinking.

Mr. Bell.—Have you yourself seen anything of primary schools?

Witness.—Nothing directly. But the best boys come to the colleges, so that I may fairly say I see the results of primary and secondary education.

Dr. Mackichan.—Does not the evil lie in the fact that the instruction is given in a foreign language—English?

Witness.—No; but the system is in fault which makes the boys go through the same subjects twice, first in Urdu and then in English

Mr. Banerjee.—Does not the blame lie with the system of teaching foreign ideas in a foreign tongue?

Witness.—If so, the fault is in the text-books, not in the language which is the medium of the text-books

Holidays are a matter of the greatest importance for the teachers as well as for the scholars. Fresh, enthusiastic, magnetic teaching is required but cannot be got from worn-out drudges, especially in a climate like that of India. In England preparatory schools have a vacation of three months, and it is not too long.

Mr. Bell remarked that in India boys are often happier in school than anywhere else, and instanced the case of zamindari schools where boys are required to attend only once yet insist on attending twice a day.

Witness said that the point is that the human brain cannot develop and grow under such conditions. He further complained that hard physical work, which is called "drill," monopolises what should be the intervals of rest.

Mr. Bell.—What you describe as hard work the boys regard as play.

There should be no examination whatever below the school final examination. Why bother little boys with examinations which serve no purpose except the most condemnable one of encouraging cram? Examinations press upon the boys from the very beginning of their school career: all they look forward to is a long vista of examinations.

Boarding-houses should be provided for all schools, and also play-grounds with systematic provision for games of an improving nature.

A more extensive course of miscellaneous reading should be encouraged in order to broaden the mind and awaken intelligent ideas. At present a few selected books are worked up in the minutest detail in order that the boys may be able to answer ridiculous catch questions. It is impossible that a boy on starting his college life can follow lectures on all sorts of subjects if his mind is not already stored with a wider course of reading than most of the boys have gone through. Reading should be less laboured and more varied. There should be more practice in colloquial English and the knowledge of grammar should be tested by the power to write English well. It is because of the present practice of setting absurd catch questions that "keys" are found necessary. The examination papers are to be blamed for the fact that every text-book has its "key," to be memorised. *Mr. Bell* remarked that there are no prescribed texts in high schools. *Witness* said that if the books were easy English and the papers well set there would be no opening for keys. *Dr. Bourne* asked whether the best examiners were procured for the Entrance Examination. *Witness* said that is not possible when the remuneration for correcting paper is only annas 4 or annas 6. Much higher fees should be given to the Entrance Examiners. The Entrance papers are perhaps the most important that the University sets.

The Matriculation and the School Final should be two separate examinations,

Matriculation and School Final instead of being combined as at present

They are really two different things with two different objects. The Matriculation should be solely an examination for admission into a college—not for admission into Government service, which should be the object exclusively of the School Final. At present the Matriculation is looked upon as a sort of degree. To prevent that the individual results of the Matriculation Examination should not be publicly advertised.

Dr. Mackichan.—Then how is a boy to know whether or not he has passed?

Witness.—I would communicate the result privately to the headmaster. But I would grant no certificate.

Dr. Mackichan.—But the headmaster would have to communicate the result to the boy and give him a proper credential. Would not that be a certificate?

Mr. Robson.—It need be only a postcard.

Witness.—Last year 1,296 boys passed the Entrance; this year only 400—500 went up for the F. A. and a number of them must have failed. Probably only 200 out of 1,200 go through the University course and remainder are put educationally on a wrong track, the Entrance not being the sort of examination for which they are fit.

There is no objection on principle to colleges being allowed to hold their own Entrance Examination, but in practice some colleges would be tempted to admit boys more easily than others. It would also be a waste of power. The colleges are sufficiently burdened already, and they should examine their Entrance candidates collectively, as would be the case if the examination were conducted on proper lines. The character of the examination should be based largely on the course to be followed in college. The school final should not be conducted by the University. There should be a Government model school in each district similar to the Bengal schools. The Lahore School is the only one of the kind in the province. Even a small number of model schools would provide for the *bonâfide* matriculation candidate.

It would be quite possible for parents to settle whether or not their children would go in for a University education. In England the choice has to be made very early with a more remote outlook. The persons who mistake their vocation are those who are led on to a University course by passing the Matriculation. Some times they are miserably poor both materially and mentally and infinite harm is done to them and to the cause of education. That there are good poor students is beside the case every possible provision should be made by scholarships for the exceptional cases.

The teachers for the Matriculation classes should be graduates. A teacher who prepares boys for the University ought to be a University man himself—one who has been through the mill. It is always so in England. Mr. Bell said that the Department is trying to work up to this. Schools sending up boys for Matriculation should be "recognized" by the University. The Government model schools may be assumed to be efficient, and if other schools prepare for the University the latter should see that they are of a similar class. For schools inside the province the University might call for reports from the Education Department. Schools outside the province should not be recognized.

As a general rule private students should not be permitted. Some exceptions would be required and could be made by the Syndicate.

Residence in boarding houses should be compulsory for all students in the college stage whether their homes are near or not. Where possible every boarding house should have a European superintendent. He would have to be a bachelor and in sympathy with the work. It would be difficult to find such men. The professors ought to reside on or near the college premises, otherwise effective supervision outside the class is very difficult. The head of a college should not be an ordinary lecturing professor doing a full day's professorial work, with the additional burden of the Principalship which when properly done is itself a full day's work.

Dr. McIlhenny—If you remove students from their homes you must give them something at least as good—something like Aligarh for instance.

Witness—That can only be done in sectarian colleges. It would not be possible where Hindus, Muhammadans and Sikhs are mixed together.

There should be a system of 'caution money' as in English colleges. Students sometimes leave without saying good bye and without having paid their fees and missing dues. The system was introduced into the Government College three years ago but was disallowed by the late Lieutenant Governor, the reason being that caution money was not levied in other colleges. It appears to *witness* to be wrong that the model college of the province should not introduce any improvement that is not already known in the other colleges to which it serves as a model.

The want of affiliation rules has demoralised the Punjab Colleges. It is not possible to speak too emphatically on the subject of this evil. College fees should be fixed at a high rate and should be uniform. Scholarships should be provided tenable by poor children of exceptional ability.

To satisfy itself that the conditions of affiliation are fulfilled the Syndicate will have to delegate a person or committee to go into the matter. Conditions will have to be laid down, not too rigid regarding building, grounds, staff and appliances. Probably no single individual would be able to give an opinion on all points. It would be difficult to find men qualified to give an opinion except men belonging to other colleges. It would be a very difficult and a very invidious task for such men and the inefficient colleges will greatly resent the inspection. But the difficulty is one the University must face.

A minimum fee should be one of the conditions of affiliation.

One must admit the difficulty in the case suggested by Mr. Justice Chatterji, where owing to an endowment a college might be able to afford to charge very low fees, but even in that case the University should insist.

The President.—In Jeypore there is an endowed college which charges no fees at all.

Mr. Pedler.—There is another in Burdwan.

Witness.—I believe there is going to be one here. An endowment of ten lakhs has been obtained. Even in such a case the minimum fees should be required, it is harmful not to charge it.

Dr. Bourne.—Suppose you allowed such a college to entertain a certain number of free students, on condition that it charge the minimum fee to all others.

Witness.—That might perhaps be allowed to meet the case of very poor boys of exceptional ability. But generally speaking free education in colleges is a mistake because it tempts boys to matriculate who are utterly unfit for a college course.

The present arrangement is University Examination in March, results out

Arrangement of terms.

early in May, classes open on 15th May. Classes to end of July and vacation to 15th October. Classes again to end of February and then preparatory leave for the examination. There are 16 months' teaching in the two years and they include July twice over. It is impossible for young students to do brain work in July. The professors have to do 19 months' work, again including the two Julys. The following would be a better arrangement. Begin on 15th October and continue to the end of June—8½ months. Vacation from beginning of July to end of October. The same for the second year. This gives 17 months and avoids work in July. The climate make it impossible to hold examination in June or July the examination should therefore be held at the end of the long vacation. This will also give the students time for more leisurely preparation. The gain to the staff and students would be great. So also would it be to the University, because examiner could not be occupied elsewhere and would therefore be more easy to procure the extra month might be and to give a fortnight's break at the beginning of April in each year.

The teaching of Oriental classical languages should be by men who know English, other languages and comparative philology. This is not the case at present. Students are required to translate into and explain in English and they cannot be taught to do this by men who do not know English. Those Oriental lecturers are also not under the control of the Principal of the Government College. This is inconvenient. It is proposed to introduce the tutorial system and it would have been a help had they been available for the purpose.

Mr. Justice Banerjee—Is not an Indian teacher more likely to interpret correctly from the standpoint of its author than a European?

Witness—Yes, if he is otherwise qualified. It is desirable that he should know Latin or Greek because in order to teach a classical language scientifically the more a teacher knows about other classical languages the better. The M. B.'s of the University are a great improvement in many of the old class of teachers.

Witness desired to lay stress as the following matters regarding the examinations at the end of the course—

Examinations

- (1) The examination to be on subjects not on text-books.
- (2) The pass B. A. to be easy and a separate Honour Course to be instituted.
- (3) No rigid system of marks.
- (4) Scholarships to be given for proficiency in separate subjects.

The President remarked that the third suggestion implies implicit confidence in the examiner, marks being the only check. *Witness* doubted whether they

System of marks

are a satisfactory check and said that the system of attaching a fixed maximum number of marks to each question encourages superficiality, to illustrate this point *witness* quoted the following questions from an examination paper—

Give biographies of Chaucer, Bacon, Locke and Addison—3 marks. Name their principal writings and give a summary of the purpose and contents of each—5 marks. Trace their influence on English thought and literature—6 marks. Describe the change from the lyrical to the romantic in English poetry—3 marks.

Describe the improvements introduced by Hume, Roberts and Gibbon in the method of writing history—1 mark each. Describe the growth of the English novel from the commencement to the present time—5 marks. Write a history of the Arthurian legends—4 marks. Compare in detail Spencer with Tennyson—5 marks. Quote from the *Fairy Queen* and from *The Passing of Arthur* to illustrate your answer—4 marks. State the evidences of the chronological order of Shakespear's plays—3 marks. These questions are contained in a three hours paper. The only chance of satisfying the Examiner would be by a display of superficial knowledge such as is to be obtained only by cramming. No man knowing anything of English literature from direct study could pass it: he would know too much. It would be impossible to answer even one of the questions to one's own satisfaction in the space of three hours. Each question would need a volume to itself. The only kind of person who could pass in such an examination is the boy who knows nothing about English literature but has crammed a text-book and memorised a mass of general remarks which he is able to repeat without understanding them.

Mr. Justice Banerjee—If you do away with the marks how is a candidate to know which questions are the most important—which questions will procure him the most marks if he answers them correctly?

Witness—It should be part of the test that a boy should be able to decide for himself which questions are the most important. If he cannot do that he is not fit to pass. In a rational system of examination it does not matter what questions the student selects. It is the answers that are important and the Examiner will be able to gauge the students' knowledge from them. It is open to special objection that boys are compelled to answer questions concerning authors whose books they have never read. The ordinary boy knows nothing about English literature at first hand: he has merely crammed the text-book on

English Text-books.

the History of English literature. The book should be omitted until the student is advanced enough in his study of English literature to profit by it. It is a book of between 300 and 400 pages which at present the student is obliged to commit to memory if he is to answer such questions as those cited above.

The President.—What I understand you to urge is that a boy ought not to be asked to criticise an author whom he has not read.

The system of re-examination is unsound. It is a disguised and worse form of grace marks. If grace marks are given they are allotted on broad considerations of aggregate marks, etc., to deserving students. If an appeal *ad misericordiam* is made to the Examiner the result depends simply on his individual inclination.

Re-examination

The Government Scholarships on the results of the B. A. Examination should be given for separate subjects rather than for the aggregate in several subjects. This is no proper way of testing the aggregate. It may mean anything. The B. A. can be taken in 35 different ways. There are different papers and different examiners. In one subject the papers may be unusually difficult, in another unusually easy. The whole thing is haphazard except that no student has a chance if he does not take Mathematics. Mathematics is an exact science; literature is an inexact art. In Mathematics a candidate either answers the questions or he does not. If he answers them he gets full marks. On the other hand a candidate rarely gets full marks for answering questions in literature however successfully. The result is that scholarships hardly ever fall to the best all-round students but usually to the best man at Mathematics. A candidate taking up Sanskrit has no chance of a Government Scholarship. In 20 years only four non-mathematical students have got such scholarships. From his own knowledge of the students witness can say that good men have been defeated by inferior men who have taken Mathematics. The only objection urged against the grant of scholarships for special subjects is that it is not desirable to encourage specialisation. That is unsound. Provided a good general standard is exacted it is desirable to encourage special proficiency in particular subjects.

Scholarships.

Pass men should be arranged in alphabetical order. The present work of tabulation is enormous. The University ought to publish its own results, no other publication is required. There is long delay in appearing in the Gazette. (Mr Bell explained that the reason of the practice is to save the cost of printing.) Directly the list is settled it should be determined who are to get scholarships. There is a long and unnecessary delay from May to October involving hardship to poor students. There is no reason for it, the marks are the only criteria.

The calculation of percentages is carried to an absurd extent. It is wrong to judge only by percentages and the practice leads to great abuse. The number of passes depends on the sort of students sent up. By offering inducements, such as remission of fees, a college can make sure of good results. Another abuse is to send up for the college only those who do well in the test examination, the remainder going up as private students. This last abuse has been stopped by a change in the regulations, it has been very common. Percentages seem to be the only standard looked at. Mr Bell said that this was not the case in the last report. Dr Mackichan pointed out that the University Calendar gave similar prominence to percentages. Witness said that a short time ago the Principal of the Government College was called upon to explain a small percentage. It is a most demoralising system.

The nature of the questions set needs controlling. It is a very difficult matter. In the Punjab there is an absolute prohibition against teachers being appointed examiners. It is necessary to seek in remote parts for examiners and it is not possible to find suitable moderators. A moderator from another province will know far less than the examiner who will probably have examined for the University several times before. Questions should be set by Boards of Teachers, one or two of whom should also correct the papers.

To discourage the present practice of looking on the B. A. as a competitive examination for higher appointments in the public service, special examinations should be held for such appointments the B. A. being only one element of eligibility. This is already done in some cases, but in the majority of cases the appointments are given directly on the results of the B. A. Examination.

Witness said he did not wish to add to what he had put down in his memorandum (Part II pages 33, 34) regarding the University course. The Honours and Pass Courses should not be held together it would not be possible to go faster than the pace of the average Pass man. The institution of an Honours course must mean a doubling of the staff if the instruction is to be efficient. It is not a substitute for an Honours examination to put the best students into 1st and 2nd classes, the whole of the present system is a Pass one.

WITNESS NO. 4—THE REV. DR. J. C. R. EWING, M.A., D.D. (Washington and Jefferson College), Principal of the Forman Christian College, Lahore.

The Syndicate is fairly representative and is as large a body as would be workable under the circumstances. The Director of Public Instruction should be made an *ex-officio* member. As a matter of fact he is always a member, but it would be better that he should be *ex-officio*.

As regards the reconstitution of the Senate, without meaning any kind of reflection on the character or capability of its members it may be said that there is room for a decided change for the better. A properly reconstituted Senate might be, and probably would be, the best authority to deal with the question of affiliation. It should have educational experts to a considerable degree and also an adequate representation of the enlightened class of the community. As to the proportion, two-thirds might be nominated by the Government, one-fifth elected by the Senate, and the rest might consist of representatives of the Ruling Chiefs, etc. There is no objection to the election of a very limited number of graduates—electors, and elected to be of ten years' standing. There is a certain danger of canvassing but the system might give the University some useful men. The one-fifth elected by the Senate will be sufficient to satisfy the educated public and induce them to take an interest in the University. In reconstituting the Senate it will be necessary to devise some plan by which the present members will cease to hold office. It will perhaps be best to dissolve the present Senate. It will before dissolution elect representatives for the new Senate.

The number of members of the reconstituted Senate should not exceed 125 and not be less than about 100, their term of service should be limited to 5 years. A Fellow should not be deprived of his privilege and dignity of Fellowship for failure to attend. It is quite possible that some Fellows living in remote parts of the Province may be unable to attend, and yet be very helpful. After 5 years the Fellows may be re-elected.

The Syndicate is sufficiently representative, but may possibly be made more so with a little care. With 22 members every class of the community might be represented.

Witness said he would like to emphasize the importance of adequate affiliation rules.

The subjects that have been recently most discussed are the establishment of an Honours' course and the changing of the system into that of a teaching University. The time has not come to attempt anything in the way of a teaching University. The Law School and the Oriental University which are under the control of the University are doing excellent work in their own way, but these institutions, even conducted as they are, form a strong argument against the extension of the teaching principle. The Law School would be better managed if it were under the direct control of Government or of a private body. Its history during the last ten years is not such as will encourage the idea of a teaching University in any other branch of study. In connection with the idea of a teaching University witness again emphasised the importance of adequate affiliation rules, just so soon as such rules are introduced will the University become a teaching University in a definite sense.

At present the University has no control over the colleges and has nothing to do with the quality of the teaching in them. The sending up of college students as private students is an instance of this want of control. Under proper affiliation rules the University can control the colleges by means of inspection. The rules should be so framed as to work freely but gently.

Witness has much sympathy with private institutions. The great development of private effort is a healthful sign and private institutions may be expected to exhibit a sound development. Affiliation rules should be framed with some regard to such institutions. Honest private effort can be recognised and encouraged by the adoption of suitable affiliation rules. The better amongst the private institutions would not object to inspection some of the younger ones might object, and if so they should not be affiliated. Regulation regarding buildings, space and laboratories might tell hardly on some private institutions. Temporary affiliation subject to improvement might be allowed. Hostels should not be permitted without proper space for the inmates. Witness agreed with Syed Hossain Bilgrami that private effort that begins in squalor is not worth encouraging, but said that some of the private institutions have a large amount of money at their back. Witness also agreed with Dr. Bourne that the colleges attempt too much and might be affiliated by subjects.

A uniform minimum rate of fees should be charged. There is a probability that an institution will be started in the Punjab with an endowment of 10 lakhs in which no fees will be charged. While he has no definite solution to suggest, witness would like to ask for help in this matter. The affiliation of an institution charging no fees would be a mistake. In the inception of such an institution all existing colleges might be largely emptied of their students. That would not last long but irreparable harm might be done in the interval. Also for the sake of discipline the University should insist on a reasonable minimum fee. Witness would like complete uniformity. He feels it awkward, as an aided institution that he charges less than the Government College. He cannot charge the full Government rate for two reasons: (1) The lower rate enables him to receive boys who might not be able to go to the Government College (Mr. Justice Banerjee pointed out that this is a principle of general application), and (2) his college has not such a long purse as that of the Government College. The difference in the fees does not make much difference in the class of students attending the college.

Inter-Collegiate rules are desirable. The rules prevailing in Lahore are due to Mr. Robson. They were drawn up by a Conference of members of the four Arts Colleges and have been accepted by all of them. Before that there was anarchy. A student could walk over from one college to another at pleasure. The new regulations should be made a part of the affiliation rules.

Students reading for the B.A. should not be allowed to specialise for an Honours Course. Honours course. The majority of them are not ready for it. There would also be great difficulty in providing teaching for the course because there is no money. The University now suffers a loss of more than Rs. 10,000 or Rs. 11,000 a year owing to the expenses incurred by the Law School, the Oriental College and the Medical College examinations. There is no money for providing professorships and there is no likelihood of getting money from the Ruling Chiefs or any body else in the Province. Unless the Government is able to grant aid there is no possibility of employing teachers for the Honours course which would require the existing staff of professors to be doubled. That is out of the question. Besides there is this objection to an Honours' course that it depreciates the Pass degree. It would be almost certain to degrade the value of the ordinary degree. If one college tries to teach the Honours course all other colleges will follow suite, and they will not do it satisfactorily.

Three of the colleges in Lahore are in very close proximity to each other and it would be possible for them to enter into an arrangement with regard to certain classes. Notably the Oriental College has now taken charge of the teaching of the Government College candidates in oriental languages. The classes of Arabic and Sanskrit are always small and might be made available for other institutions. Such an arrangement would help to remove what is felt very keenly to be an unpleasant rivalry between local institutions. The distribution of fees would have to be arranged between the colleges as a matter of account. Witness tried to amalgamate with the Government College for the M.A. degree but the Director did not approve.

If the University ever does undertake teaching functions, and if it ever finds money for the purpose it might deal with the M.A. and the D.Sc. Degrees. It would be no reflection in a college to be told that the University is willing to relieve it of this duty.

Cramming is one of the saddest features of Indian Education. It can be remedied not by any new method of teaching but by changing entirely the character of the examinations. Witness' memorandum contains suggestions for improving the present system of examinations. Moderation is not altogether a popular suggestion as applied to the Punjab. The plan witness would propose is that within three weeks of the examination, after the close of lectures, a committee of teachers should set the papers or appoint one of their number to do so and meet together to moderate it. This would enable the University to have teachers for examiners. At present it is necessary to go to other Universities, a fact that accounts in great measure for the variable standard. The following is an instance of the way in which the scheme would work. The University might appoint three Professors of Philosophy in the Lahore Colleges to examine in that subject; one would set the paper and the other two would mark it. In the following year another of the three would set the paper and the remaining two would examine. This would remove any risk of unfairness and would secure careful work. It would cost more but would be worth the additional expense. Witness has had no reason to question the honesty of the examiners but has had great reason to question their judgment—they are whimsical. There must be marks, they are necessary for the control of examiners. If it is necessary to take precautions to prevent students from seeking an advantage from a teacher examiner, the names should be kept secret as in the case of the Allahabad University.

The "Under Consideration F.A." should be abrogated as soon as possible. In his second note (Part II, page 55), witness has made proposals regarding candidates who fail in one subject. They would apply only to good students. For instance if a B.A. candidate shows high proficiency in two subjects and fails in a third, he should be examined in that subject only in the following year. On the whole it will perhaps be better that he should lose the year, but he should not be burdened with having to do again the work he has already done well. He should be permitted to put all his energy into the subject in which he failed.

The giving of grace marks is a distinct lowering of the requirements of the University, it permits a student to pass when he has not fulfilled the conditions laid down by the University.

American experience is against University Examinations. Under the American system the University would impose upon the colleges the most thorough rules of affiliation which would necessitate the maintenance of a very high standard of education. This high standard can be further secured by direct and constant supervision. Once the desired standard is attained, the University might give to the Colleges the power of holding examinations of their own and of recommending deserving students for degrees, and it would be for the University to accept such recommendations and confer the degrees without further tests. There are some obvious objections which it is not necessary to dwell upon. The advantages are great. At present a fixed uniform value which is fictitiously inflated attaches to the University degree. That value should depend upon the College in which the holder of the degree is trained. The general tendency of the scheme is to make colleges extremely jealous for their reputation so that they will be slow to give degrees to students who would reflect discredit upon them. The colleges should also be allowed within limits, to settle the details of the course; then a degree in itself would mean nothing; its value would depend entirely on the College in which it was obtained. The President said that the existing colleges would give degrees too freely and that it therefore seemed desirable that the University should exercise an outside check. Witness said that the University might have a general checking power but that the

final decision should rest with the college. Public opinion would prevent unfit men being recommended for degrees because the degrees would be valueless apart from the reputation of the college. The President asked what, in these circumstances, would be the use of a degree. Witness said he was not sure that there need be degrees. The United States have them, but the main point regarded is the place where the graduate studied. Doctor Mackichan pointed out that degrees are accepted as a passport to government service. Witness said that any affiliated college might be trusted to produce men at any rate equal to the present standard. The colleges would hold examinations. Mr Justice Banerjee asked why, this being the case, the University should not hold them. Witness said because the University examinations are no test of culture, the present degree represents a certain power of getting up books but does not represent any type of education. Mr Justice Banerjee suggested a combined system. Witness said he would prefer to leave the whole responsibility to the College. Special arrangements would be needed for private candidates.

There should be more intimate personal relations in colleges between teachers and students. There is a need as College Staff teachers of more young men from the West filled with enthusiasm for their work and a love for this country to whom the students could go in confidence. The colleges do not want men who hold aloof from the students surround themselves with a barrier of reserve and professional dignity and who consider that they have finished their work when they have finished their labours in the class room.

Witness does not approve of Mr. Robson's suggestion for the levy of caution money. He has never had experience of students running away without paying their dues. The idea is objectionable as it puts the student in an attitude of defence.

Witness heartily agrees with Mr. Robson that there should be scholarships for special subjects and not for the aggregate marks. A man of inferior intellect who takes up mathematics sets more marks than a better man who chooses Sanskrit. About two years ago a student who was a Government of India scholar and stood first in English first in Philosophy and second in Sanskrit, was only seventh on the pass list.

WITNESS NO. 5.—DR. A. W. STRATTON, PH D, Registrar of the Punjab University and Principal of the Oriental College, Lahore.

Written statement No. 5 in Part II

Witness said that in view of some of the evidence that was given on the previous day he should like to state more emphatically his reasons for believing in the absolute necessity of instituting an Honours course, not only for the sake of the better men but also for the sake of the Pass men. It is not possible to train both men who are proficient in particular subjects and others who have little interest in them by means of the same courses and the same classes. The Honours system of the Calcutta University has wholly failed to meet the need because it does not overcome this objection. If the institution of the Honours degree leads to the depreciation of the pass degree in the sense that it will be less highly regarded that will be due simply to the fact that Honours men will get a more thorough training and the superior value of the course will be recognised. That will be a gain and no loss. It of course remains to be seen whether with the institution of an Honours degree, all the best men would take Honours courses. Some really good men would probably prefer to study more subjects, while others would prefer to study with greater thoroughness the subject they most care for. Witness has explained how the necessary provision may be made for the Honours teaching in the second part of his memorandum. It would certainly involve a large addition to the staff if every college undertook independently to provide the courses, but even if this were practicable and colleges all had money for the purpose, it would be most disastrous to allow them to undertake the work. Colleges feel at present both in the B.A. and M.A. that they are preparing men for competitive examinations and they tend to adopt the methods of a cramming school and not to aim at the culture a University should provide. All such competition is injurious. One method of securing instruction without competition would be by the appointment of University Professors, the equipment of University laboratories, the gathering together of University libraries, or if this course is altogether beyond the means of the University by choosing from time to time such men in the colleges at Lahore as are admitted to be best suited for Honours work. Some colleges might by mutual consent arrange that, say in English a man from one college should take the Elizabethan period and another the 19th century, or in Sanskrit, that one college should take the Vedas and another the Vedantas and so on. There are obstacles in the way of such an inter-collegiate system of lectures, but the system could be worked between the Government College the Forman College and the Dayanand Anglo Vedic College and also the Islamia College if it secures a permanent building in the same neighbourhood. The students would continue to belong to their own colleges and come to common lecture rooms and work in common laboratories for their Honours work. They should not be detached from their colleges because they do good in them and exercise a healthful influence on their intellectual life. For the Honours course a student should take one Honours and one Pass subject and if the Honours subject be any but English, his Pass subject should be English whilst if the Honours subject be English, the Pass subject might be such a subject as a Classical Language or History or Philosophy. For the Pass subject the student must still belong to his own college. The Honours course should be entirely different from the Pass course. It should contain nothing of the Pass course as a Pass course. The teaching would be different and the results of the teaching would be widely different.

The Calcutta University scheme fails in this respect.

Mr. Justice Banerjee—Wherein does its defect consist?

Witness—I understand that a bright student can take both the Pass Course and the Honours Course.

Mr. Pedler—He cannot take both courses. He cannot, for instance, take both pure and applied Mathematics in Calcutta. The Honours Course includes the Pass, but the questions in the Pass subjects are of a higher standard.

Witness—And the tuition in the Pass subjects?

Mr Pedler—Very often it happens like this that in the third year the Honours and Pass men work together and sometimes Honours men have additional lectures, but in the fourth year the Honours men work separately

Witness—My understanding was that the Honours man takes part of his work with the Pass man and the objection to that is this that having much higher proficiency than the Pass man, the association with the latter is apt to create disgust in him for his subject and for that reason I would insist on the absolute separation of the two for the sake of the Honours man in order that he may have greater enthusiasm for his work, and for the sake of the Pass man in order that the instructor may not be tempted to consider the interests of the Honours man only and allow the Pass man to go insufficiently trained. What is really required is an Honours College and a Pass College

The Honours course must be logically arranged; e.g., if a man takes Physics he should be obliged to show a knowledge of the necessary Mathematics

It will suffice at present to institute an Honours course for the degree of

Science in the B A course

B A. It is not really necessary to maintain distinctions of degrees in Arts and Science. In America the Arts degree represents a course of classical training, which it does not in India. The B A in India is a man who has studied English throughout his course. There is no objection to a man at home obtaining the degree of B A without a knowledge of Greek nor is there any objection to a man obtaining the B A in India without a knowledge of Sanskrit or Arabic. The best course is to give to all men whether they study Science or Oriental Literature the same degree of B A provided they exert the same amount of mental effort in the attainment of that degree.

If anywhere it is in Lahore that University teaching work is possible because with one exception all the strong Punjab colleges are in that city. These colleges would not be degraded in any way, because they would still be able to do the same work that they are doing now. There is work which must be done and which no one college is able to do and which must therefore be undertaken by the University.

It is not necessary to begin with any large scheme of Honours courses drawn up on paper, but as occasion arises from moderate beginnings the system may be extended so as to include more and more subjects

Witness cannot answer definitely what subjects are most popular at the

present moment in Indian Universities,

but his impression is that in the B A English, Mathematics, Physics and Chemistry are the most popular. Unfortunately the Punjab University which was founded to promote the intelligent study of Oriental languages has largely tended to discourage that study by its system of scholarships. The student who wishes to receive assistance in prosecuting his studies for the M A is virtually compelled to take two courses of Mathematics. It is a virtual compulsion which students recognise and men whose interests are in literary subjects are apt to say they cannot go on with their Sanskrit because they must take two courses of Mathematics.

The Oriental College has been rigorously attacked by some critics. It performs a service for education in the Punjab which no other institution in the province is fitted to perform. It trains as no other institution can train teachers of Oriental Classical Languages for the colleges and high schools. The B A, who has taken Sanskrit or Arabic has very little acquaintance with those languages and Arts students come largely under the influence of men who know nothing of the Classical Languages of the East, but are most ready to speak in their dispraise. Among many students of the Arts College there is a foolish and most erroneous impression that there is no use in studying Sanskrit and Arabic. That the work of the Oriental College is practically recognised will appear from the two following statement—

Of 31 teachers of Sanskrit, Arabic and Persian in the recognised colleges (excepting the small colleges in Amritsar)—

15 are holders of titles trained in the Oriental College.

4 are holders of titles trained elsewhere.

2 are M. A.'s and holders of titles.

1 is a B. A. who studied for some time in the Oriental College.

9 are men trained in the old way under Pandits and Maulvis

These last are old men who when they go cannot easily be replaced from the same class and the Oriental College or colleges like it must be called upon to supply men to take their place

In the 102 High Schools recognised by the Department out of 164 teachers of Sanskrit and Arabic—

71 are holders of titles trained in the Oriental College,

4 are former students of the Oriental College who do not possess titles,

28 are holders of titles trained elsewhere

47 were educated in Maktabas or Pathshalas of the old type

14 are reported as having studied in Arts Colleges or having received certificates from the Central Training College or Normal Schools

The titles courses are given on pages 112 to 119 of the Calendar. They are much more thorough than the B.A. and M.A. course. The course which extends over six years differs from the course in Benares in that it is not specialised. A student is required to study from the beginning grammar, prose literature, poetical literature, drama rhetoric and may elect to study another subject for the second and third examinations. It is objected sometimes that the teachers of Arabic, Persian and Sanskrit in the Arts Colleges fail because they have not a sufficient acquaintance with English. That is not the fault of the Oriental College. The fault lies in this that a good student of an Arts College finds the practice of law most attractive both because of the greater income to be derived from it and because of the higher social estimation attached to the practice of law. That difference in social estimation is in part due to the comparatively small salaries given to teachers both in schools and colleges. Furthermore the salaries paid to Oriental Teachers are particularly small and Orientalists have not the same chances of entering law and the professions that pay well as graduates of Arts Colleges. Therefore generally men who have taken the M.A. degrees in Sanskrit or Arabic do not wish to enter the Oriental College. If the salaries given in colleges were sufficient to attract such men they could be trained in the Oriental College so that they would be better men than those who are only *Shastris*. But it is essential that they should take as thorough a course as the men who only study Sanskrit or Arabic or Persian. If sufficient inducements were offered a fair number of M.A.'s in Sanskrit and Arabic would enter the *Shastri* and *Maulvi-Lal* classes and they would be the best men the College could secure.

In the University of Toronto where witness received his B.A. degree there

Special set on in Oriental Languages

are several Honour courses. The one witness followed was the Classical. There

was a distinction between the Honours and Pass Matriculation, but in the Honours Matriculation students were not excluded from taking general subjects. Beginning, however from the first year the man who gives himself specially to Honours studies takes far fewer subjects than the man who follows the general course. The results of that system are altogether admirable. Students of the University of Toronto who have gone to the leading American Universities have taken the very first rank and witness has heard Professors in two American Universities speak of their success and express their belief that it was due to the thorough grounding which they had obtained in their work. A man who has thoroughly studied one subject is in a good position to appreciate studies in another field because he understands the methods of study better than a man who has only a slight acquaintance with several subjects of different sorts. Holding these views witness is fully in accord with the suggestion of the Honourable Syed Hossein Bilgrami that it would be well to allow specialisation in a classical language and English throughout the course. But this is not the general opinion in the Punjab and witness would therefore be content for the present with an Honours Course for the B.A.

In answer to Mr Justice Banerjee witness said that to acquire a working

Study of Sanskrit

knowledge of Sanskrit the easier course would be to follow the Western method,

but for students in the Titles' branch he would recommend the study of Panini.

Advanced books are the subjects of study in the Titles' branch, but it is not wise to allow a man with so little acquaintance of Sanskrit as a B.A. to take up the study of Indian Grammatical Science. The first object should be to give men the power of reading with ease the better known books of Sanskrit Literature and of expressing their ideas with some accuracy in Sanskrit.

Witness then referred to the courses of study in Sanskrit for the F.A. and B.A. on pages 147 and 168, respectively, of the Calendar.

In connection with this Mr Justice Banerjee asked whether witness did not think the Rigveda was introduced too early and for purposes of comparison asked whether there was any Chaucer in the English B.A. course. Witness said that there is no Chaucer in the B.A. Course but that the comparison does not hold good. Sanskrit is not such a foreign language to the Indian student as is English. In an English or American University Chaucer would form a natural part of the English B.A. course. Similarly the Vedas should form a part of the Sanskrit B.A. course in an Indian University.

In reply to the Honourable Syed Hossein Bilgrami, witness said that six hours a week are, as a rule, devoted to lectures in Arabic in Arts Colleges, and that the time allotted is not sufficient to make a man a competent Arabic scholar in four years.

Mr Robson commented on the want of English on the part of the staff of the Oriental College. As far as possible witness secures for the teaching of the college classes men who have some knowledge of English, an adequate knowledge if possible. For instance, the Sanskrit reader is an M.A. and is quite competent to instruct any class through the medium of English and two of the other teachers have a fair acquaintance with English. They would not be able to help a man in polishing a translation into English but they understand the grammatical system and can converse in English. The point, however, is this that if one meets students walling along the roads one finds that they are not talking in English but in Punjabi. English has not become the language of the student body here to any such extent as it has in Bengal. A student understands much more readily instruction given through the medium of his vernacular.

Witness here diverged to the subject of the efficiency of the teaching on the degree side of the Oriental College. Students are seriously hampered by the difficulty of securing adequate books on the subjects of the course in the vernacular. At the same time they have an advantage over the B.A. candidates, first in the better understanding of their subjects the lectures being delivered in their own vernacular and, secondly in the adequacy with which in examinations they can express their ideas. The percentage of passes among the B.O.L. students and the percentage of marks secured by the best B.O.L. students are distinctly higher than in the case of B.A. students.

General subjects need not be studied for the Titles' Branch, but the B.O.L. course is the same as the B.A. course and there is no objection to a man taking English for the B.O.L. He would then be examined in English through the medium of English and in the other subjects through the medium of the vernacular. There has not been a demand for English in the Oriental College and if there were witness would not undertake to provide for it directly. He should ask that some provision might be made in one of the Arts Colleges and the student would then take his English in that college and the rest of his subjects in the Oriental College.

The B.O.L. degree is very unpopular, because in Government Offices B.O.L.'s are not wanted, they do not get such good pay as the B.A.'s. At the same time witness has heard it said that students are bribed to come to the Oriental College. Government service is a bribe to men to take the B.A. degree rather than the B.O.L., and that inducement is many times stronger than the inducement held out to men by the Oriental College of getting a paltry stipend of Rs 4 conditional on their doing good work. The fee in the Oriental College is a rupee a month.

No students take up English for the B.O.L. A man taking up the B.O.L. examination and selecting English as one of his subjects would thereby have a fair acquaintance with English and a much better acquaintance with other subjects than a B.A., but he would not have as thorough an acquaintance with English, because he would probably have read only the English books prescribed for his examination and that would be unfortunate. A man gains a very thorough acquaintance with History and Philosophy through the medium of the B.O.L. examination.

Law students who have been unsuccessful in their papers sometimes send them to witness asking him personally to go over them and see that the examiners have not made a mistake. He has gone over some such papers and found that the reason of failure was that the students were not proficient in English and could not express all that they had in their minds. In the Medical College students of the Hospital Assistant class have a much fuller appreciation of the little they are taught than students of the L.M.S. and M.B. classes have of their more extensive subjects. Hospital Assistants are taught through the medium of Hindustani; L.M. and S. and M.B.'s through the medium of English. On the other hand, a man who takes his B.O.L. without English has not the same advantages as a man who knows English, because there are not books in the vernacular which will help him in his after college reading. On the degree side witness does not compel the students to take up English, he prefers to leave the matter to them. On the titles side every scholar must study English two hours a day. The results are not commensurate with the effort put forward, but one must always remember that the first object of these students is to study Sanskrit, Arabic or Persian, and it is the only encouragement that the Principal gives them and the greater prospect of doing well when they have an acquaintance with English that leads them to study it at all. At present there are classes reading up to the standard of the Entrance in English, but there is no chance of testing the students in their work. While the University rules permit these men to go up for the Middle School Examination in English and obtain a certificate of having passed in that subject, they are not allowed to enter for the Entrance Examination in English. Witness wishes they might be permitted to do so and thinks that there should be no obstacle to their taking English in any examination.

The Oriental College by giving its student's courses of greater thoroughness in the oriental classical languages than they can get elsewhere and by giving them also an acquaintance with English—slight it must be admitted—is doing a great deal for the direct as well as for the indirect encouragement of such studies in colleges and schools.

Dr. Bourne.—We are informed that whenever the office of head pandit or head moulvi falls vacant in the Oriental College the authorities have to go outside to get suitable teachers.

Witness—That is not the case. The head of the Sanskrit Department comes from Jeypore. He is known throughout Europe and America as a Sanskrit scholar. The University was wise in getting a man of such distinction when it had a chance. The head of the Arabic Department is a graduate of the Oriental College who was formerly in the Calcutta Madrasa. The head of the Persian Department is one of the earliest and most distinguished graduates of the College and has been in the service of the University from the time of graduation.

The University has not yet produced much vernacular literature. Most of the books issued are small and consist mainly of translations and compilations. Syed Hossain Bilgrami remarked that some original works of a high class had been produced and instanced the "Reconstruction of the times of Akbar" prepared 12 or 15 years ago. Witness said that one of the Munshi Fazil Scholars, who is now a District Judge, has been most prolific in Arabic and Persian works. One of the present readers has been hailed as successor of the old Urdu poets.

The examinations for hakims and vaid were never held or were held very irregularly. No one entered for them because of the condition, introduced at

Knowledge of English

Staff of the Oriental College

Encouragement of vernacular literature

Study of indigenous Medicine

the instance of the Medical Faculty, that a course of Western medicine must first be pursued.

Witness has been asked to make some reference to the Middle School Examinations. The original letters cannot be traced in the office. The Lieutenant-

Governor of the Punjab in a letter to the University towards the close of 1893 indicated that the best way to carry out in the Punjab the recommendations in section 282 of the Education Commission's Report so far as the Middle School Examination was concerned was to transfer it to the University, and it was proposed to pay a certain sum to the University for two or three years and that the University should be allowed the services of Departmental Inspectors for the purposes of conducting the examination. The letters that passed between the Government and the University at the time cannot be traced, but it appears that the first reference was from the Government.

Another point on which witness has been asked to speak is with reference to the allegation that the Punjab University acts unfairly towards the Allahabad University in allowing boys from the United Provinces who are barred from the Entrance Examination of the Allahabad University, because they are under 16, to take their Entrance Examination under the auspices of the Punjab University. The statistics do not bear this out.

Number of candidates appearing at the Punjab Entrance Examination from places outside the Province	1901		1902	
	Sixteen or over	Under sixteen.	Sixteen or over	Under sixteen.
North-Western Provinces ..	216	38	420	54
Rajputana	11	3	32	3
Central Provinces .	2	2	15	1
Central India	7	1	21	1
Total of candidates appearing at the examination	2,398	42	2,630	358

The age limit not being in question, witness does not know what is the reason for all these boys flocking from outside places to the Punjab instead of to the Allahabad examination. It may be due to the same conditions as have prompted applications from Hyderabad and Jubbulpore for the opening of centres for the Entrance Examinations at those places. The Syndicate refused to give a centre to Hyderabad because it felt that it was geographically too remote. Witness refused to bring the application for the constitution of a centre at Jubbulpore before the Syndicate because the application was not forwarded by the local Director of Public Instruction. Witness is not aware that the Punjab University Examination is lower in standard than the examinations of other provinces but even if it is the Punjab University has a perfect right to fix its own standards with reference to the condition of education in the province. A uniform stereotyped scheme for the Entrance for all India would lead to the most disastrous results. The Punjab University has outside centres for the Oriental Titles Examinations, but no outside centres for other examinations.

One of the objections taken to the Oriental College is the absence or small rate of fees and the number of stipends given to students. But the Oriental College on the Titles side is purely and simply a Training College for Oriental teachers and it ought therefore to be compared not with ordinary Arts Colleges but with Training Colleges and Normal Schools. Of the 72 students in the Oriental College reading for titles, 24 receive stipends and of the 34 reading in the school department, 12 receive stipends. In the Central Training College

out of 76 students 63 receive stipends, amounting in the aggregate to Rs. 8,000 per annum, whereas the total of the stipends in the Oriental College is less than Rs. 1,000 per annum. In the Oriental College besides the 24 who receive stipends in the Title class, three receive stipends in the B O. L. and M. O. L. classes. Mr. Pedler pointed out that a reason for giving stipends in the Training College, which does not apply to the Oriental College, is that many of the students are taken away from actual teaching by which they are earning a livelihood.

Dr. Bourne.—I see from your calendar that in 1900, 50 per cent. of the candidates passed the Entrance, 45 the Standard of the Entrance Examination. Intermediate and 30 the B. A. Is it always the case that the higher the examination the greater the percentage of failures?

Witness.—I think that is generally the case.

Dr. Bourne.—It has been suggested that the reason for this is that the Entrance course is not high enough nor sufficiently extensive and particularly that in English it is too weak and, therefore, the higher the students go the more failures there are, most of them occurring in English.

Witness.—I cannot say whether the figures justify that conclusion. I cannot suggest any reason except that I believe it is largely owing to our prescribing no text-book in English.

WITNESS NO 6—The REV J W T WRIGHT, M. A., Principal of the St Stephen's Mission College, Delhi:

Witness prefaced his remarks by apologising for the shortness of his statement (Paper No. 6 in Part II) He said that there are two reasons why he did not furnish a longer statement (1) people are apt to forget that the object of a University is to make people better as well as more learned (2) there are only certain definite matters with which the University can deal, as for instance (a) the position of the University as an examining and teaching body (b) constitution, (c) affiliation rules The Bishop of Lahore has put these matters in a very practical manner in the memorandum which he has presented to the Commission (Paper No. 2 in Part III)

The Senate of the Punjab University is a standing disgrace, no milder expression would be adequate It does not understand anything that has to do with learning except of a very limited type, and it obstructs all progress Any of the English Universities would repudiate with disdain such doings as the Punjab Senate are guilty of There may be reasons for this, which witness does not understand but a body which obstructs everything which has anything to do with learning can have no claim to be called progressive and can be of no advantage to the University The number of members of the Senate should be reduced, the real nature of the body should be strengthened and as it on the Senate should not be regarded as a reward which, failing any other reward, the Government may bestow

Witness is given to understand the Syndicate is very much of the same nature and if his statement concerning it is wide of the mark people in Lahore are largely responsible for its being so It has no knowledge except of the foggiest sort of the requirements of University education There seems to be an element of helplessness about the situation which is most distressing and numbs all hope of better things, but witness trusts that the long needed visit of the Commission to the Punjab will lead to material changes He does not himself pretend to be able to say what can be done to improve matters, but if the Commission will help some remedy will be devised

There is a complete absence of affiliation rules An enquiry into the events of the past two years at Lahore would show the need for reform A few years ago the University gave recognition to the Hindu College in Delhi If a competent authority were to inquire into the way that was done and into the attitude the University took towards it the circumstances would cover the University with confusion If witness is wrong there must be hidden reasons for the action of the University which are too deep for him to fathom If any new college were started in Delhi on a sound foundation he would welcome it with delight It would be an encouragement in many ways

If the Commission were to take the trouble to investigate the origin and constitution of the Hindu College it would be found that it could not lay claim to any such consideration The University recognised it in allowing it to hold Government and University scholarships The Punjab University has no affiliation rules but it recognised the Hindu College as far as it was in its power to recognise it He admitted that power is small but he happened accidentally to see a letter from the late Director of Public Instruction containing a recognition of the institution and an encouragement to the founder and when that came—officially or not—from the head authority of education in the province, recognition could not go much farther

Mr Justice Banerjee—What is there specially objectionable in the recognition of that institution?

Witness—It is not fit to be recognised. It has no buildings, no play-ground, no staff, no qualified body of Governors, no any thing. It has students who do not seem to profit much by the education they receive and who pay very considerably less than the market value for their education.

Witness did not represent to the then Director his objections to the college being started, because it seemed to him to be useless, but everybody who knew him knew what his feelings in the matter were.

The Government and the provincial authorities have for sometime past expressed great earnestness in the matter of the physical development of students.

Play ground—Government aid. Witness very heartily coincided with that. Although there are two colleges and a considerable number of schools in Delhi there is only one play ground. For that play-ground witness has toiled almost singlehanded for the last six or seven years and spent upon it some Rs. 5000 or Rs. 6000 which he got together with considerable difficulty. In the hope that the Government, as represented by the Director would do something to encourage him in this matter as Government professes an attitude of sympathy and helpfulness towards private enterprise of this sort he wrote for a grant in aid and received in reply a stiff formal note of a vague nature amounting to just nothing at all which he threw into the waste paper basket and he never applied again. He took it that when he asked a man for something and instead of replying frankly that man wrote in studied phrases which conveyed no meaning at all, that he meant to evade what he had not the courage openly to refuse and witness would not ask that man again. The President suggested that this action was somewhat hasty, the Government has many claims on its funds and must deal with them in order of urgency. Witness replied that so doubt he laboured under the disadvantage of not having been disciplined in official methods of correspondence but if the letter had contained a single kindly or sympathetic word, if it had even suggested latent willingness on the part of Government to help him. He should probably have brought the matter up again. But he could discern no such spark of hope in the cold and studied phrases. However he merely mentioned this as an example of the meagring to be attached to the Government's profession of a desire to encourage private educational effort. So little encouragement indeed had he ever received that if he were not a very robust man he should long ago have been overwhelmed with disappointment and should sadly have concluded that his labours might be better employed elsewhere. Witness said that he laid stress on the point because it is one of the few matters in which outside help is of use. His remarks, he explained had reference to the past regime.

The fact that the St. Stephen's College is a Mission College simplifies its position with regard to moral education. Moral religious education. They have a perfectly free hand to teach as they do most vigorously teach their own faith. It is a regularly understood thing that the first three quarters of an hour every morning is devoted to religious instruction in every class. The class books in the first year's class are the Books of Genesis and Exodus and Kingsly's "Good News of God."

Asked as to whether there was any objection to this on the part of students or their parents or guardians witness said he sincerely wished that parents would make any sort of appearance on the scene. What the feelings of the parents were on this or any other matter he had never had the means of knowing. He had never yet succeeded in even unearthing the parents, much less in bringing them into touch with work at the college. He might teach his students anything he liked without its rousing any deep feelings in the minds of parents.

In the second year class witness tries to teach the students to understand the relationship between the Old and New Testaments. An Indian member of the staff, who is a Christian, lectures on alternate days on St. Luke's Gospel. Witness has taught St. John's Gospel to the third and fourth year classes for the last eighteen years and he believes that some of them enjoy it as much as he.

himself does. On alternate days one of the English members of the staff gives instruction on the Incarnation. In the M. A. classes they teach on alternate days the Acts of the Apostles and Butler's Analogy. Out of these regular hours witness never talks religion to any student. A student knows that if he wishes to speak to him on the subject, witness is entirely at his disposal.

The outcome of all this has been that there has never been a baptism in the college and it would be very interesting to know what would happen if there were. No pressure is exercised on the students to make them Christians, the only kind of compulsion is that they must attend the religious courses if they are to attend the college at all. Witness can hardly think that many of them would wish not to attend from what he has himself seen.

The person most responsible for the discipline of the students is the Principal himself. Every student who comes to the college knows that he comes to be taught on their terms and not on his own.

There are at present only 15 students in the boarding house. The senior among them is more or less responsible for discipline. The fact that it is a college and not a school is borne in mind and as few rules as possible are enforced. Professor Rudra, a Bengali gentleman who is a Christian and also Vice Principal of the college resides in the boarding house and is of the utmost assistance. There are 60 students in the college, the balance live with their parents or guardians or some responsible person but witness does not know where they live. Most of the board is in the boarding house and is of the utmost assistance. There are also a few Mohammedans. There is one Christian boarder. The boarders are entirely responsible for their own food.

Witness believes that the ordinary fee for aided colleges is charged at St. Stephen's. He is of opinion that fees should be the same everywhere. Anything which suggests competition between Mission and Government colleges is very pernicious. Witness does his best to ignore the difference. He would be delighted if the fee in St. Stephen's College could be raised.

In reply to Mr. Justice Banerjee witness stated that he did not say the Hindu College had no committee. He believed it had a committee. He did not say it had no house. He said it had no adequate building.

Mr. Justice Banerjee—There is an account given of it on page 531 of the University Calendar. Is that in your opinion correct?

Witness—I have not studied it. The college may have many latent merits. I have no desire to minimise them in any way. I have not tried to examine the details.

Continuing witness said that the play-ground to which he had already alluded is the joy of his life. It surprised him sometimes to see throughout the hot weather how the students respond both intellectually and physically when they are given the sort of thing they ought to have. It was a splendid thing to see 50 students sit down and 30 or 40 vigorously playing hockey and football all through the hot weather. Witness has not discovered any student who is not prepared to charge him at football though he is the heaviest weight on the field.

When witness considers that three to four Professors play these games with the students week in, week out, and that the students treat them with quite as much respect as they do in the class room, his belief in the capacities of this country for development is distinctly encouraged. One feels that there is a real relationship growing up between students and their Professors, and if witness were to tell the Commission some of the things said to him by students in the last month, it would tend to encourage them as it had encouraged him.

One of the great problems in this country at present is to get nations so opposite as the west and the east to work together and witness has no hesitation in saying that the relations between him and the Indian section of his staff are most happy, the greater number of them are his personal friends

Witness does not think it would be possible to carry on the college unconnected with the University. He has perhaps said hard things about the University, but the real University to him is not the Senate and Syndicate which are composed of outside people, but the teachers. He has the deepest reverence for them and the one thing he has been aiming at during the last two or three years is to bring the college nearer to Lahore. If a resident University were possible in Lahore it would be worth any sacrifice on the part of other colleges.

The President—Is it part of your college practice to meet your staff in council or a common room to discuss matters?

Witness—Very seldom. I am in constant contact with them one way or another. My Vice Principal, Professor Rudra, is in my room for twenty minutes every day and I very seldom do anything without consulting him. I do not know whether it would interest the Commission and whether it is altogether relevant to the question, but I may mention that the Christian members of my staff meet together in my room once a week for religious purposes. I regard this as one of the most important things we do. It makes us realise what we are doing and how much there is to draw us together.

There is no need to meet to discuss the distribution of work. It is all fixed at the beginning of the term by the witness. Every Professor is left free to follow his own methods of teaching.

The term "lectures" is misleading as regards the F. A. classes. All that is attempted is to explain to students the books they read. They are discouraged from reading annotated editions. There are English essays and repetitions. Witness's own method in class is to read the book through out loud and to comment upon it as opportunities arise. Essays are set once a month as the ordinary rule. They are returned corrected. Students are not conversant with English when they first come to the college nor are they when they go away. The whole standard is very low. The students are not ready for an Honours course. It would be most undesirable to separate the better students from the others. They help to form a standard and afford some incentive to teach.

The quality of the students is inferior because of the low intellectual level of their surroundings. The teachers also are disappointed, overworked and depressed and have little time for study and little opportunity for intellectual intercourse. Witness is trying to get two young Cambridge graduates to be at his disposal to aid in the work of the St. Stephen's College.

Another need is greater sympathy between missionary and Government educationalists. If a missionary means to educate at all he ought to be perfectly honest with the Government and give his whole services to the cause. If he does that there is some chance of his really understanding his Government brother and *vice versa*.

If the Convocation as held in Lahore is any sort of outward and visible sign of such inward and spiritual grace as exists in the University, one must come to the conclusion that it is very small. At the Convocation the teaching staff retire almost entirely into the background and as for students one would not know they were present. Only recently the late Lieutenant-Governor suggested that they might be induced to make a little noise. When the assembly is collected the Government walks in, in the persons of its representatives, and takes possession of the whole proceedings and throttles them. One devoutly hopes that the time may come in this and other Universities when the teaching body

WITNESS No 7 — DR GEO SERRELL, M A, LL D, Barrister at-Law, Principal of the Law College, Lahore.

(Written Statement No 7 in Part II)

It would be better if a student completed his Arts course before he began reading Law. The Law course is quite enough to keep a man's mind occupied after he has got rid of work incidental to his Arts preparation. The college will also be able to make better arrangements for the studies. At present the two courses are taken simultaneously and attendance at the Law College has to be made subsidiary to attendance at Arts classes. By finishing the Arts course witness means finishing up to the BA degree. The Law course is a three years' course. It has been proposed and remains to be confirmed by the Chief Court that students should commence their Law course after they have graduated as B As, and that the course should be reduced to two years. Having regard to the fact that a student would thus be able to devote his undivided attention to the study of Law, a two years' course would probably be sufficient. The position of the University with regard to Law is a little different from what it is with regard to any other subject in this respect that the examinations of the University are not merely academical examinations, they are an admission to practice and that admission to practice is what the students mainly come for. If the University altered its standard of requirements and this did not carry with it the approval of the Chief Court, and if the University examinations were no longer a passport to practice, then there would be a considerable decline in the number of those who offer themselves for examination. This makes it desirable that the Judges and leaders of the legal profession should have some part in the management of the Law College. Two of the Judges are at present on the Committee of the College. Students can combine study in the Law College with work in an office. Some of them do so. Witness once put down a certain time between 11 and 12 during the cold season for lectures. Then he found that the arrangement would exclude some students in business whom he would have been sorry to lose and he therefore considered it desirable to alter the hours. At present the lecture hours are entirely in the early morning and in the evening.

There is a very strong wish among the students for a boarding-house attached to the Law College, and there is a proposal on the subject at the present moment before the authorities. Witness was asked to formulate a scheme, saying how he thought it could be managed whether it would be self-supporting, and if not, what the expenditure would be. Witness has prepared such a scheme and sent it in for consideration, but he has not yet heard if anything has been decided in the matter.

It did not appear to witness that attendance at lectures should be compulsory. It is against the traditions to which he himself has been accustomed at the University College, London, where a student may attend such classes as he thinks fit. There is no connection between a certain number of attendances at class and graduation, and witness himself does not think such compulsory attendance desirable. If there is no compulsion, some students will still attend, but the number will not be by any means as great as at present. At present students do not care to attend when their names have been sent up as candidates and they have been present at the requisite number of lectures. Witness came to the college in the latter part of October and when he proposed to continue the lectures during November, some of the students were anxious to know whether attendance would be compulsory. Witness said it would not, and he found that the classes were not attended. If students do not think it worth their while to attend the classes, witness would be rather disposed to let them go without attending and regret it as their loss, or if it appears that they can study equally well without attending classes, they will have justified their position. It is not satisfactory for a lecturer to feel that persons are there to listen to his lectures, simply because they must. If students have found by experience that they get as much benefit by reading as they can get by oral instruction, it is not right that

they should be compelled to receive oral instruction. Nor is it satisfactory to the lecturer that he should be compelled to be giving them something they do not feel the benefit of. Witness is not at all sure that class examinations by the lecturer once a week on the lectures of the previous week would tend to make the students work.

There is no individual teaching in the Law College. Students have a difficulty in taking notes of lectures. At first

Method of teaching in the Law College.

witness thought that the fact that they did not take notes was due to the unusually powerful memories which he understood natives of India very often possess. But that is not the reason; students do not themselves consider it the reason. As far as witness can judge, it is because of the difficulty of making a summary of what they hear in a foreign language. The result is that witness finds it necessary (and he has been told by other lecturers that they also find it necessary) to dictate lectures to a very much greater degree than would be necessary in England. One has to a certain extent to prepare and dictate to students summaries which one would perhaps rather expect or desire the students to be able to prepare for themselves. In class witness often asks the students questions, more particularly in the way of testing their recollection of what they had studied on previous occasions. Whether to ask students to give concrete instances of legal principles in the different sections of the codes is a matter each lecturer would determine for himself. Witness has often given such instances, but he has not often called upon his students to do so.

In the examinations too much knowledge is required in the way of legal

Law Examinations

facts. The recommended books on which the examination papers are set appear to be in many cases not such as are suitable for students. They are too much in the way of practitioners' books—books in which, for instance, certain acts of the legislature are collected together and set out as far as possible with all the cases decided on them. For the practitioner this is very important as a ready reference, but it is not the sort of book that is suitable for students.

Students sometimes complain to witness of grievances connected with the examination. A grievance that is much felt is the restriction that a candidate may not present himself for examination for the degree of Licentiate in Law more than three times. Witness does not know the reason for the rule, it seems to him not to be a sound one. To pass the licentiate examination the student must get 60 per cent. aggregate marks. This is excessive. For the LL.B., the percentage is less. The Licentiate Course is not a simple one. Entry to the legal profession is more difficult than in England. (Dr. Bourne pointed out that the percentage of passes is high.)

Witness does not see any reason why in the nature of things there should

Local Law Classes

not be law classes in Delhi, or for the matter of that anywhere in the Province, if adequate instruction can be given. He does not know how far the instruction would be adequate.

WITNESS No 8—COLONEL S H BROWN, CIE, I.M.S., M.D., M.R.C.P.,
London (Honorary Surgeon to the Viceroy), Principal and Professor of
Medicine, Medical College, Lahore

(Written statement No. 8 in Part II)

Only a few students in the college who happened to be educated in England know Latin, none of them know it who have been educated in this country. Latin is a very desirable thing for medical students to know. It greatly facilitates the study of medicine. Students who go to England are not required to pass any preliminary examination before entering on their medical studies, the extent to which they have been educated in this country is recognised by most of the examining bodies in England. They are not called upon to pass in Latin. Although it is a very desirable thing for a student to have a knowledge of Latin, witness does not insist upon it as absolutely necessary. Students who pass the junior examination for the L. M. and S. diploma at Lahore are admitted to the further examinations in England without any test in Latin.

Dr Mackichan—We were told in Bombay that Medical College students going to England are informed that they must pass in Latin.

Witness—As far as I know, our students are not required to do so. The majority of our students go to Edinburgh and take the diploma of the College of Physicians and Surgeons. I have only known of one instance in which Latin was required and that was at Glasgow.

It would not on the whole be desirable that the preliminary scientific training of a student should be pursued outside the Medical College. Most of the students are being trained for employment under the Government, and it is important that they should be kept under supervision of a definite kind throughout their course. If they were to go for one part of their course to one college and for another to another, they would hardly be susceptible to proper control.

It would no doubt be possible to have the scientific ground work completed before the students joined the Medical College, but it is very difficult to separate the purely medical from the scientific. For instance, Chemistry touches Medicine and Physiology, and Botany touches Materia Medica. Witness is inclined to take the view that students ought to be in the Medical College during the whole of their course. It might conduce to economy to have only one chemical laboratory and one physical laboratory for all students, but on the other hand in a place like Lahore, if all the Chemical students were concentrated in one place, it would be necessary to spend a great deal on original outlay and the classes would be so large that it would be necessary to employ a number of demonstrators and assistants.

Medical students who are studying Physics and Chemistry, do out-patient work at the same time.

There is a very strong complaint in the college that the staff is overworked. If Sciences were taught elsewhere it would not however remedy this state of things. It would relieve the college of an excess of students, but it would not relieve the Professors who are at present overworked. For instance, the Professor of Surgery teaches two subjects in the senior class. If the Professor of Chemistry were set free he could not possibly take up either of these subjects.

Dr Mackichan—If these scientific subjects were taught outside then in place of their Professors, the Government might perhaps provide a Professor of some other subject.

Witness—That might possibly be done.

Witness is in favour of students coming to the college after taking the Science degree, it is a main reason for encouraging that degree.

Many of the Medical College students would be the better for being accommodated in a boarding-house. Some of them do night work, they have rooms in the college where they sleep. Witness is in favour of establishing a boarding-house in connection with the Medical College, provided suitable arrangements are made for its supervision. There must be a responsible Superintendent, who would be respected by the students. An officer of the grade of Military Assistant Surgeon (retired) would be wanted. The work would occupy the whole of his time. There is a sum set apart for the purpose in this year's budget—1 lakh of rupees—witness doubts whether it will be sufficient. No estimate had been made, the thing was done without any reference to witness. The site would be a very expensive matter.

Witness is not in favour of teachers being examiners. He prefers outside examiners although there are great objections to the system. College examiners are at present associated with outside examiners. The oral examinations are conducted by teachers in the college. A main defect of this system is that there is no opportunity for examiners to discuss a doubtful case. One examiner may decide on a case in Bombay and another in Madras. An instance occurred in which a student failed by two marks if the examiners had had an opportunity of meeting and discussing the matter, the student would probably have been passed.

The oral examinations are made as thorough and practical as possible. One central examination for the whole of India would increase the value of the degree, but that system would open to the objection that examiners could not be present at the centres. It might be possible to send the students to the centres.

Very few students go up for the M.B., because they have to be graduates in Arts. This restriction might be removed and the I.M. and S. abandoned. The medical instruction for the I.M. and S. and the M.B. is identical except for one subject—Comparative Anatomy. The B.S. (Bachelor of Surgery) degree should be given after a special examination in Surgery.

Witness has not taught students in Bengal but he has examined students there. There is not very much difference between Medical students in different parts of India. The students in the Punjab as a whole, are more practical than those in Bengal.

Mr Justice Banerjee—To revert to the separation of the scientific subjects would not that separation have the effect of prolonging the Medical course?

Witness—I should not think so. It could be arranged that the time spent in the preliminary scientific subjects should count as part of the curriculum of five years. I should oppose any lengthening of the period of study. The College of Physicians and Surgeons in London is discussing whether to accept certificates of scientific instruction from certain outside educational institutions in lieu of one year of its curriculum.

Preliminary Scientific Training—(contd.)

WITNESS No. 9—**LIEUTENANT-COLONEL D. ST. J. D. GRANT, I.M.S., M.B., B.CH.**, Professor of Chemistry and Toxicology, Medical College, Lahore, and Chemical Examiner to Government, Punjab.

(Written statement No. 9 in Part II.)

Witness said he was thinking of all the Arts Examinations under the M.A.

Teaching of practical Physics and Chemistry

when he said in his memorandum that the practical side of science was neglected. In all the Arts Examinations except the M.A. the practical work is most unsatisfactory.

Witness has had many years experience as an examiner especially in the B.A. and has found that the book-work of the men is good, but their practical work extremely bad. The only real value to be got from scientific training is from the practical side; the mere working up of text-books is of very little educational value. As an example of the unscientific mind of the science students, witness mentioned the following incident within his own experience. He was examining in the B.A. and he handed a piece of apparatus used in experimental chemistry—a glass vessel—to a student. From the way in which he seized it, witness saw that he had no idea of its use, and meaning to be mildly sarcastic he said to him: "Take care you don't break it. There may be a *pin* inside it." The student rushed off in terror and reported witness to the Board of Studies for having asked him to handle a vessel which contained a *pin*. Witness submitted that a man who goes up for the B.A. and whose superficial ignorance is so profound as to allow him to imagine that a chemical vessel contains a *pin* has not been trained to the standard which the University desires.

There is no proper apparatus or proper place for carrying out practical examinations. The practical examination is a farce. There are crowds of students to each of whom only ten minutes can be allotted. This is specially the case in the Entrance and F.A. and to a lesser extent in the B.A. examination. The reason of the defective teaching of science is that to teach science practically would require the spending of money on proper apparatus and a proper building. The University should insist upon certificates of actual practical work from students and before that can be done proper buildings and apparatus must be supplied.

The practical examinations of the Punjab University are supposed to be conducted at all the centres and the questions are generally good, but without time, place and apparatus the examinations cannot be carried out and therefore they become a dead-letter.

In reply to Mr. Justice Banerjee witness said that the students are supposed to be able to answer questions mathematically. They must make their practical observations and then work them out by mathematical formulæ.

Dr. Bourne.—But they don't know how the formulæ are obtained?

Witness.—That lies between teacher and student. They should be taught the meaning of the formulæ.

Elementary scientific subjects should be taken up by students who intend to become medical students, so that when they enter the Medical College they may be in a position to go on with their instruction. At present in Physics students do not get the fundamental grounding they ought to receive. When they first enter the Medical College, they are so ignorant of elementary scientific subjects that they are unfit to commence their curriculum and a great deal of time is wasted in giving them the necessary elementary instruction. They learn little science that is of any use in the F.A. course, even the Mathematics are too elementary to be practically useful. The teaching of Science in the Punjab University looks very well on paper, but in practice the students are far from what they ought to be. There should be a University College sufficiently equipped

Preliminary scientific training of medical students

with all apparatus for examining and perhaps for lecturing in Physics and Chemistry and other scientific subjects. Witness would not approve of separating these subjects from the medical instruction, strictly so-called, if the students came ripe to begin medical studies, but they do not. They come to the Medical College at the stage of undeveloped school boys, and it is with the greatest difficulty that they are brought to a proper preliminary stage to apprehend what is taught them in Medicine. They would undoubtedly be more mature than they now are, if they went through the preliminary science course before coming to the college.

The knowledge of English of the students is remarkable from a linguistic point of view, but is insufficient to enable them to follow closely reasoned lectures.

English.

Latin.

Latin is desirable for medical students, but witness could not say that it is essential.

It is to some extent a personal question whether it is a good arrangement to combine the duties of Professor of Chemistry and Chemical Examiner. Witness finds that the combined duties are too much for him. He has the whole analytical work of the Province to attend to. He has two assistants. There is more medico-legal work in the Punjab than anywhere else, except Bengal, and it runs Bengal very close. There are on an average three human cases a day and nearly as many cattle cases and in addition to that articles have recently been sent by the Government for examination as explosives. It is impossible to cope with the work. There is no inconvenience in carrying on the medico-legal work in the same place as is used for teaching students. The teaching of students does not interfere with the analytical work.

The laboratories in colleges are very far from being satisfactory. For instance, the best laboratory, namely, that of the Government College, although well equipped with apparatus, has its physical equipment housed in such an absolutely unsuitable building that it is a wonder that the Professor can carry out his duties.

Laboratories.

**WITNESS NO 10.— LALA HANS RAJ, B A, PRINCIPAL OF THE DAYANAND
ANGLO VEDIC COLLEGE, LAHORE**

The Punjab University is already a teaching University in legal and Oriental
Teaching University—Oriental and Law Colleges studies, but the Law and the Oriental
Colleges are in no way better managed than
the Arts Colleges which are only affiliated to the University. The following are
illustrations of this statement

(1) There are very few specialists as teachers. Take the case of Sanskrit
Philosophy, there is no teacher in the Oriental College who is well up in the
subject. There are only two teachers of Sanskrit who are specialists. One is
the Principal of the College and the other the head pandit who is a Grammarian.
The other pandits are not specialists. Again the reciting of the Vedic *mantras*
it is a difficult task and the pronunciation of the Punjabi students is very bad,
the *Vedas* are taught but no regard is paid to pronunciation.

(2) There is no boarding house for Law students, though the question is
under the consideration of the University. Law students apply to other colleges
or to hostels or private hostels for admission and they are put to great inconvenience.
The boarding house of the Oriental College is very unsatisfactory. There
are insufficient arrangements for physical exercise.

(3) There is nothing to encourage corporate life. There is very little to en-
courage the idea that the Oriental College has much to do with the University.
The University does not think the Oriental College fit to take part in the Univer-
sity Sports Tournament. The University actually ignores its child in this matter,
because perhaps the students are poor and cannot speak English.

(4) The *Vedic* class is in a miserable condition. The University only allows
a palty Rs 30 a month for this class. There was formerly a pandit for this
class who was originally a teacher in the Medical College from which he was
turned away. Since his death no examinations have been held by the University
for the class. The Dayanand Anglo Vedic College pay Rs 70 to secure a more
efficient pandit from Calcutta.

(5) The attainments of the students are not up to the mark. The work of
diffusing a certain kind of Sanskrit knowledge has been well done by the Oriental
College, but what is wanted is deep scholarship. The old pandits are superior
as far as grammar and deep scholarship are concerned to the men turned out by
the Oriental College. If an ordinary pandit is wanted a man who has passed the
Shastri examination of the Punjab University is employed but if a very good
pandit is wanted it is necessary to go somewhere else generally to Benares, to
find him.

The University could not undertake teaching on the side of Engineering
Engineering The Government cannot be expected to
provide funds for the establishment and
maintenance of an institution which will only be an imitation of the Roorkee
College. At present Punjab students of Engineering generally go to Roorkee.
Roorkee men are considered superior to men educated in the Engineering classes
of the Dayanand Anglo Vedic College and the Mayo School of Art because
of the great demand. Students who pass in the Punjab also get employment.
The Engineering classes in the Dayanand Anglo Vedic College and the Mayo
School of Arts do not prepare students for the second examination in Civil Engi-
neering because the University only holds the first of its two examinations. There
are two teachers in the Dayanand Anglo Vedic College who have passed the
Sub-overser examination of the Roorkee College. It is merely an Engineering
class whose object it is to prepare students for Roorkee as well as for the Punjab
University.

Arts Colleges are scattered all over the province and the appointment
University Teaching on the Arts side of University lecturers to deliver lectures
in the B A courses at Lahore would be

the ruin of these colleges. Specialisation should begin after the B. A. courses, and it is only then that University lectures can prove really helpful. The University ought not to enter into competition with existing colleges. Neither should a few college lecturers be recognised as University lecturers, their lectures being open to all colleges. Invidious distinctions would arise, and as the mofussil and private colleges are not adequately represented on the Senate they would suffer most. Moreover, it would necessitate the equalisation of fees, which would be a serious matter to the colleges as well as to the students. Every college has an ideal which it cannot be expected to forego. The Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College was founded with the object of encouraging the study of Hindu literature, and classical languages. In Sanskrit study is commenced in this college from the Vedas and goes on to the Mahabharata and the Ramayana and includes the Upanishads, the Darshanas and such other works as are included in a comprehensive classical course. This ideal would be sacrificed if the College were injured by the University becoming a teaching University.

The President explained the meaning of the proposal regarding recognised teachers. Witness said he would object to it. The college is likely to know its

own interests better than the University and if colleges have to submit to such stringent University rules they might as well receive aid from the Government, Mr. Justice Banerjee remarked that witness appeared to confuse Government control and the supervision which the University should exercise over its affiliated colleges. Witness said that at present the University is practically a department of the Government. It is right that there should be rules of affiliation and certain qualifications may be prescribed by the University in certain matters. Colleges may be required to submit an annual list of their professors as at present and on receiving the list, the University may make any objection it likes, but colleges should not be compelled to take the sanction of the University at the time an appointment is to be made. From the lists submitted once every year the University can at once see whether a college is really a *bona fide* institution or one that tries to deceive the University, and in the latter case the University can take any action it likes.

Witness is opposed to any equalisation of fees or to a minimum fee. The ideal should be the ancient system in which there was no asking for a fee, and in order to encourage that system it would be well if a college could give a sound education without charging any fee at all. As far as the Punjab is concerned it would however not be possible to carry on any college long on no fees or on reduced fees, unless it were privately endowed or supported.

* *Syed Hossain Bilgrami*—When you speak of the old indigenous ideal of free education, you forget perhaps that a corollary was unpaid teaching. Are you prepared to recommend that, as in the old days, teachers should work without payment?

Witness—I do not admit that proposition. They were given *jagirs* by the Government.

If a system of inter-collegiate lectures were adopted, the great difficulty would be with regard to time-tables. In England lectures are delivered at different times, but here the time is fixed in summer from 6 to 11. All colleges must provide teaching during that time. The lecture hours in the different colleges would conflict.

President.—In English Universities lectures are delivered between 10 and 1.

Witness.—Then how do they arrange their time-tables?

Dr. Mackichan.—Students do not attend so many classes.

Witness.—But here they have to do so.

Witness is not in favour of the institution of an Honours course. If Government is ready to establish another college or to specialise in a particular college for Honours students, that would be another matter. It is mainly a question of money. The professorial staff of the Lahore College is inadequate to teach both a Pass and Honours course. No college has enough professors for the purpose.

The Punjab University can profitably extend its teaching functions by taking up the work of the M. A. class. **Advanced teaching.** The number of M. A. candidates is very small; for example, this year it was something like 19 students in the English class, two or three students in Science classes and about three students in the Sanskrit class. If competent special professors were appointed, the instruction would improve very much.

The University can help very largely to foster a corporate life by the establishment of a University library and reading room; by the establishment of inter-college debating clubs (but unless the professors and principals of colleges participate in this, nothing will ever be done); by the establishment of a scientific museum, by the institution of occasional evening lectures; and by insisting on better management of boarding-houses. The institution of the University Sports Tournament has done much good.

The Senate should consist entirely of teachers together with a certain number of Fellows elected by the graduates.

Speaking generally the circumstances of the country and the great diversity of interests would not permit of the establishment of a Teaching University in the Punjab. If in time the country progresses and differences are settled, it may be possible, but in the present state of society it would be most undesirable. Even in the matter of appointments the Government has to keep the balance. If a Hindu is appointed to be a member of the Senate, then a Muhammadan must also be appointed, or if a missionary is appointed, then a Government official must be added. These considerations are sufficient to show that it is not possible to have a Teaching University at the present time.

Professors should have the right of not promoting students to the 2nd and 4th year classes, but they should not possess the power of keeping back a student from the University examinations. As long as the present state of things continues and a college is likely to be judged by University results, if the professor be given the power of turning out students whom he does not think fit at the time when the examinations come round, then he will only send up those students who are likely to pass and thus be able to show very good results as far as the University is concerned, whereas as a matter of fact the real results may be very different. It does not seem possible to stop the practice of judging a college by the percentage of passes.

Mr. Pedler.—A Principal might attain the same end by always keeping back students back the first year.

The University should insist on the physical education of the students. Physical exercise should be made compulsory and the Principals of colleges should certify that candidates have passed through a Physical course.

Boarding-houses should be better looked after. One unsatisfactory point is that there are no good superintendents. There ought to be whole-time superintendents who will devote themselves to the welfare of the students. No such superintendents are to be found in any of the colleges. Superintendents should be of the same class of men as the staff of the college. The Government should spend money on superintendents of boarding-houses, just as much as on professors.

Punjab students are weak in English. One mode of remedying this evil is by commencing the study of English at an earlier age than at present, say in the 2nd primary class. The principle according to which the Education Department works is that a boy should first learn his own vernacular thoroughly and that after he has done that he will become proficient in English sooner than if he began its study earlier. The system has not given very satisfactory results in so far as English is concerned. If less time is given to the subject owing to its being taken up at a later period, students cannot be expected to be as proficient in it as if they had devoted a longer period to its study. At present a student learns English for five years in the Middle School and two years in the high department. The period should be extended to nine years.

Dr. Mackichan remarked that the experience in other Universities is that those students do best in English who first of all complete a thorough vernacular education.

Students are weak in the vernacular and a classical language is required to discipline the mind as well as to help the study of the vernacular. To give more time for the study of languages there should be four instead of five subjects for the Entrance, namely, English, a vernacular language, mathematics and a classical language or Persian. A vernacular language is not at present prescribed as a compulsory subject in the Entrance Examination. Unseen passages should be set for translation. That is already done to a certain extent. The present oral test in the Entrance Examination serves mainly as a help to students to pass their written examination.

Very few questions are set in Sanskrit Grammar and students are able to neglect the subject. Even in the Entrance a knowledge of grammar should be required. Students ought not to be obliged to read a grammar written in Sanskrit, but the papers should be drawn up in such a way that a student who has not studied grammar will not be able to pass. Some grammar ought also to be prescribed for the B. A. Examination.

Although the study of English should be begun at an early age, the study of the vernacular should be carried up to the Entrance, which is about the time that the taste for it is developed. Except for some books written under the patronage of the Text Books Committee, nothing has been done in the cause of vernacular literature. The Oriental College has done practically nothing in this direction.

There should be no interference with fees. The number of denominational institutions is growing and they are exactly the kind of institution required in this country. The education imparted in Government institutions is a godless education and it cannot be otherwise, because Government cannot do anything in order to give religious and moral education, and it is necessary for the people themselves to found institutions in which they may be able to impart University education, together with religious training according to their own ideals. The Government should extend a helping hand to such institutions, and if the Government does that, a large amount of endowments will be forthcoming to further the cause of secular as well as of religious education. Just as in England denominational education holds a very prominent position, so in India denominational institutions ought to occupy an important place and in future, schools and colleges founded with denominational ideals ought to be encouraged by the Government, and no conditions of affiliation ought to be imposed upon them except in a spirit of sympathy and catholicity. They ought to be brought up to the standard and not to be crushed and stunted as they are at the present time. To take the case of the Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College. When it first opened, it had not a good building, but now it has a good one which cost of Rs. 45,000. Supposing it could not have afforded it, it would have been very hard if for that reason the college had been refused recognition.

President.—Would you object to the University saying that a building is inadequate or that an institution does not make proper provision for teaching and for the physical welfare of its students and that it must be brought up to the mark or it will not be recognised?

Witness.—After a certain time that might be done, every opportunity should be allowed for amelioration.

Witness is not in favour of an age-limit. Of the number of candidates who appeared at the Entrance this year 239 were
 Age Limit. between the ages of 15 and 16, and only 27 were below 14. This practically means that there are only a very few students for whom the legislation is sought and no case is made out for such legislation. The evil ought to exist before legislation is resorted to. Witness has not gathered information as to whether the number of students below the age of 16 who appeared every year is increasing or decreasing, but the evil, if it is such, is at present inconsiderable. An age-limit would have the result of keeping the best students idle after they had finished their school course.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—Cannot the evil you speak of be prevented to a certain extent by the rule about the age limit being postponed for some time so that parents will know how the matter stands and will regulate the progress of their children accordingly.

Witness.—There are very few parents sufficiently educated to understand these things.

Then again Indian students who gain Government of India scholarships will not be able to compete for the Indian Civil Service. One student passed the M. A. in the Punjab after studying in the Government College, and having obtained a Government scholarship went to England and there became a wrangler and entered the Civil Service. It would not have been possible for him to do all this if there had been an age-limit. He passed the Matriculation at the age of 13 or 14. An M. A. is naturally preferred to a B. A. for Government scholarships, and witness thinks that they are not given to B.A.'s in the Punjab. There is a proposal before the University for the M. A. course to be extended to two years, and if that is carried, then even if a boy passes the Matriculation at 15, he will be 21 before he passes the M. A. and after that he will have to wait some time to see if he is selected for a Government scholarship.

WITNESS NO. 11.—LALA LAJPAT RAI, Pleader, Chief Court, and Honorary, Secretary, Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College Managing Committee, Lahore.
(Written Statement No. 11 in Part II).

Inadequate and small text-books are being used for instruction in the vernacular. The oriental side of the University has begun at the wrong end. There is a great paucity of vernacular books through which sound education can be given, whether in higher Mathematics, in Philology or in Science. The growth of the vernacular literature is grossly neglected. Scholarships should be awarded for the preparation of vernacular books. The savings of the University from examination fees may be profitably employed in encouraging the growth of vernacular literature. Very little advantage is derived from the endowed fellows. The rules should require than to devote their lives to literature or teaching. Now a reader after enjoying his fellowship for a few years takes to law and is lost to vernacular literature. In 1899, there were 56 scholarship and stipend holders in the Oriental College. It is very difficult to attract men to the Arts side of the Oriental College without giving them stipends. It would be better to spend more on vernacular literature before attempting the laudable but impossible.

A great difficulty lies in the existence of three vernaculars Urdu, Hindi and Gurmukhi. Some have a taste for Gurmukhi, some for Hindi and some for Urdu. The primary schools begin with Urdu but with the exception of Delhi and the country round it the language of the people is Punjabi. The court language is throughout Urdu, and therefore great importance is attached to it in the school curriculum. The medium of communication between the Professors and students in the Oriental College is in general Urdu; but there are some books written in Hindi. Witness would prefer that the Punjabi language should take the place of Urdu in the schools. This would not cut off the Punjab from the rest of India. Technical words are derived from Sanskrit and there is not much difference between Punjabi and other languages derived from Sanskrit. The tendency will be for the languages of vernacular literature to become more and more alike. The language of the *Grant* is closely allied to Hindi. In the case of Urdu technical terms are either derived from Arabic or borrowed from English. The vernaculars of other provinces are richer than that of the Punjab. Witness does not merely mean that they have become more Sanskritised, but that they are more developed and have produced more literary works. In the arts course of the Oriental College it is not possible to teach adequately through the vernacular because there are no text-books. Also the lecturers are not experts and have no sufficient knowledge of the classical and vernacular languages. It is not an easy task to convey the meaning of higher Science in the vernacular unless the lecturer is an expert. One cannot get experts because the salaries are not sufficiently attractive. The University should offer high salaries and insist upon the lecturers having a thorough knowledge. In that case witness would be the first man to propose an arts course in the vernacular. Under the present circumstances it is a farce.

In eulogising the work of the Oriental College Dr. Stratton referred to a gentleman on the staff who had taken his M. A. from that College. It cannot claim much credit for him since he received his education in the D.A.V. College and passed his B. A. from that College; only for his M. A. examination did he read partly in the D. A. V. College and partly in the Oriental College. The Pandit Mahamahopadhyay and the other head pandit all came from other colleges. There has been very little attempt at specialisation in the Oriental College. The defects in the college may be due to bad teaching or to time being wasted in a vain attempt to teach an arts course through the vernacular, but at any rate they exist. A large number of students go to Benares and try to get higher Sanskrit teaching there, notwithstanding that the prospects of subsequent employment are not bright. Syed Hossain Bilgrami pointed out that they belong to a different class and learn for the sake of knowledge and religion. Witness replied that some students in the titles side of the Oriental College do the same,

and that more would do so if the instruction were better. Either the Oriental College should be improved by the grant of higher salaries, or if that is not possible the funds should be given in the form of grants-in-aid to other institutions which make a speciality of oriental learning. The Oriental College has done good work in supplying teachers for schools but more funds should be spent on it or a better method devised.

The D. A. V. College besides teaching the boys the University course instructs them in the best part of classical literature so far as its moral and religious side is concerned. There are two alternative courses in the college. One is a higher course studied with English only and includes advanced grammar and the epic poems.

Those who get scholarships in the Oriental College should not be made to work in the college itself but should be allowed to give lectures, or spend their time in research and the acquisition of thorough knowledge of various subjects. The idea of the scholarships is not to provide teachers.

There is a proposal to divide the ordinary degree into two courses—the Honours course and the Pass course. Witness is afraid that the material in the Punjab is not yet ready for that step. The results of the different examinations show that there is a paucity of brilliant students. Perhaps it is due to deficiency in teaching, but more probably to the fact that the foundation of the educational course is very defective. The teaching in schools is still in many cases of an inferior character.

The suggestion was made to the Commission by the Principal of the D. A. V. College, that English should begin in the second primary class. Witness does not think that it should be studied so early. The defect in the students' English is due mainly to the classes being too large and to want of attention to translation and composition. It is also due to the students being made to study too many subjects in the Middle School. Witness would allow English to begin at the present stage. The teaching of history and geography involves much memorising and expenditure of time. If these subjects were omitted or the system modified, there would be more time for English.

In the B.A. course there is a noticeable absence of the study of grammar. There is also a sudden rise from Puranic to Vedic literature. There is a consensus of opinion among Indian scholars that the Vedas cannot be studied without a thorough knowledge of grammar. The Brahmana, Sudra and Epic periods intervene between Puranic and Vedic Sanskrit. Different formulæ of grammar hold good for the two periods. It is not possible to go straight from the one to the other. The Rig Veda being a subject of controversy ought not to be taught in the Colleges, the instruction shakes the religious belief of the students in the sacred works. They are taught not as the revered sages of the Hindu faith would teach them, but after the methods of Continental critical scholars like Ludwig and Roth. Pious Hindus object to the "higher criticism" being applied to the Vedic hymns. The sacred texts have their traditional meanings, preserved in inspired commentaries dear to the heart of the Hindu, but commanding no respect, from critical non-Hindu professors. The only idea of the College is to promote the philological study of Sanskrit, and that being so it should take for text book purposes other works of ancient Sanskrit literature less sacred, less inviolable, to the Hindu than the Vedas. The fact is that for ordinary purposes of philological interpretation many of the passages in the Vedas are of an extremely controversial nature. For a European professor to enforce the perhaps irreverent Western interpretations upon the reverent mind of the student is either to break down the student's religious faith, or if he is unshakeable, to compel him to answer questions against his conviction so as to satisfy the examiners. All this is very hurtful to Hindu religious sentiment.

Dr. Mackichan.—What would you substitute for the Vedas in the College course?

Witness.—Any of the later and less revered writings.

Dr. Mackichan.—Would you exclude the Upanishads?

Witness.—No: I see no reason to.

Dr. Mackichan.—But they also are of a controversial nature?

Witness.—Less so, however, than the Vedas. There is less discussion about them and they can be more readily understood by the students. In the case of the smaller Upanishads the student can read the whole and there is not the same difficulty as when different interpretations are given of isolated passages in the Vedas.

The same system is not pursued in Arabic. For the F.A. there are two standard works; in the B.A. course there are no selections from the *Koran*. There are some in the M.A. course, but they are expounded by a Muhammadan.

During the last century the history of India has advanced by studies, and yet text-books are given nearly a century old. Sir William Hunter's history and other later books should be prescribed.

I submit that if a student has secured a high percentage of marks in two out of three subjects he should not be ploughed for obtaining less than five marks in the remaining subject. If the percentages gained in the two subjects are very high the candidate might be passed altogether, otherwise he should come up again in the third subject only.

Specialisation in the grant of scholarships should not go so far as Mr. Robson suggests. A good all round man first or second in the aggregate might be passed over for a specialist much lower down in the list. Some scholarships might be given on the aggregate and others for special subjects. Till recently philosophy, history and Persian carried low marks and this partly explains the success of mathematics. Now each subject except Persian carries 150 marks. The Government of India home scholarships might be given to specialists who would continue their special studies in England. Sanskrit has been left out of the Government of India scheme on the ground that it is an endowed subject. This course must tend to discourage the endowment of scholarships.

Much of the objection to the introduction of affiliation rules is based on fear of the way the Senate will work them. The present Senate has not been fair to private colleges. The D. A. V. College has been teaching since 1888, in 1893 it was recognised up to the B. A. and in 1896 up to the M. A. standard. The Principal was not appointed to the Senate until a representation was made on the subject. Two of the Senior Professors who are of more than 10 years standing are not on the Senate. The Principal has not yet been appointed to set the history paper although he has been a sub-examiner for ten years. Only Government and missionary college men are appointed head examiners, equally good men in private colleges are passed over. These remarks refer to the Entrance Examination, professors are not appointed examiners for higher examinations.

Witness would not like to see professors appointed examiners in the present condition of the Punjab. The colleges are not sufficiently independent and competition looks to the University results.

The Syndicate should be composed entirely of *ex-officio* members. The members should all be resident in Lahore. The principals of Lahore Colleges, including private colleges, should be members.

All the Universities should not be judged by the same standard. There should be different rules for different Universities. Most of the difficulties that are experienced by the Senate at Calcutta do not exist in Lahore and there is no likelihood of their occurring there. In making rules for affiliation for Lahore it must be remembered that it is a backward Province and that there is only one Government College, the rest being denominational. The religious feelings of the Province must also be considered. For these reasons it is not advisable to make hard-and-fast affiliation rules so far as the Punjab is concerned.

Residence in College boarding-houses should be made compulsory in the case of all students except those whose parents and guardians live in the city. It is very difficult to establish residential schools. If therefore colleges can be made residential, students reading up to the F. A. only should be freely accepted in order that they may gain a little culture and some of the benefits of corporate life.

The affiliation rules should be so devised as to recognise all *bond fide* Colleges (not being venture colleges) which have made sufficient arrangements for boarding-houses, physical exercise, and the supervision of their students' moral welfare. There should be no rigid rules relating to the recognition of professors or to fees. It has been suggested to the Commission that a number of scholarships should be provided for poor students. This is good as far as it goes, but it is not sufficient to provide fully for the needs of the case.

In the Hindu College at Delhi almost all the professors are M. As. In the face of this fact witness does not know what standard Mr. White wishes the University to fix as regards recognized professors when he says that that College has no qualified professors. The D. A. V. College when it started had a fund of Rs. 40,000 and has now 4 lakhs. When the St. Stephen's College was founded it was in the city and was not so good as it is at present. It is very undesirable for colleges to sit in judgment on one another. Except the Vice Chancellor and the Director of Public Instruction there are few persons competent to supervise the Colleges. In the D. A. V. College several of the professors are only B. As. but they are well known to be good men. It is difficult to see how the University could ensure supervision by independent people. Private Colleges should not be hampered and there should be no hard-and-fast rules of affiliation.

Private Colleges should not be judged by the salaries given to the staff. There is a spirit abroad similar to that which actuates the missionaries. The President remarked that there are also cases in which low salaries are drawn not in a spirit of self sacrifice but because they represent the market value of the recipients. Witness replied that in such cases the University should interfere, but that there should be no hard-and-fast rules. The University might have the right of veto. That would be better than asking for confirmation for each appointment. It is easy for the University to distinguish between commercial and good colleges.

Law students should be passed graduates. The Law examinations suffer more from cram than any others because the courses are long and ill devised.

The examination papers impose a great tax upon the memory but none upon the intelligence. Questions asking for lists of amended Acts of a particular kind with their numbers and dates are very common and have to be answered from memory. Once the question was asked "state the amending Acts of the Indian Penal Code". The examination should be so conducted as to test the legal knowledge of the students and to encourage intellectual effort. Candidates should be required to show a general intelligent study of legal principles. Students should be allowed to read Codes and statute books in the examination and the Examiners should see whether they can readily understand them. The evil is worst in the oral examination. There are several oral examiners and specific questions are set in order to secure uniformity. The examiners should be left

free to assign marks for answers which are not confined to the questions alone but test the students' intelligent knowledge of Law. The questions put in the oral examination do not appear in the Calendar. About 5 to 8 questions are put to each student in the oral examination and they carry 50 marks. No fixed time is allowed for answering these questions; it depends upon the whim of each examiner—generally 10 to 12 minutes is all that is given. The time is insufficient. The examination is useless as an oral test and it is a great hardship to the students. Dr. Bourne remarked that 70 per cent. pass the intermediate and 33 the LL.B. Witness replied that there is no *viva voce* examination for the preliminary examination.

It is impossible to get good teaching for the low salaries (Rs. 100 a month) at present paid to the law lecturers. In addition to the University lectures every college should be allowed to have its own Law classes. At present the professors in the Law College know that their salaries do not depend on the results of the examinations, and if for this reason they are lax it is very difficult to test their work. There is no continuous exposition of particular works.

Brilliant law graduates should be given judicial appointments after practice without further examination as in the United Provinces. In the Punjab they must pass competitive and departmental examinations.

WITNESS NO. 12.—T. W. ARNOLD, Esq., B. A., Vice-Principal and Professor of Philosophy, Government College, Lahore.

Witness has in his statement (No. 12 in part II) advocated the encouragement of oriental studies by the Indian Universities. He would now add a practical suggestion, namely, that a student who takes up English and one of the classical languages of India for the B. A. degree, be allowed to take up as his third subject a course of History or Philosophy in the same classical language. In Europe a student reading the History or Philosophy of Greece or Rome for his degree, is allowed—in some cases obliged—to study his subject in connection with original texts. But the Indian Universities refuse to its B. A. students the privilege of studying Sanskrit Philosophy, or Arabic History or Philosophy, in a similar fashion.

Narrowness and illiberality is shewn in thus refusing to extend the range of studies; and also a lingering trace of that ignorant contempt for oriental literature which found expression in Lord Macaulay's famous minute. In Europe they have ceased to believe that in these classical languages "there are no books on any subject, which deserve to be compared to our own." They have learned to respect and value the Sanskrit systems of Philosophy, and German scholars at least find them worthy of close study. They have come to appreciate the valuable contributions made to historical and geographical science in Arabic and Persian, better than to suppose (with Macaulay) that this "history abounds with kings thirty feet high, and reigns thirty thousand years long," or that this "geography is made up of seas of treacle and seas of butter." But the spirit of this contemptuous estimate of oriental thought and literature, so strikingly expressed in the document which laid the foundation of the present system of English education in India, still lingers in the Universities, and is nowhere stronger than among those Indian graduates who are the products of that system and are generally profoundly ignorant of the studies they so much despise.

All that is here asked for is that the Indian Universities should allow that liberty of study which grants a place to every branch of human knowledge—as is implied in the very word "University." The aim of the Universities of Europe is to include as many Departments of study as teachers can be found to teach, even though no students may be forthcoming. But here there are both teachers and students, but the Universities will not find a place for the studies.

It is characteristic of the narrowness of the present system that the University does not in any way recognize the excellent work that is being done by the D. A. V. College for the promotion of Sanskrit studies by allowing a place in the subjects that may be taken for the degree to their extended course of Sanskrit. The President asked whether a competent body of teachers could be procured to give instruction in the proposed course. Witness replied, not in the Arts colleges at present, and no college should be permitted to teach the course without showing that it has the means to do so. In accordance with witness' proposal for inter-collegiate lectures, provision might be made by the Oriental College, where there are men who are fully competent. In the case of Sanskrit Philosophy the D. A. V. College could probably provide lecturers. Mr. Beck brought forward the same proposal before the Allahabad University but it was not discussed. Witness merely wishes that students should be allowed to take up Philosophy in Sanskrit or Arabic as a special subject. He does not wish to make such a course in any way compulsory. The Universities in India should show the same liberality as the Universities in Germany. They should allow the students some freedom of choice. The study of languages such as Sanskrit and Arabic, with their elaborate grammatical systems and many-sided literatures, can provide the same intellectual training in method, thoroughness and accuracy, as is claimed for classical studies in Europe.

Asked whether it would not be better to defer the special course to the M. A. and whether B. A. students are in a position to make a choice of such studies, witness replied that few students take up the M. A. course and that many young students are able to exercise a choice in the matter. Some of them come

from learned Pandit or Maulvi families in which there is a tradition of learning. They enter the colleges possessing a knowledge of Sanskrit, Arabic, or Persian which is often higher than that possessed by B.As. who have studied these languages only in their college course.

It is of great importance to have a school of oriental study without any sectarian aim. There is in Lahore a good deal of zeal for the study of oriental languages. In the D. A. V. College the study of Sanskrit is made much of. In Lahore there are also several Arabic schools which are zealously supported, but the studies are on a religious basis. Their courses are accordingly different from those in the Oriental College and they often succeed in attracting students where the Oriental College fails to do so. It is well, however, that there should be an institution in which the studies are pursued on purely scholastic lines without any admixture of theology. If for this reason alone the continuance of the Oriental College is a matter of great importance. Mr. Madan Gopal has laid a paper before the Commission (No. 16 in Part III) in which, in a critical and adverse spirit he asks a number of searching questions regarding the Oriental College such as—Has the college furthered the systematic study of the classical languages of the East? Are its alumni famous? Have its graduates ever done any original work in the Indian classics, or even produced valuable compilations? Have any efforts been made to translate European literature into the vernacular? Have the graduates of the college shown themselves fit to do anything except to serve as masters in Anglo-Vernacular schools? Has the college been successful in instilling in the minds of Punjabis a desire to pursue oriental knowledge? It is very difficult to reply to these questions by a *yes* or a *no*. Mr. Madan Gopal has no hesitation in answering them all by a direct negative. Subject to reasonable modifications, witness would be inclined, if he were to answer the questions at all in that way, to reply with a direct affirmative. What he would prefer to say is that, so far as any institution in India has achieved all the things which Mr. Madan Gopal enumerates, the Oriental College has achieved them. Or he would say—if any college in India can answer these questions with a *yes*, then the Oriental College can do so. Allusions of a very unpleasant nature have been made to what some critics of the Oriental College have been pleased to call a system of bribes. It is entirely untrue to assert that students come to the Oriental College because they are given bread and butter which they might otherwise have to go without, and further that the graduates are utterly incapable of doing any good work after passing through the college. Witness then read a list of names of students who had taken the degree of Maulvi Fazil in the Oriental College. Leaving aside men who are holding educational appointments, there are others occupying distinguished positions in Government service, such as that of District Judge, Munsif, Assistant Inspector of Schools, Deputy Collector in the Canal Department, while others again are men of influence in their own community. Among the students of the Oriental College, who have taken the degree of Munshi Fazil is one of the Fellows of this University who is much respected in the city. All these gentlemen have distinguished themselves in Arabic and Persian. I cannot name persons who have similarly distinguished themselves for their proficiency in Sanskrit with the exception of the teachers. A similar list of distinguished men of the world cannot be given in the case of Sanskrit scholars. The reason is that the Pandits are of a more retiring disposition and have no desire to take up active professions. One is not therefore likely to find them appearing before the world as officers in Government posts or as organizers of society.

The institution of Readers in the Oriental College is worthy of imitation in other Indian Universities. A Readership corresponds very much to a Fellowship at Oxford or Cambridge. The Readerships are tenable for three years and are endowed for the pursuit of post-graduate study. They have attracted some very able men, several of whom have made their mark in the world. From among these Readers have come a number of distinguished members of the medical profession and a number of Government officers and Extra Assistant Commissioners. The Readers teach in the College. The amount of teaching they do varies.

Readers in the Oriental College and the encouragement of vernacular literature.

They have a good deal of leisure and many of them have used it well, some might have done more for the encouragement of vernacular literatures. [Mr. Bell pointed out that the Readers are not the product of the Oriental College—they came from Arts Colleges]

More translations are not published because no one has taken up the matter from a business point of view. If translations were published by subscription, in the same way that the Pali Text Society, the Shakespeare Society, etc., dispose of their publications, there would be provision for the sale of the books. At present the University often cannot publish the translations because its funds are too limited. It cannot therefore encourage the translation of books because they would remain in manuscript.

Readerships are tenable for three years. It would be better to renew them from year to year in consideration of the work that is done in each preceding year.

The Syndicate has laid down no particular lines on which the work of translation should be done. It has recently decided to have a compilation of technical terms made from the manuscript literature kept in the Oriental College in order to facilitate the work of translation.

It is frequently said that the Government colleges are godless institutions.

Moral aspect of Government Colleges.

Witness has had no personal acquaintance with them elsewhere, but he can say, in regard to the Government college with which he is connected, that it is characterised by godlessness neither in the theological nor the ethical signification of the term. Having worked for ten years in a denominational college, he was especially interested on entering a Government college in observing the religious life of the students under such different conditions. What he finds is that there is a very strong religious element in the life of the students, which in many cases manifests itself in zealous and intense forms. The late Director of Public Instruction, Dr. Sime, who was connected with the Government College for many years as a Professor and afterwards as Principal, in his Convocation address (1900), speaks similarly of the graduates of his acquaintance as being, "almost without exception, decidedly religious men." Students are sent to the Government College whose parents shrink from exposing the religious beliefs of their children to the disintegrating influences of a Mission college. The Government College holds, indeed, a very important place in the religious life of the student world. There are within its walls representatives of all the religious bodies of the Punjab; they in many cases, probably, come for the first time in close and personal contact with members of rival creeds. They learn to treat one another's beliefs and prejudices with consideration, and in the case of some of the more zealous, this more liberal attitude is not achieved without a struggle and a considerable amount of self-repression. In a country like India, where religious animosity is so frequently the cause of social unrest and disorder, such a training is admirable. Denominational institutions run the risk of becoming narrow, if not fanatical. Fanatics sometimes come to the Government College, but they leave it with widened sympathies. In this part of the country there is no need to cultivate in the students the theological virtues; they flourish luxuriantly. But the social virtues (which the Pharisee is apt to lack), especially toleration, the feeling of common brotherhood, the sense of solidarity, find in the Government College a fruitful soil and are distinctly fostered by the training there given. Many of the leading members of the chief religious bodies in Lahore have been students in the Government College.

It would be most inadvisable to combine classes of Honours' and Pass men. If any system of Honours' courses

Honours' Course

is introduced only those students taking them up should attend the lectures intended for the Honours' men. Such a system could be introduced to a certain extent by inter-collegiate co-operation, although there are certain difficulties in the way. The financial difficulty would vanish if there were a willingness to co-operate on the part of the colleges.

WITNESS NO. 13.—DR. C. C. CALEB, M.B., M.S., Professor of Physiology and Botany, Medical College, Lahore.

Witness said that the evidence given by former witnesses and specially by Dr. Ewing of the Forman College had taken the wind out of his sails so completely that it would be wasting the time of the Commission if he referred in detail to the points raised in his memo (Paper No 13 in Part II). He would therefore only touch upon some of these points by way of amplification, and then ask the Commissioners to permit him to lay before them two matters of considerable importance in connection with the medical examinations.

Preliminary remarks.

The transformation from the existing lines, which are purely those of an examining authority, into a teaching and examining body by making the existing colleges the instrument of the University's functions is nowhere in the whole of India more feasible than it is in Lahore. For Lahore forms to all intents and purposes the chief centre of higher University work and with its four first grade Arts colleges and three special colleges, *viz.*, the Oriental, Law and Medical colleges, two of which are already University colleges, affords an example of educational concentration without a parallel in other large Indian towns. This tendency seems to be likely to become still more pronounced in the future, whilst with one or two notable exceptions, higher education in places other than Lahore has a remarkable tendency to etiolate and fail. If therefore the experiment of giving a teaching side to Indian Universities is to be made at all, the case of Lahore is indeed a strong one.

Teaching University

The necessity for and the importance of affiliation as well as the subject of the conditions necessary to secure the privilege of affiliation have been so fully and fairly put before the Commissioners that witness did not propose to say much more about it. He wished, however, to insist upon the importance of not affiliating a college as a whole (unless there are reasons to the contrary), but only in a stated faculty or even in a special subject. The object of this restriction is to ensure efficient teaching. For instance, if a college is affiliated in Mathematics, the University will consider whether it is fully and efficiently equipped for the teaching of Mathematics. If, on the other hand, a college is affiliated for the purpose of teaching Botany, the University will consider that the staff and equipment of the college are so efficient as to ensure the teaching of that subject in an adequate manner.

Affiliation of Colleges

With regard to the fee question, witness entirely agrees with those who advocate that a college should not be affiliated to the University if the fees fall below a certain minimum fixed by the Syndicate. A restriction of this sort may mean hardship for some of the colleges, but inter-collegiate work and co-operation is impossible unless it is first rendered certain that one college cannot underbid another, otherwise the students will join a college where a low fee is charged and attend lectures in colleges which charge a higher fee. Witness was asked whether it would not be reasonable for a section of the community to establish a college for the intellectual and religious training of their boys, and to say to the University—"We have made efficient arrangements for teaching boys in this college, do not insist upon our charging the same fees as other colleges." Witness replied that high education not being a necessity, but a luxury, those who seek for it should be willing to pay for the desired commodity. Further, cheap education, especially in India, is very apt to be nasty education. The poor but really deserving students should, however, in all colleges be protected by empowering the head of each institution to admit poor students free of charge up to a limit of 5 per cent. of the total number on the rolls of the institution, and to remit half the fees to an equal number.

Fees

In paragraph 7 of his memorandum witness has suggested a scheme of inter-college lectures. That scheme has been put forward by way of illustration only, and there are serious difficulties in its way, though they need not be insuperable in its practical application. But there can be no doubt that the

Inter-Collegiate Lectures

notion is a valuable one, and witness has already put on record the *pros* and *cons* of the scheme. But what he has not stated, but only incidentally referred to, is that it involves the principle of the division of labour, which always means superior work. Taking the B.A. or the M.A. courses in Botany as an example, it will be readily conceded that, given three qualified teachers, it would be a distinct gain to the student, the teachers and possibly to the science itself if one of the teachers lectured on Morphology only, another on Physiology only, and the third on Classification only. Similarly, in connection with practical work, one man might do all the microscopic work, another the experimental work and the third field and garden botany. There would not be very much difficulty in arranging for a scheme of this sort.

Until comparatively recently the only sciences taught in the Punjab colleges were Physics and Chemistry, and to some extent even now science is looked upon as synonymous with these subjects. The official designation of the Professor of Physics and Chemistry at the Government College is the Professor of Science, and when students come to the Medical College who have passed in Physics and Chemistry in an Arts college they invariably speak of the lectures delivered at the Medical College on these subjects as the science lectures, and of all other lectures, by their proper names, as if lectures on science subjects other than Physics or Chemistry belonged to quite a different category.

This state of affairs is now passing away. Biology has been taken up by the Forman and Government Colleges as one of the subjects in which instruction is to be given up to the F.A. standard for the present, and it is to be presumed to the higher requirements of the Bachelor's, Master's and Doctor's degrees before long. Biology has already been taught for a number of years in the Medical College. It seems to be a waste of power and of financial resources, so far as the two Government Colleges are concerned, to relegate the teaching of this subject, still in a stage of inception, to two institutions. The whole of the biological teaching in these two colleges (witness says nothing of the private colleges, because he would not interfere with their liberty of teaching what they like, provided they satisfy the affiliation requirements) should be carried out under the supervision of a whole-time Professor, with one or more assistants, and having at his disposal a fully equipped and up to date laboratory, appliances and museum of animal and vegetable specimens. The same thing might with advantage be done for Chemistry and Physics.

Briefly, where two Government Institutions exist, both doing the same kind of work, there should be concentration—not dispersion—of effort and resources. The combination will be more efficient and less expensive.

The Medical College should soon, or at not a very distant date, cease to impart instruction in such subjects as Botany, Chemistry and Physics. The Professors in that college are already over-burdened with work, and it would be a great gain if the college made it a rule not to admit students who had not passed the F.Sc. or B.Sc. examinations, or if it admits them, to allow them to take up these subjects elsewhere. The F.Sc. examination should then be taken as the equivalent of the preliminary science examination. So far as medical education is concerned, only an elementary knowledge of Physics, Chemistry and Botany is required, sufficient to ensure that the students will be able to understand and appreciate Philosophical Physics, Philosophical Chemistry and Medical Botany. It is not necessary for the students to be Chemists, Physicists or Botanists. The Medical College standard of Science this year is practically the same as for the Intermediate examination. If therefore it were made a rule that only those students will be admitted in the Medical College who have passed the Intermediate, the whole difficulty would at once end. In default of this the students should, whilst on the rolls of the Medical Colleges, pass the preliminary scientific examination elsewhere.

As a corollary to the system of inter-college lectures and the abolition of text-book wherever necessary the time has come when the University should not only do its own teaching through its recognised teachers, but do its examining

Teaching of Science.

Preliminary Science for Medical Students.

Teachers as Examiners.

through the same agency. It should become in a word a real examining and teaching University. In this respect witness heartily endorses Dr. Ewing's view.

So far as the Medical examinations are concerned, the objection of Mr. Justice Banerjee that the appointment of any particular teacher as examiner gives undue advantage to his own students cannot apply, because there is only one Medical College in the Province, and no students appear from other Universities. One may therefore safely begin the experiment by appointing the Professors of the Medical College to be examiners in the Medical Faculty. It would be a very great improvement. At present the teacher is of little account. The author of the text-book is the real teacher, and the examiner is the student's guide. The teacher is merely the interpreter. His personal influence is a very limited quantity. If Professors are allowed to examine students in the oral examinations, there is no reason why they should not also be allowed to conduct the written examination. There would be no objection to outsiders being appointed as examiners in conjunction with Professors, so that the public may be satisfied that the examinations are conducted fairly.

Of the immense value of boarding-houses from every point of view there can be no two opinions. The Medical College is the only institution which at present does not possess a boarding-house, but it is a matter for congratulation that a lakh of rupees has been already voted for supplying this deficiency, and it is to be hoped that a boarding-house for the medical students will soon be a *fait accompli*. From the student's point of view the establishment of a boarding-house is even a more pressing need than the need, pressing and urgent as it is, of adding to the Professorial Staff. It is no doubt true that students come to the college, when they are no longer school-boys, at an average age of 18. But it must not be forgotten that they go through a course of studies which tends in many cases to undermine religious beliefs and conviction and in the complete absence of other wholesome influences, such as home life and the like, tends to allow the student to fall into the temptations which abound all round him. Apart from this point of view, a boarding-house can do a great deal towards creating a healthy *esprit de corps*, and by affording to the student healthy surroundings to raise him to a higher physical and intellectual level.

The boarding-house for the Medical College, should it be ever established, ought soon to become self-supporting. The average cost of living to the medical student is Rs. 25. If there were accommodation for 400 students and each inmate were charged Rs. 10 a month, that would give a sum of Rs. 4,000 which would be enough for all needs.

Rule 20, page 278 of the Calendar, prevents a student from presenting himself for examination for the second L.M.S. examination more than three times.

The operation of this rule means a wasted and broken life in many cases, or helps to swell that inglorious army of quacks who do so great a mischief throughout India. If a man enters the college at the age of 18, he passes his first L.M. examination at the age of 20, and if he is successful, he becomes an L.M.S. at the age of 24, but if he is unfortunate enough to be plucked three times, then at 26 he is thrown upon the mercy of the world, and on account of the technical nature of his education he cannot hope to find employment such as that which is open to a failed B.A. or M.A. He degenerates year after year, because he has lost all interest in life. Witness knows a number of such instances, about four or five of which occur every year. Many of these unsuccessful candidates become medicine vendors and open tiny little shops in the bazaar to eke out some sort of miserable existence by preying upon the public faith. As regards the men who pass the examination, some of them are taken into Government service, some into the service of Native States and others become private practitioners. No such restriction exists in connection with any of the other Faculties of the University, nor in connection with any other medical examination, with which witness is acquainted. The rule is objectionable and distinctly unfair, but no attempt has yet been made to alter it in the Senate.

There is no difference between the L.M. and S. and the M.B. examinations except that for the latter the student has to study Comparative Anatomy

and must have graduated; otherwise the papers and the examinations are the same. It is unfair that the student should be made to go through an additional two years' course for this slight difference. There is no University in the world which grants licenses and degrees. In England the University grants the degrees and the corporate bodies the diplomas. In India there is only a University, the proper function of which is to give degrees and not diplomas. Before the Punjab College became part of a University, it gave only diplomas, but now the University grants degrees whilst retaining the power of giving diplomas. A number of Universities, such as Dublin and Edinburgh, do not require the B.A. degree for the M.B. Witness does not therefore see why Indian students should be required to pass the B.A. examination before coming up for the M.B. examination. The only object is to secure a better knowledge of English, and there is not very much difference in so far as English is concerned between an F.A. and a B.A.

Witness would abandon the L.M.S. diploma. If the B.A. qualification is to be retained the change should be gradual, and it should be notified that after five years no one will be admitted to the Medical College who has not taken a degree. The Registrar of the University said, on a reference being made to him, that about 100 B.A.s graduate in the Punjab every year. With reference to this witness said that many of the students of the Medical College come from outside the province.

It is a distinct hardship on the medical student who happens to be plucked in one subject to be called upon to again pass in all the subjects. He should be required to appear again only in that subject in which he failed. This is the rule in the English and Scotch Universities, and there is no reason why the Indian students should not be given the same privilege. If a student obtains very low marks in the subject in which he was plucked, he should be referred back to the college for a year, otherwise he should be required to rejoin the college for only three months.

Re-examination in one subject.

WITNESS No. 14 —DR. M. A. STEIN, PH. D., Inspector of Schools, Rawalpindi Circle.

(Paper No. 14 in Part II)

Witness looks upon educational problems in India from an historical point of view because his interest in India is largely antiquarian. The Indians have inherited notions of thought and the more one studies them the more one sees the difficulty of early translation. The education of India in western knowledge is one of the great incidents in the history of culture. It is similar to what Japan is doing for itself and what the Greeks did for Egypt. One never knows how much time will be allowed for the purpose and the machinery should therefore be as perfect as possible. In India it has not been done so well as in the system which Japan has worked with such marvellous effect. Japan has succeeded one might almost say within living memory, in building up, in the Imperial University of Tokio, an academic institution which, by reason of its scholarly activity, the alumni it has trained, and its remarkable success in the diffusion of Western culture and science, has gained a distinguished place among the universities of the world. It is an eloquent fact that more original research work in Sanskrit literature has been achieved by Japan in the last twenty years than by India in the last hundred years.

There are historical reasons why India should have been less successful. Love of research and thorough application to study are ancient characteristics of India, but European methods are diametrically opposed to those of India and must be brought to bear in their highest form, and not in the form of the school teaching which is now given under the term of University Education. The best opportunity has not yet been given to India, and will not be until there is a cessat on of more teaching on text-books and professors are obtained and a system of the highest type is made obligatory on all colleges. In suggesting an improvement of the collegiate system witness does not mean to imply that that is the best system, but it is useless to hope for a system like the teaching University of Tokio. There should be a model institution in each province to show what European research is like. In the meantime the colleges are necessary as a preparation for education, although they do not correspond to the highest aims of University work. A European student would say that it is not University work but intellectual manuring. The colleges and communities are fit for their preparatory work and are doing it effectively, but it is only the State or a University under the State that could supply higher instruction. For at least the M.A., and preferably for the B.A. also, attendance at such University lectures should be compulsory, and the students would then gain some idea of what European science means. Indians reason to some extent on different lines from Europeans, for instance in the case of the notion that India never changes. It is only by the highest teaching that students can be brought to see that India does change. Indian boys often cannot understand what is axiomatic to an English school boy. An Indian student cannot see that the quotation must be later than the authority. Such things show a want of adequate instruction. There is enthusiasm for Sanskrit in India but no time or opportunity for research, and hence even in this matter India has been outstripped by Japan. Research and high academic teaching mean the same thing. With the materials which exist in India to get the best results, the methods must be taught, the results are less important. Professors should teach by example as well as by precept. It is hopeless to think of making such a start in this direction as has been made in Japan. The Tokio Calendar shows 48 professors to 300 pupils. It is by such intense work that a University succeeds. There is the wish in India but the progress is far slower. The most intense form of instruction that is obtainable should be given. There are professors in the colleges capable of doing it but the opportunity is wanting.

Oriental classes should take the place of Latin and Greek in Europe. Syed Hossain Bilgrami supported an education in English and a classical language. Witness said it is useless to encourage the study of classics on the traditional lines unless

the State is prepared to give emoluments and support. The other alternative is study on purely European lines. Syed Hossain Bilgrami then asked what is the academic value of a course of English and a classical language only. Witness replied that it would require an exceptional man to benefit by it. Very few would have the mental energy to utilise their knowledge of English to acquaint themselves with European methods and culture. It would require the very best brain, and then the student would repent that he had not received a more thorough training. It would be a good plan to give stipends to Pandits to induce them to study European culture.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—You have spoken of a difference between the reasoning faculty of the European and that of the Indian mind. Are not the methods

Characteristics of Indian students.
and processes of human reasoning fundamental in their nature and common to all races of mankind?

Witness.—By no means, nations are as peculiar for mental as for other habits, and the human brain often works quite differently in different orders of civilisation. What is clear logic in one country may seem hazy speculation in another. For instance, take a subject like History which to the Western mind is primarily based upon the scientific investigation of the precise order in which important events have occurred. The European student seeks to prove chronology almost as one would prove a proposition of Euclid, and he collects and co-ordinates innumerable detached pieces of evidence with tireless industry and patience. The Indian mind is not concerned in the least to prove anything, and accepts uncritically the dogmatic chronology taught by ancient books or oral tradition. Worse than this, the Indian student is not even sensible of the logical force of evidence when it is produced before him. If I take two ancient Indian authors; if I point out to the Indian student that one author frequently alludes to the other author; and if I argue that the author who makes such allusions must obviously have lived and written at some period subsequent to the author who is alluded to, the student will be as

unfortunate product of many centuries of blind veneration for dogmatic teaching; it is the result of the inherent and deeply ingrained habit in the Hindu of delivering up his mind in absolute trust to his *guru*, it is the outcome of countless generations of intellectual self-suppression.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—It is your complaint then, that a European teacher who argues, however convincingly in the logical sense, against inherited doctrine, fails to drive his conclusions into the student's mind?

Witness.—Not altogether. My point is that the student usually accepts any teaching from his recognised instructors only too readily, not because their arguments conquer him, but because it is part of his nature never to offer the least critical resistance, I would much rather see a boy deny my teaching intelligently than swallow it unintelligently.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—The Indian mind in your opinion is unlike other minds in being incapable of exercising the reasoning faculty on logical and critical lines?

Witness.—I do not say that the Indian student cannot, but rather that he does not, exhibit intellectual independence, and that it is the ancient indigenous system of subordination to the *guru* that is the cause. It does not occur to a Hindu that he ought to be able to give a reason for the faith that is in him.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—What particular article of faith for example is a Hindu not able to give a reason for?

Witness.—No Hindu, and for that matter no man, can give any reason for believing in the transmigration of souls. That doctrine is taught dogmatically and is accepted implicitly and without reflection. It is this, I maintain, that marks the essential difference between the Indian boy and the European boy. In this country boys do not start life with the same splendid mental inheritance

which gives European boys the advantage. The European habit of coolly and confidently referring every point to the ultimate arbitrament of the inner judgement is entirely wanting in the Indian.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—Are we to understand that you are speaking from personal knowledge of Indian students?

Witness.—Otherwise I should speak much less confidently. For eleven years I was Principal of the Oriental College, Lahore, and during that time I often tried to strike sparks of reasoning from the minds of my students by putting forward in a carefully impartial way difficult questions for them to decide, or by confronting them with a variety of conflicting opinions and asking them which particular opinion they would prefer to adopt; but almost invariably the answer would be, "What is your opinion, Sir?" or "What do you wish us to believe about it, Sir?" Hence—to sum the matter up—the task which I conceive lies before the Indian Universities, a task I know most difficult to accomplish, but the only one in my opinion that is worth attempting from the standpoint of intellectual culture, is to supplant the indigenous methods of teaching, which are essentially dogmatic and non-logical, by the Western methods, which are essentially inquisitive and reasoning.

The Indian brain is capable but after the manuring process is over it is left unaided. Some Indians have done great things and are respected in Europe. Dr. Bhandarkar is an instance. His success is due to a Professor of the Poona College who instructed him in the method of study.

The Chinese system of elaborate examinations which has grown up in India is demoralising. In China it is indigenous and is likely to be altered on the model of Japan.

Examinations

The Oriental College though not doing the higher work alluded to above

The Oriental College

fulfils a useful function in supplying schools with teachers. In inspecting schools, witness has noticed that the Oriental College men teach much better than the men educated on traditional lines. It is a kind of oriental training college and if it were abolished there would be a sudden fall in the classical teaching in schools. It would be desirable to develop the pedagogic side of the College. The abolition of the college would lead within five years to the opening of an oriental side to the training college. Witness cannot say if it would be a less expensive arrangement. Many institutions in which the love of Sanskrit is much paraded

Sanskrit School's.

do not give such good instruction. Boys are in such institutions supposed to read texts without grammatical preparation. One cannot blame the institutions—the study is impossibly long on traditional lines. The result is that the instruction is neither on the ancient or the modern system. The moral texts may do the boys good, but the course does not train them to be teachers. Witness has been shocked by the condition of the teaching in some of these schools and the success of the scholars in the examinations shows how bad these latter are. Schools pass boys high in the Middle School and Entrance Examinations who are absolutely unfit to pass, knowing nothing of their subjects. The low paid examiners fail to understand their responsibility. The teachers know the condition of things quite well but they have not the time to teach by the old methods nor the knowledge to teach by the new.

There is much forcing of students. Not enough time is given and there is a

University Teaching

desire to pass a large number and a belief that this means good work. If the Universities reduced their numbers and turned out a few men who could work on western methods they could do more good. Intensiveness not expansiveness is required. The Japan University has few students and yet it has already made its mark. The needful training cannot be given to a mass of men, it requires the immediate direction of experts. Institutions have been allowed to grow up and expand without any heed being paid to the standard of instruction.

If the Indian Government had continued to develop the colleges instead of founding Universities, they would have by this time have obtained real teaching Universities in Calcutta, Madras and Bombay. To think that popular enthusiasm will create sound learning is to disregard all historical experience. Careful control and supervision are needed.

The amount of grammar required in the B.A. course is sufficient. The traditional grammar could not be prescribed, its study takes too long. It would not be advisable to insist on the study of a portion in order to show the method of treatment. That would introduce both systems, and it would require an exceptional brain to study both. Mr. Justice Banerjee enquired whether witness approved of including a portion of the *Rig Veda* in the B.A. course. Witness replied that it is not absolutely necessary, but is very useful. It brings the change in language and ideas home to the student. If they are allowed to retain the notions they get from the pandits then there will be the confusion of ideas discussed above. That there has always been change can only be brought home to the student by intensive teaching. The presentation of different interpretations to the student is interesting from the point of view of experimental psychology. It aids in inducing the Indian brain to discriminate and to realise that authority must not necessarily be accepted.

It is at present difficult to get the right type of Sanskrit Professors for the colleges. It is different in Southern India. There are historical reasons for this difference. The Punjab has suffered greatly from the breach of continuity in its traditional studies resulting from the Muhammadan occupation. In consequence there is great artificiality. It is easier to introduce European than traditional methods of teaching.

WITNESS NO. 15.—A. S. HERMMY, Esq., B A. (Cantab.), M.Sc. (Melbourne)
Professor of Science, Government College, Lahore.

Witness presented a written statement (Paper No. 15 in Part II).

Research in an Indian University is a matter more for the future than for the present, but the question of good teaching is one which is most pertinent to the Commission. The system of teaching in India is most unsatisfactory. The University settles the curriculum and the colleges have to accept it and have very little to say in the matter. What is wanted is teachers who have not to consider examinations. The students should be taught how to think not to memorise and draw conclusions from the examination papers of previous years. Now they pour out the facts they have accumulated on the examination papers and then forget all about them. The book work for an examination is inevitably forgotten, but one may hope that the student will retain the method of thought in which he is trained. The subjects learnt are of little use in after-life, but if the student has been taught to think much will have been gained.

For these reasons witness desires to see a system of good University instruction. The University professors should not teach the Honours men only, they should give instruction to all. To pass men they should teach the principles of their subjects and they should consider not the examination, but the capacity of the students to whom they are lecturing.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—Why should the ordinary University course not be taught in this way?

Witness.—The college work will be supplementary to the University work; the University teaching should be of a different class and should disregard the necessary evil of examinations.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—Cannot students be taught to think while they were studying for examinations?

Witness.—They are not at present. The professors can put them through the examination, but are not qualified to instil the spirit of the subject into them.

Mr. Pedler.—Is the science syllabus laid down in such a way as to debar the professor from a sensible system of teaching?

Witness.—It has been improved. There is now a syllabus and a number of recommended text-books. The first examination under the new system will take place next year. But definitions of curricula cannot do everything.

The plan proposed by witness is similar to the Cambridge system of professors and college coaches. At Cambridge there is only a slender attendance at the University lectures. For one thing there are so many good lectures, and for another the students are not encouraged to attend.

With a curriculum and examinations, however admirable they may be, there must be cramming and hence it is very desirable to have a body of lecturers unconnected with the examinations. The scheme will by no means do away with the need for colleges. At Cambridge much of the teaching in the Science side is done by the University. All the Colleges cannot provide their own laboratories and much of the work is therefore done in the University laboratories and theatre. At the same time there are college lectures and extensive coaching.

The Melbourne University affords a more exact analogy. It started with a system of professors and no colleges, and provision was made for colleges that might arise in the future. There is now a complete series of University professors and also three colleges supported by religious bodies. About half the students belong to one or other of the colleges, notwithstanding that they have to pay higher fees. The part played by the colleges is mainly in connection with coaching, moral and religious training and the social and athletic side of the University. The college teaching is supplementary to that of the University professors.

It is said to be necessary to give students six lectures a week in each subject. If that is the case a division of labour will be a great advantage and the University lectures will supplement those given in the college. It has been argued that the appointment of University professors will lower the status of the colleges. That is not the case. The University work will be above the present college work.

The University cannot bear the expense of maintaining a professoriate. But for the Middle School Examination the Punjab University would already be bankrupt. Private liberality also cannot be relied on, especially as it seems attracted at present to the provision of new Colleges for different sections of the community. This extension of collegiate work will not further the cause of sound learning unless there is a central body of teachers to give an intellectual tone. The Government is the only possible source of funds, and as it would probably object to a large increase of expenditure on higher education witness would propose that the Government colleges should be done away with, their existing staffs becoming the first University professors.

Dr. Mackichan.—The staff has been recruited for a definite purpose, can you assume that it can act at once as a University professoriate and that it is fit for the work of higher teaching.

Witness.—A large proportion are fit and the balance might be utilised as inspectors. On the whole the intellectual qualifications of the members of the Indian Educational Service are higher than those of the staffs of other colleges. (Dr. Mackichan said that this is not the case in Bombay)

Part of the work of the University professors might be the delivery of weekly lectures in colleges.

If suitable affiliation rules are introduced no difficulty with regard to private candidates will arise.

Alternative schemes for improving teaching. Three schemes have been suggested for the improvement of teaching—

- (1) Inter-collegiate lectures. This scheme implies equality among the colleges, whereas in fact, they are most unequal. The extent to which this is the case may be realised by comparing the enormous difference in the annual outlay in different colleges. For an inter-collegiate system the colleges must be approximately equal or some colleges would be besieged by all students without getting anything in return.
- (2) The best professors in the various colleges to be called University professors and to teach Honours men, the Government supplying substitutes. This does not provide higher teaching independent of examinations, and would be difficult to work because of the very small number of Honours men.
- (3) The scheme suggested by witness.

Another point of difference between witness and Dr Stratton is that the latter says that candidates for Honours in any subject but English should be required to take the Pass course in English. Witness would allow a candidate to take up that course previous to his taking up Honours either in his third or fourth year, leaving the fifth year free for the special work. The main difference between the Honours course and the M.A. would be one of teaching.

Syed Hossein Bilgrami.—Do you think that the M.A. student is not well taught?

Witness.—He only gets one year to concentrate his attention. Until he finishes the B.A. he is kept with all the dullards of the B.A. class. Honours men should be given three years in which they can work separately.

There must be a separate Honours class and a separate body of teachers for it. A system of Honours which is simply an enlarged Pass course is not worth having. It means quite as much trouble as a complete Honours course with men working separately all the time, whilst the students do not get so much advantage.

Affiliation should not be merely up to a certain standard, the subjects permitted to be taught should also be specified. If a college wishes to extend its curriculum it should make a fresh application to the University.

The qualifications of any new member of the staff of a college should be considered by the Syndicate or a body appointed by the Syndicate, previous to his appointment, and no appointment to an affiliated college should be made without the approval of the Syndicate, otherwise a college might start well and gradually degenerate. If a teaching University be maintained according to witness' scheme, then the conditions of affiliation need not be so strict as when each college does its own teaching. It would not be undue interference and the supervision would be an advantage for the smaller colleges. Referring to the method of recruiting the Indian Educational Service, witness said that whether a teaching University be appointed or not, appointments in the Department should be advertised, and if that were done, there would never be any instances of men whose qualifications the University would dispute.

Mr. Justice Banerjee — Might not the object you have in view be equally well served if the rule required affiliated colleges simply to report the appointment of a Professor leaving the University authorities to say whether they would accept it or not.

Witness — That comes practically to the same thing. If the University is to have the power to reject a man is it not better that it should be done before a man is appointed? The amount of interference would seem very much greater if a man is turned out after he has been appointed.

There should be a central building for University teaching in Lahore. In the case of Punjab concentration would be less difficult than in other places, as the large majority of the students are in Lahore, and the Lahore colleges are adjacent to one another. The time table might be so arranged that a second year student should attend University lectures on Mondays, Wednesdays and Fridays, leaving him the other days free to study in his own college.

The Senate.

There should be four classes of Senators—

(1) Ex-officio.

(2) Nominees of the Local Government. These should consist of such men only whose opinions on educational matters it is advisable to have. Men should not be given a voice in the University on account of their social position or of their being benefactors unless their opinion would really be of advantage to the University. If it is advisable to have such Fellows, they should be Honorary Fellows with no voting powers and should not be appointed to any Faculty.

(3) Persons elected by the staffs of affiliated colleges. Assuming all the teachers of affiliated colleges are recognised, then certainly they should be allowed to appoint delegates from amongst themselves.

(4) Persons elected by the general body of graduates of higher standing than B.A.'s. As to the exact qualifications of graduates witness has no very strong opinion. Some consider that B.A.'s. of 10 years' standing should be allowed to vote. Witness has no objection to that. There is a strong objection against the system originally adopted in the Punjab University of the Senate adding to their number by election. The Senate should consist either of representatives of some community or body, or else advisers to the University. Men elected by the Senate do not represent anyone in particular except perhaps the leading section in the Senate.

A very large Senate is not required at present, because the number of people in the Punjab capable of forming a reliable opinion on higher educational matters is not very large. As a purely tentative measure witness proposes that the number should be 100 or 150. In order that the number may not be exceeded, existing Fellows, unless re-nominated or elected, should be made Honorary Fellows with power to be present at Senate meetings, but without a vote and without a place on any Faculty. Witness said he did not think it would be

avidious to invite them to meetings without a vote. Their principal function at present is as a rule merely to attend. They very seldom have a voice in any matter. Fellows of the University to be appointed in the future should not be made Darbaris. Fellows as such should be given no privileges outside the University.

With regard to the constitution of the Syndicate the only alteration witness would propose is that if University Professors are to be appointed they should be allowed to elect certain of their number to the Syndicate. Further, the Director of Public Instruction ought to be an *ex-officio* member of the Syndicate.

The system of Boards of Studies in the Punjab University needs remodelling. At present there is a Board of Studies for each Faculty. In consequence of this, if a man taking science for the Arts degree has anything to complain of, instead of the matter being brought before the Science Faculty it is brought before the Arts Faculty. What is needed is Boards of Studies for each subject or group of subjects. The number of men competent to act on Boards of Studies in the Punjab is not very large and therefore it will probably be advisable to group certain subjects together.

With regard to the teaching of Science there seems to be in India too little practical work. In the Punjab certain alterations have recently been made and when the new regulations come into force, every student taking the B. A. degree will have to undergo a really practical examination in Science. The regulations in the past apparently implied this, but there seems to be a belief in India generally that oral examinations can take the place of practical examinations in Science and that ascertaining from a student how he would do a thing is as good a test as making him do it. Anyone who knows anything of Science knows that that is ridiculous. It is certainly the case that the practical examinations of the Punjab University in Physics are a farce, and with regard to Chemistry, the practical examinations here as everywhere else, except at Allahabad, are of very little value. Under the new scheme for the B. A. degree of the Punjab University a student in Chemistry will be required to prepare simple inorganic salts and to do some simple volumetric analysis and a little testing. Practical examinations for the Intermediate with the large number of candidates are at present impracticable. Endeavour is being made to make the oral examination as practical as possible. The examination for the Entrance is an oral examination. There the numbers are quite unmanageable. If the oral examinations were given up students would never even see a piece of apparatus, and it may do them some good even to get this slight acquaintance with practical work.

It is very difficult to make practical examinations an efficient test. Witness would be inclined to require that a student should send in a list of the experiments he has performed which should be signed by the teacher as a guarantee of good faith. At any rate this should be done in the case of Physics. The allotment of marks for practical examinations is a great mistake, because it is very difficult to adjust the marks equitably. There should be no marks; a student should simply pass or fail in his practical examination. Owing to the small number of Honours men, it would perhaps be possible to classify them. They might be divided into three or four classes, but marks should not be allotted.

Dr. Caleb raised the question whether any outside examination could be substituted for the preliminary Scientific Examination for the M. B. Looking somewhat superficially into the Calendar for the purpose of judging of the relative merits of the Intermediate Science and the Preliminary Scientific, it appeared to witness that in Physics the standard for the Preliminary Scientific is much the same as that for the Intermediate Science, but that in Chemistry it is higher as it includes a considerable amount of organic Chemistry which is not included in the Intermediate Science Examination. It is, however, less than the

Preliminary Science for medical students
amount of Chemistry required for the B. Sc. Under these circumstances the Intermediate cannot take the place of the preliminary Scientific Examination but a student taking the B. Sc. or the science side of the B. A. has quite as

much knowledge as is required for the Preliminary Scientific Examination and should therefore be exempted from passing it. There is no reason for separating the teaching; it is not done in any University in England. There Medical students mix with Art students and they learn their Physics and Chemistry together. Besides this separation entails upon the Medical Colleges the expense of providing lecturers in Chemistry and Physics. In the Medical College there should however be classes in Physiological Chemistry, including Toxicology, that is to say, there should be lectures by the Professor of Chemistry on Toxicology at the Medical College. In the preliminary scientific course there must also be some elementary Biology, but upon that subject witness is not competent to speak.

The Entrance Examination for Science as apart from Arts is practically a dead letter, because students can take up the Entrance in Arts, and then go on to the Intermediate Science. If it is not a dead letter, it ought to be. It serves no good purpose. Witness has no personal knowledge of what the practical examination for this Examination is, except that it is an ordinary oral examination, probably more difficult than that for Arts. That paper shown to witness by Dr. Bourne would be a practical examination if conducted properly.

Science Course.

The Intermediate examination in Science as far as Physics and Chemistry are concerned is the same as that for the Intermediate Arts. Candidates have appeared for it.

The B. Sc. has been held only in Mathematics and Astronomy this year. There have as yet been no examinations in the other subjects. There is no proposal before the University to remove any portion of the Science from the B. A. in consequence of the introduction of Science degree.

There is a tendency at present for the formation of numerous local colleges. In the Punjab, there are three colleges in Lahore with 866 students and nine colleges up-country with 286, giving the latter an average of about 30 students each, and of these nine colleges three have been established recently.

Small colleges

The calibre of the students in the small colleges is inferior and such colleges cannot afford the best class of staff. If it is desired to coach students it is rather an advantage to have small colleges, but good coaches are not always to be found in such colleges. If colleges have large endowments then they get a large number of students. Of the nine colleges referred to, four teach up to the B.A. Provided there was a staff of University teachers, it would be a positive advantage to have small colleges, at present it is a disadvantage.

Multiplication of colleges.

Syed Hossein Bilgrami—If they had good teachers, would not small colleges be an advantage.

Witness—They have not good teachers. The method of their formation is against them. In most cases small colleges commence by adding classes to High Schools and they have the same class of teachers for the Intermediate class that they have for the school class. That is one reason why the work needs strengthening. The student's mind is not formed by being brought into contact with men of great attainments. University professors and college lecturers are both needed in such cases.

Witness said that subject to certain reservations he agreed with Dr. Stratton in the matter of Honours Degrees. The Honours course should extend for three years after the Intermediate Examination?

Honours Degree

Syed Hossein Bilgrami.—In that case what difference will there be between the M.A. and the Honours.

Witness.—The difference will be that the Honours man will be separated from the Pass man after the Intermediate and will have three years' special work. The M.A. degree should be given to a man who takes Honours without any further examination. For all Pass examinations whether for the B.A. or the M.A., there should be no classification or order of merit. It should be either "passed" or "failed," but in the case of Honours men there should be classification. Witness would still keep the M.A. in order that Pass men may have an opportunity of entering for it.

WITNESS NO. 16—The REVD H C VELTE, M A, Vice-Principal and Professor of English, Forman Christian College, Lahore

(Paper No. 16 in Part II)

There are two ways in which a Teaching University may be established (1) by direct teaching in institutions maintained by the University and by University lecturers and Professors and (2) by the affiliation of colleges in such a way that they may become an integral part of the University. As regards (1) the Punjab University is in a certain sense already a teaching University, and as regards (2) it is purely an examining body and has never attempted to be anything further or higher than this. The question then arises whether it is desirable at present to extend the operation of the University in the line of direct teaching. With regard to that witness would say emphatically "No." In the first place there are more important things to be done. The most urgent of these is the affiliation of colleges with the University that is to bring the Punjab University into line with the other Indian Universities. In the second place a teaching University is not needed in the Punjab. It is doubtful whether there is material for it, and if it were established it could only be a very small affair. If anything is to be attempted in the direction of a research institute it would be far better to have a single institution for all India such as the John Hopkins University of America. The experiment would show whether it would be possible to have a teaching University or a research institute in other places. The success of the Punjab University in this line has not been such as to justify it in desiring at present to undertake anything further. A great deal has been said in depreciation of the work done in colleges and of the Indian students, and that depreciation is not deserved. There are some poor specimens of students who derive little benefit from the education they receive but there are also a very large number of excellent men and all that is necessary is to get hold of them and use the material well. Indian students compare very favourably with students elsewhere considering their conditions. The President suggested that the University might, as far as teaching up to the B A is concerned rely mainly on raising the standard in colleges by proper rules of affiliation but that after the B A the University might itself undertake the instruction of advanced students. Witness said he quite agreed with those who said that the M A course should be an Honours course but he is of opinion that the work should be done in the Colleges. This year for the first time an M A class has been opened in the Forman College. The result has been exceedingly encouraging. The higher work of teaching will be rendered most efficient by strengthening the Colleges. More men are needed. The staffs of colleges are too small for the work to be done and the men now engaged in general work have no leisure for advanced work. If one or two men were added to each college then advanced work might be done.

A division of labour between the colleges is possible in the M A course and also to some extent in the lower classes. For instance in the Faculty of Science the number of students is very small. This year they numbered only 30 in the Entrance Examination of the Science Faculty. Of this number about 15 will pass and not more than 8 or 10 will enter college. There are now two institutions carrying on work for the F Sc. This is a waste of labour and a very heavy expense. The University should not take up this work, but the colleges should combine and do it amongst themselves. The Professors would still remain connected with their own colleges. There would of course have to be an adjustment of fees. The University might arrange these combinations as soon as it comes into some sort of relation with the colleges. Again, affiliation must be the first step.

An arrangement such as is proposed above is certainly possible between two colleges. Witness is not sure whether it will be possible to form groups of more than two. In the M A class it would probably be possible for one college to take up History, another Philosophy, another Physics and Chemistry and thus the work might be divided.

Witness believes in the principle of election and thinks it should be reintroduced. It exists in theory, but is a

Election of Fellows.

dead-letter. In his note witness suggested that the representation should be by Faculties. He would change that and say that it should be by colleges. The staff of each college should be allowed to elect a member to the Senate. The same privilege should be extended to the graduates, or rather to the graduates' association, of each college. Witness is not in favour of extending it to the general body of graduates. There are a great many objections, one is that many graduates are not brought into touch with college life. They entered as private students and do not know each other. Then again there is the danger of canvassing. All this would be avoided if Fellows were elected by the graduates' association of each college. These graduates' associations have been formed in connection with nearly all the colleges in Lahore and they meet during the year at certain times. The Principal of the College is Patron of the Association and the graduates are in close touch with the college and college life. They would therefore be sure to make a good choice, and the men who represented them would be a credit to the college and useful to the University. There would not be any danger whatsoever in introducing this scheme. The same number of representatives should not be given to each college; representation should be proportionate to the membership of the association or the number of graduates. That is a detail which could be worked out afterwards. The privilege should be given to every college affiliated to the University. If a college teaches only up to the F.A. and has no graduates it could not return a member to the Senate.

Witness agrees with all that has been said about cramming. The evil exists

Examinations and cramming

and is on the increase. When one comes to consider the causes of cramming one is still very much in the dark. Many different causes have been mentioned and one of these is insufficient knowledge of English. The knowledge of English which students have when they join the college is inadequate, but this alone is not the cause of cramming. It may be a cause of cramming in the colleges to a very large extent, but scarcely to any considerable extent in the schools. Then again the blame is thrown upon the schools and of course upon the teachers in the schools and the training they have received. Witness has had some experience of school work, having been in charge of a school for two years, and he does not agree with this opinion. If there was anything to be proud of in the Punjab it is the existence of a corps of good and well trained teachers, and their number is increasing every year. Witness has been brought into personal contact with them and knows something of their methods of work, and he does not think the fault lies with the teachers or with their training. His own view is that there is something which interferes with the teachers' work and he believes it is to be found in the examination system. It is owing to this system that teachers, in spite of themselves are unable to educate men. A boy has to be prepared for the public and competitive examinations of the Government and the University and in this way a great deal of the time and energy of the boy himself and of his teacher are wasted. The teacher is helpless in the matter. Unless his results in the examinations are good he is found fault with, becomes unpopular with the boys, with their parents and perhaps with the management and those under whom he holds his appointment. In this is to be found the true cause of cramming and unsatisfactory education.

The remedy is to do away with all university examinations in schools. The

School management.

middle school examination might certainly be done away with. There was a time when it served a purpose, but it no longer does so. The Entrance Examination as it now is should also be abolished. If this were done the teacher would have a chance to educate his boys. Witness would place the schools entirely in the hands of the Department and of the Inspectors. There should be efficient and thorough supervision and inspection and all examinations in schools and promotions should be left to the teachers under the supervision of the Inspectors. Thus the responsibility would be thrown upon the teacher and his position would be raised and he would have ample opportunity to do real teaching work.

In place of the Matriculation examination there should be a final examination for schools with a certificate signed by the Head Master and countersigned by the Inspector to show that the boy has been educated up to a certain standard and has finished his course in school. Such certificates should be regarded as equivalent to those of the present Entrance examination. A great deal of the examination should be done by the school itself but the Department should also have a share in it. For those seeking admission to college there should be a separate Entrance Examination to be held by the University. The schools should be completely dissevered from the University.

In the 4th paragraph of witness' memorandum it is stated that only about one sixth of those who pass the Entrance examination take up a University course. The correct proportion is about one-third to one-fourth.

The University Entrance Examination should be made a much more thorough test in English. A great many candidates now get through in English who ought not to pass. Special importance should be attached to a working knowledge of English sufficient for comprehension and expression.

Mr Justice Banerjee said that such a knowledge of English should be required of all boys at the end of their school course and this being so he wished to know what was the use in having two Examinations when one would suffice.

Witness replied that it will have this advantage that it will give a student more time to think before he is called upon to exercise his option. All the boys will have to go through the school final examination and then the $\frac{1}{2}$ or $\frac{1}{4}$ who wish to go on to the University will have to go through a public examination—the matriculation—at a later stage and in that examination they might confine themselves to the particular subjects requisite for University life.

President—The practical question is rather this. Do you think a Government or a merchant's office can accept a Head Master's certificate, unless given after a test in English which is practically equivalent to the test in the Entrance examination?

Witness—That depends entirely upon what the Government would choose to do in the matter.

President—Would a Government office or a merchant's office be likely to accept this school final examination as worth anything at all?

Witness—That would depend on the school from which the boy comes. If it has a reputation for giving a good education its certificate would be valued by the Government and private firms. Besides the school examination will be conducted under the Inspector of the Division.

It would certainly require an increase in the staff of Inspectors to conduct these examinations. There would have to be one for every one or two districts. At present there are about four or five districts under one Inspector. It is impossible for him to do all the work. The President said that in England the University Board sends examiners to examine the schools. They examine and mark the papers and forward them to a central place where they are moderated to see that all the examiners are adopting the same standard. The University then accepts the certificate as equivalent to its preliminary examinations. Witness thought that such a scheme might possibly be workable.

The Punjab University has been held up as a model in this respect that it does not appoint teachers as examiners, but gets its examiners from distant parts of India such as Allahabad and Bombay. This is one of the weakest points in the whole examination system. It has many disadvantages. First of all those who are appointed to examine very often do not know the standard, this has occurred again and again. As regards the setting of papers an attempt has been made to get over the difficulty by model papers but witness does not think they have served any very good purpose. Again Examiners not knowing the standards make great mistakes in the valuation of the papers. About two years ago an examiner was appointed from Calcutta for a certain examination and when his results came in it was found that about 300 to 350 candidates had failed.

Teachers as Examers.

and that only 19 had passed. The mistake occurred in this way. The examiner did not carefully read his instructions and he thought the pass percentage was 25 or 33, whereas it was 40. He thought he was passing many whom he was not passing. The question an examiner really sets himself is whether a man is fit to pass or not without regard to any percentage of marks.

It would be possible to get rid of a good deal of the unsatisfactory cram work in colleges if teachers were allowed to examine their students. A scheme has been proposed with regard to this which would meet the views of the witness.

WITNESS NO 17—The REV D J H ORRISON, M A, M. D., Professor of Biology, Forman Christian College, Lahore.

(Paper No. 17 in Part II)

It is properly the province of the Vice-Chancellor and the heads of colleges

Affiliation of colleges

to deal with this subject. Witness is very much in favour of some scheme by which the University may come into closer contact with all colleges sending up men for its examinations. General supervision by the University of the Colleges should be secured. The annual reports from the various institutions should be overhauled or perhaps there should be committees of visitation appointed by the Senate. There would be popular feeling against the Syndicate doing this, and there might be in the Syndicate too large a representation of one particular interest. The Chairman of the Committee might be one of the Inspectors.

With regard to Teaching Universities a line of demarcation should be drawn

Teaching University

between undergraduate and post graduate work and the University should take in hand the post graduate work and provide for a more comprehensive and broader scope of teaching, both intensively and extensively. Undergraduate work should be left largely in the hands of colleges.

It should be recognised that each college has its own individuality its own traditions, its own type or ideal to which it wishes to attain and in accordance with which it wishes to train its men. There is a certain *esprit de corps* which each college wishes to maintain and that ought not to be interfered with.

The question of an Honours Course, as is the case in most of these matters,

Honours Course.

has its *pros* and *cons* and again there is a choice of alternatives, and it is necessary to consider to which alternative there is the least objection and which is the most workable of the various schemes. There are certain schemes which have been proposed which are very beautiful on paper, but it is doubtful whether they are feasible in practice. There is a tendency to plant in exotic taken from the antipodes in the soil of India without much regard to the principles of heredity and environment. It is rather incongruous for instance to take a full fledged University scheme ready made in Germany and plant it in India without regard to the condition of the people or the stage of civilisation at which they have arrived. However much one may like professorial work, one must recognise that in India they have not got much beyond the tutorial stage for undergraduates. For the present the best graduate course should be considered as virtually the Honours Course. Very few of the students are competent to take up an Honours Course and there are objections to separating the brightest men from the others. Candidates who distinguish themselves in the ordinary B. A. examination might be considered to have passed with Honours. Or Honours students might be given a special paper a little severer or wider than the rest. The Calcutta system would seem to be sound. For classical languages students might go to a Central oriental institution and for higher degrees in science they might go to a Central School of science but witness would not like to extend that principle very far. Too much stress is laid upon specialisation. The Punjabi has not come to the stage yet where he can usefully specialise in any subject. A few men who are able to do so might perhaps have their chance after passing the B. A., but witness is not in favour of a man specialising before that stage. Students in India have not the general training which is given in the West, but they were gradually working up to it. From decade to decade there is an improvement in the men passing through the schools and colleges.

Examinations are the core of some of the difficulties of the University.

Examinations

Something substantial should be done to lessen the strain on students and professors which results from the striving to pass the examinations. It deadens their enthusiasm and deprives them of elasticity and freshness.

President.—Is there not also a danger of the students idling and making up for past neglect by cramming just before the examination?

Witness.—That is not the case. The majority of the best men tell me about the strain upon them.

The number of public examinations should be diminished. The Middle School examination should be a private examination and at the end of the school course there should be a departmental examination. There should be a public matriculation examination for all those who wish to go up to the University. It should be held by the University.

For the B A the examinations should be held locally by Professors. Marks should not be published and candidates should be placed alphabetically in classes instead of in order of merit.

The courses of reading should be a little shorter. They are very wide and they prevent students from doing any general reading. They have to devote themselves to getting up their subjects by means of epitomes, keys and cram books.

Syed Hossain Bilgrami—Would not that be avoided by giving a long but an easy course.

Witness—That is another possible way of doing it. It would be a pity to narrow the course and yet something must be done to make things a little easier and give students more opportunity for the cultivation of their minds.

Mr. Justice Banerjee—In other words you would like to give them more time to think even if it be at the expense of curtailing the amount of their reading.

Witness—Yes

Dr. Mackichan—Would they think?

Mr. Justice Banerjee—They would if they had the time to think.

Witness continuing said that a certain amount of general culture and experience should be regarded as part of the B A. training

It is very desirable that there should be inter-collegiate co-operation in connection with University lectures, debating clubs, the library and sports

Inter-collegiate co operation

Examinations should be held by men on the spot and if possible by those teaching the subject. If it were not too daring *witness* would suggest that each

Examiners

college should decide whether a man is fit to pass the B A or not. Colleges would then find their own level

WITNESS NO. 18, MR H. T. KNOWLTON, PRINCIPAL, CENTRAL TRAINING COLLEGE, LAHORE

(Written statement No 18 in part II)

The percentage of passes in the different examinations does not seem to be quite satisfactory, but witness would like to point out that similar conditions have existed in the London University for the last six years. It seems to be a general phenomenon that there should be a falling off in the percentage of passes as examinations increase in difficulty.

It is important that there should be a Faculty of Pedagogics. Nothing at present is done to encourage teachers to qualify themselves properly for their work. English Universities have taken up this question and several of them have chairs of education and have established examinations in connection with University colleges which give special training in the work of teaching. Witness is not aware that any University has a faculty of Pedagogics. They have Boards of Studies and they hold examinations for teachers but he does not think that they have a special faculty. The reason for suggesting a Faculty of Pedagogy is that if it is left to the Board of Studies very little general interest would be taken in the question. The Faculty should contain a number of teachers who would be deeply interested in the subject.

It appears to be essential that there should be some college of Pedagogy which should be worked in accordance with laws laid down by the University and that this college should have attached to it a school in which teachers may be trained in the art of teaching. The training college has been regarded as a college by the University from its foundation and for the last 20 years the Principal had been *ex officio* a Fellow of the University. The course of study should be drawn up by the University and examinations instead of being conducted as now by the Department should be conducted by the University and students on passing should receive degrees or diplomas. The men admitted to this course of training and subsequently sent up for the examination ought to be graduates—men who have already received a good general education and are therefore competent to take up special work. There would be little difficulty in attracting a number of graduates. At the present time the senior men in the vernacular class of the training college consist chiefly of graduates. Out of 20 at the present time, 13 are graduates. The numbers have been steadily increasing during the last ten years, ten years ago there was only one graduate.

An important result of the change would be that better men would be attracted to the Education Department. It is desirable that the very best class of men should become teachers. The degree of attractiveness must of course also depend upon the pay and it is to be remarked that the pay given in the Education Department compares unfavourably with that given in other Departments. There seems however, to be some prospect that the pay will be better in the Education Department than has hitherto been the case. The highest pay of teachers in schools rises to about Rs. 400. There is one case in which a personal allowance of Rs. 100 is given, making Rs. 500 the highest pay given to a Headmaster of a school.

The course of training should extend over two years. Hitherto it has been a one year's course and that is not sufficient. Men who pass from the college are able more or less to understand English but they have not a sufficient command of English to enable them to express their ideas in that language. There should be much more practical work than at present. No one should be admitted to the examination conducted by the University until he had received a certificate to the effect that he had delivered 100 consecutive lessons so that there might be some guarantee that he had had plenty of practice in handling a large class.

There have been a few M. A.'s in the training college. -

When a man in the training college gives a practical lesson to a class it is always in the presence of the witness or some other member of the staff.

Work in the Training College. Every day there is a criticism lesson. Every week five students from the senior class and five from every other class are picked out to work in the model school. Each of them has to prepare a lesson for the day and gives it in the presence of the class master, and the class master criticises it and reports on the teachers' work to witness.

Witness would not regard the Oriental College as a training college in the same sense as his college. It does not give any instruction in the theory and practice of teaching nor any practical training.

The Oriental College.

Mr. Bell.—Can you co-operate with the Oriental College?

Witness.—Their students might come over to lectures on the theory of teaching, but the difficulty would be with regard to practical work. It would be very difficult to arrange for their work in the model school.

WITNESS NO. 19.—MOULVI HAKIM ALI, B.A., Principal, Islamia College Lahore.

(Written statement No. 19 in Part II.)

It is too soon for the Punjab University to be turned into a teaching University. It is only 20 years old, and as an examining body it has experienced for a long time and is still experiencing difficulties owing to the standards of examination depending upon the will of the examiners. Its work as an examining body should run smoothly for at least 20 years before it is turned into a teaching University.

In the Punjab the number of Fellows is not too large. It may be increased to a maximum of 150. Fellowships should be terminable only by death or retirement and not by the attendance test. In future, Fellowships should be given to persons qualified to advise on or taking an interest in high education and not by way of compliment.

The number of members on the Syndicate should be increased to 30 in order that the colleges may be more adequately represented.

In the Punjab University it would be difficult, if not impossible, to allow the election of graduates as Fellows, without giving rise to much undesirable canvassing. If there is a very strong desire that the principle should be recognised, the experiment may be tried of allowing the election of one graduate (M.A. of five years' or B.A. of ten years' standing) to be elected for every 500 graduates of the University. Candidates should be proposed by the graduates themselves in writing and be elected by a majority of written votes sent in sealed covers to the Registrar.

It is said that the students' knowledge of English is insufficient to enable them to profit by the lectures they attend. There may be some students who begin their University course without a sufficient knowledge of English, but the statement in the "note of points" is "that many students begin their University course without a sufficient knowledge of English, etc." That statement is not well founded. It is the way in which certain professors speak English that prevents students coming fresh from schools from being able to make out what is said, but as soon as they get accustomed to the manner of speaking they understand what is taught to them. This is not the fault of the European professors, but the Indian students are not habituated to their style, and for one or two months they must be trained in that style.

Religions are so divided and feelings are so strong that it would not be desirable to found a school of Theology in the Punjab.

In the affiliation rules the question of tuition fees and the salaries of professors should not be considered and the merits of a college should be judged from the work done and the qualifications of its teaching staff.

A good deal of practical Chemistry and Physics is taught in the Lahore colleges and the practical test for the intermediate examination is thorough.

WITNESS NO. 20.—S. ABDUL QUADIR, B.A., Professor, Islamia College, Lahore, representing the Graduates' Association, Forman Christian College, Lahore.

The remarks made by witness had reference, firstly, to the memorandum submitted by the Graduates' Association of the Forman Christian College (paper No. 20 in part II) and, secondly, to his personal views.

Witness desired, in the first place, to speak in favour of the good work done by the Christian College where he received his education, especially in the direction of religious and moral teaching. The various denominational institutions of the Punjab are doing considerable good in producing deep religious sentiment, engendering, in most cases, a thorough sense of moral responsibility in the minds of the more earnest of the students. But whereas Hindu and Muhammadan and Sikh institutions are proving useful almost exclusively to the communities which they respectively represent, all the different Indian communities owe a great debt of gratitude to missionary educational enterprise, which has succeeded to a very large extent, in producing men of good and sterling worth, with a deep religious feeling. While theoretically the teaching of a foreign religion must be supposed to have an unsettling effect on the minds of students, and expression was given to a belief of this sort by a learned witness yesterday, those who have actually had anything to do with Christian Colleges know that the effect generally is to render the attachment of a student to his own faith deeper by the influence of the earnest example set by the enthusiasm of missionaries for their own cause.

Mission - college. The various denominational institutions of the Punjab are doing considerable good in producing deep religious sentiment, engendering, in most cases, a thorough sense of moral responsibility in the minds of the more earnest of the students. But whereas Hindu and Muhammadan and Sikh institutions are proving useful almost exclusively to the communities which they respectively represent, all the different Indian communities owe a great debt of gratitude to missionary educational enterprise, which has succeeded to a very large extent, in producing men of good and sterling worth, with a deep religious feeling. While theoretically the teaching of a foreign religion must be supposed to have an unsettling effect on the minds of students, and expression was given to a belief of this sort by a learned witness yesterday, those who have actually had anything to do with Christian Colleges know that the effect generally is to render the attachment of a student to his own faith deeper by the influence of the earnest example set by the enthusiasm of missionaries for their own cause.

Towards religious instruction in Government institutions the authorities should continue their present attitude unless they are prepared to introduce religious teaching for representatives of all communities. It could be introduced without much additional expenditure, so far as Hindus and Muhammadans are concerned, by giving some allowance to the present Arabic and Sanskrit Professors for this extra work.

The Oriental College, as the seat of the ancient classical learning of the East making provision for the teaching of Arabic, Sanskrit and Persian, along with the teaching of modern subjects through the medium of the vernaculars, has naturally attracted considerable attention in the statements that have been laid before the Commission. While on the one hand some learned gentlemen have condemned it wholesale, others have insisted on its being maintained, both as a useful institution, supplying a felt want and worked on lines congenial to the tastes of the people of the Province, and as a trust which the University is bound to fulfil. Witness holds the latter view and would be sorry that the College should suffer by any sweeping denunciations of it on the score of its having failed to produce men who have proved successful in life or who have distinguished themselves. To the fairly long list of names mentioned by Professor Arnold yesterday witness added the names of several men distinguished in different walks of life, who have taken almost as much active part in the progress of the country as their fellow graduates of the University on the Arts side. Witness said that in addition to those specially named many former students are distinguishing themselves as pleaders, civil officers, or members of the judicial or the Revenue service. So that the claims of the Oriental College may be based not so much on the ground of serving the purpose of a training college for Oriental teachers for High Schools but on results independent of this consideration.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—You have mentioned some Muhammadan gentlemen who have distinguished themselves. Do you know of any Hindu students of the College who have proved equally successful?

Witness.—No, I do not, though there must be many.

Another circumstance connected with the Oriental College is worthy of attention. It has been complained that it has drained a large portion of the resources of

the University which might well have been devoted to the development of vernacular literature. The College has already contributed its share to this work because some of the members of its staff have been engaged, on their own account, in enriching the vernacular literature and among them may be mentioned Shams-ul Ulama Maulvi Muhammad Hussain *Asad*. He has rendered great service to Urdu literature and has infused a new spirit into it. His works form a main part of the Urdu text-books and have been greatly admired, even outside the Province.

Mr. Justice Banerjee—May I ask what is the peculiarity of the style of *Asad*, whether it is based on Arabic or English?

Witness—His style is simple and he has drawn his inspiration both from oriental and occidental literature. His genius needed only hints to grasp the peculiar beauties of a foreign literature and, though he did not know English, he has produced books highly liked by those who have received an English education.

Mr. Justice Banerjee—Are his works purely literary or has he made any contribution to historical or scientific literature?

Witness—He has written some books of great historical value, such as the "Darbar-i-Akbar," which has been patronised by the Hyderabad Education Department.

Syed Hossain Bilgrami.—The "Darbar-i-Akbar" is a very good and useful book. I consider it as one of the best books in Urdu literature.

It would be an advantage to include the study of modern Arabic and Persian books in the courses in these languages. Arabic literature is making rapid progress in Egypt and India should profit by that progress.

Syed Hossain Bilgrami—You would not include the mongrel Arabic spoken at Cairo in the curriculum of the University?

Witness.—Certainly not, but I would strongly urge the inclusion of the translations of some of the best books on western arts and sciences that have been prepared at Cairo, to supplement and put a new life into the study of the ancient languages of the East in the Punjab University.

It will be of advantage to the University to allow its graduates the privilege of electing a limited number of men from among themselves to serve as Fellows of

Election of fellows.

the University with due regard to considerations of ability, experience and standing. Under existing circumstances it is right that the Government should retain largely in its own hands the power of nominating Fellows, but the time has arrived when graduates as such should be given some recognition in the constitution of the University, and some small proportion of Fellowships should be set apart to be filled by representatives of the graduates. This step, besides satisfying a legitimate aspiration of the graduates, will facilitate the eliciting of the views of the educated classes on educational problems, and will secure their sympathy and co-operation to a very large extent. The way in which this suggestion may best be carried out would be to allow the graduates of every first grade College, that has sent students for the B. A. Degree for not less than five years, the privilege of having one elected representative in the Senate. They should exercise this right by rotation.

In order to promote a more liberal and sound education than is imparted at present, and to arrest the tendency towards cram, it seems desirable that a double

Honours & course.

course of studies be introduced, *viz.*, an Honours course and an ordinary Pass course. The former may lead to an examination more searching than the degree examinations have hitherto been and the latter may provide an easier test than at present for the benefit of those requiring a degree for admission to further professional studies and not aiming at or fitted for literary or scholastic distinction. There are practical difficulties in the way of introducing this scheme, the chief among them being that of expense. This difficulty might be overcome, however, by placing on record the advisability of the scheme and

leaving it to the option of individual Colleges to introduce it, if their funds permit the adoption of the proposal.

As to the question of making the University a teaching body, exercising a direct control over the appointment and recognition of Professors and Teachers, Teaching University and Private Colleges this step, though fraught with possible advantages in respect to the interests of true education, is not feasible under present circumstances in the Punjab and the time has not yet come for the University to assume teaching functions in connection with pre-graduate studies. The plan could not be well tried without running the risk of retarding the progress of the newly established indigenous Colleges, some of which have a special value as denominational institutions, satisfying the religious and moral requirements of particular communities. Especially in the Punjab where education is, comparatively speaking still in its infancy, any step that is likely to be resented as undue interference with individual freedom cannot be recommended. The experiment may be tried to a certain degree by making the University directly responsible for post-graduate studies, and allowing it to supervise and control the teaching in these subjects. There would be no objection if a scheme of University lectures on special subjects for the benefit of all affiliated institutions were adopted in addition to the ordinary class work of the Colleges.

The provision of scholarships for original research, in different branches of learning, is an urgent necessity if true scholarship is to be encouraged, and if the development of the faculties of the best University men is to be secured. In the Punjab University there has hitherto been almost no provision made under this head, as the few ill paid Readerships connected with it have been awarded on condition of service in the Oriental College for a specified period. The stipends are of the value of Rs 40, Rs 50, Rs 60 and Rs 70, approximately speaking and the Readers are expected to do teaching work in the Oriental College and are occasionally asked to translate the proceedings of the Senate into Urdu. These are not conditions favourable to original research. The scale of remuneration ought to be increased and less teaching work exacted in order to leave greater leisure for original work.

Dr Bourne—You must be aware that in English Universities Fellowships for original work are not divested from teaching work, as teaching supplements research.

Witness—I recognise the value of teaching work for a scholar, but then the teaching should not be of the type expected of these Readers in the Oriental College. If they were to be allowed to compile for the use of the Oriental classes books on western sciences based on different works on each subject, instead of supplying verbatim translations of text-books prescribed for the corresponding examinations on the arts side, much better results would be produced.

The Association urges that to avoid abnormal pressure on the brains of students, which is believed to be largely responsible for their physical weakness, for the premature decay of their mental faculties, and for the dulling of their intellects, greater option should be allowed to students in the selection of subjects of study, and students failing in one subject only should not be forced to again pass an examination in subjects in which they have already passed.

(a) The career of many a brilliant student has been marred because the rules of the University obliged him to take up subjects for which he had no aptitude or taste. This has been a direct incentive to cram, and has greatly injured the prospects of true learning and original research. If instead of this the student be left more free to select subjects better suited to his taste, better results may be expected.

(b) A great deal of valuable energy of young men has been wasted by subjecting them to repeated examinations in subjects in which they have already

passed, simply because they failed in some other subject. The Association is strongly in favour of a rule being passed to the effect that a student failing in one subject alone in the F. A. and B. A. Examinations shall be permitted to appear again in that subject only.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—Would you object to put it in this way that if a man shows distinct merit in two subjects and fails in one only he should not be obliged to take up again the subjects in which he was successful.

Witness.—I accept the modification. It is a very reasonable one. It is really in the case of such students that the grievance comes in. Sometimes a student shows high merit in two or three subjects and fails in one subject by a few marks. At present he will have to work at it for one year again and take the risk of failing in another subject next year. There is always a risk in examinations. Instances have been known of gentlemen who have been very confident of their knowledge of one subject being plucked in that subject itself. To mention a concrete instance, one gentleman, Mr. Abdul Aziz, M.A., passed his B.A. standing first in the whole of the Punjab. The previous year to that he failed. He relied chiefly on Mathematics which he believed to be his strong point and somehow or other he spoilt his first paper on Mathematics and did not go in for the other papers. There was another gentleman, Mr. Tilak Ram, M.A., who was also first in the order of merit in his own year in the B.A. The year previous to that he failed in one subject, but even then if all his marks were added up he stood first. Witness would limit the suggestion to one subject.

Dr. Bourne.—Do you wish that the candidate should join the B.A. class or would you send him back to the second year class?

Witness.—I would let him join the B.A. class and go up for the one subject in which he had failed in next year.

Dr. Mackichan.—Why not allow him to pass altogether?

Witness.—Because if you adopt the other alternative the student will have an opportunity of making up his deficiency in the one subject and of becoming a good man all round.

Dr. Mackichan.—Would you apply the same rule in a case of failure in English or would you make any exception with regard to English at the examinations?

Witness.—It would be very difficult to make any such distinction, although a knowledge of English is specially important.

As regards the Oriental Classical languages (Sanskrit, Arabic and Persian),
 Classical languages the Association is of opinion that the study of the former two may be given the encouragement they deserve by placing the courses in those languages on the same level with the Persian course in point of difficulty. The Association also strongly urge the removal from the B. A. Persian course of the Arabic portions of reading and grammar that have been appended to it, because this presses hard on those students, who have not read any Arabic previously, and who form the majority of those taking up Persian for the B. A. In this connection witness said that he wished to lay stress on the necessity of English-knowing teachers of Oriental languages, especially in view of the fact that the examination in these languages is conducted through the medium of English.

As regards the question of the vernacular languages of India, the Association believes that by the impulse given
 Vernacular languages, in recent times to the development of indigenous literature these languages have improved sufficiently in point of literary wealth to deserve a place in the curriculum of Colleges, and that as an experiment the most advanced of these languages may be recognised as fit subjects of study for the Intermediate Examination in Arts, if not for the B. A. In the Punjab, Urdu, Hindi and Gurmukhi might be included in the list of optional subjects for the F. A., provided that no student be permitted to take more than two languages in all, including English. The recognition of these languages as possible subjects of study in the Colleges will give an impetus to the growth of vernacular literature, and will help to develop men fitted to do the

original work in the vernaculars, which is retarded at present by the fact that the instruction of the students in the vernaculars of the country is left far too incomplete in the schools. In many schools there is absolutely no provision for teaching vernaculars and students are left to their own resources. This is a state of things which deserves to be remedied.

The Association is strongly of opinion that an age limit is both unnecessary and undesirable. It is not convinced that any tangible evil has been proved to result from the absence of such a limit, while there is a clear possibility of its acting as an obstacle in the way of some of the most intelligent and promising young men who generally pass out of the schools at a comparatively tender age. It has been generally observed that such boys do not show themselves to be in any way inferior to students of more advanced age in intelligence or grasp of intricate subjects, and if their physical exercise is carefully supervised, they do not suffer in physique either. The fixing of a limit will either put a sudden stop to the progress of such boys at an impressionable period of their age and expose them to the risk of becoming idlers, or will encourage false representations as to age being made by candidates for the Entrance Examination.

WITNESS NO 21—MR F J PORTMAN, B A, Professor of History, Government College, Lahore

Witness said that the scheme for an Honours course described in his statement (paper No 21 in Part II) should only be regarded as provisional. The ideal is an Honours course entirely separate from the Pass course but so many men of large experience say that an Honours course is impossible at present that witness has ventured to put forward his scheme as a preliminary step. The impossibility of an Honours course seems to be largely due to the impracticability of providing the necessary teaching. There is not a sufficient staff and not enough time to teach a separate Pass and a separate Honours course.

It is almost impossible for students to show any originality under the present system of examinations. They regard everything outside the text books as a mere waste of time. Witness had always heard before he came to India that the native student is very much addicted to cramming and believed that this was due to some fault in the native student. But he now finds that it is the result of the system more than the fault of the student. Closely connected with this is the extraordinary fewness of first class men in recent years which is also to be attributed to the character of the examinations. To take the M A course in History with which witness has most acquaintance, the amount to be read is about the same as that required in the case of an Honours man at Oxford in the Oxford History School but in India the books have to be read as text books and no questions can be asked by the examiner outside them. There should be no need to prescribe books for the M A—it should be sufficient to prescribe the subject. Very much depends upon the examiner. He must understand that he is examining for Honours and not for a Pass course. An Honours course does not mean the study of a greater number of text books but it consists in knowing the subject thoroughly in studying authorities, and in connecting the various works. At present there is no idea of connection between the prescribed books of the M A course. They are not taken as parts of a whole and the student is at a loss whenever one book contradicts another. And if one teaches a subject as one would like to teach it the students are apt to say, "What is the good of this, we have to get marks in the examinations for this we have to know our books and it is not necessary to go outside them." It is the nature of the examinations mainly that is at fault. If any scheme for an Honours course is introduced it will be much better for the teachers to examine.

Dr Bourne—Do you think that examination papers need improvement everywhere in India?

Witness—I have not sufficient knowledge of other Universities to speak with regard to them.

Dr Bourne—My point is this that people everywhere tell us the same thing that the secret is to get better papers. Why is it that in all these years during which the best men have been engaged in the setting of papers that they cannot produce better results?

Witness—I suppose it is a matter of tradition. The examiner says "Here are a certain number of books on which I have to set questions."

The President—What you deprecate for Honours you recommended for Pass men.

Witness—Yes. The ordinary student who just passes forgets everything or very nearly everything of his education within a few years.

Mr Justice Banerjee—Might that not be improved by improving the system of examinations in his case also?

Witness—It might be so, but I am not sure whether the ordinary student in the Punjab is capable of such improvement. There are however students who do want something in the way of an Honours course. Some extra incentive might be given to students to induce them to go in for the proposed quasi-Honours course. It would be possible to cause it to be publicly understood that certain appointments and so forth would depend upon the Honours degree.

Dr. Mackichan.—It seems to me that it would be a very good thing if the University could be dissevered from Government service altogether.

Witness.—I simply take facts as they are.

Dr. Mackichan.—Possibly the whole original mistake was in giving diplomas to be used as certificates for Government service.

Witness.—Again all scholars and students who distinguish themselves in the earlier examinations might be compelled to take Honours. A scholar at Oxford is required to take the Honours school. This would rest with the college authorities and should not be made a University rule. The tendency to form Honours colleges would be thus hastened.

In reply to the President, witness said that he did not mean to exclude unseen passages from the Pass papers. He then made the suggestion, on the analogy of the Oxford Honours Schools, that in the Honours course of Oriental languages students should be required to show a general knowledge of certain authors and be prepared to translate any part of them.

The teaching difficulty in connection with the *quasi*-Honours course would not be very great. The number of the text-books for the Pass course should be reduced and they should be included in the Honours course though not as text-books. Then for the first year both sets of students would work together and by that time the Pass men would be practically done with, and for the rest of the time they would be able to work for themselves and their work would consist largely of learning by heart. The Professor could then devote himself to the Honours men. Candidates should be allowed to take a special subject as in the Oxford Honours School. This would increase the teaching difficulty. But if the University becomes a teaching University or inter-collegiate lecture-ships are established for special subjects, this difficulty might be overcome. Students have great need of a larger choice. At present there is too much lecturing and the students are not made to do enough for themselves, and in consequence the ordinary student does very little work until a month before the examination. The standard for passing in the diminished number of text-books should be a great deal harder than it is at present. At least 50 to 60 per cent. of the total should be exacted. This reform might lead to learning, at any rate it would lead to something.

The introduction of the tutorial system would be an excellent thing. It is to be introduced into the Government College and may have the effect of making the students work better. Whether or not class exercises are set depends entirely upon the teacher. It is the custom of the witness to set a class paper periodically. On one occasion he set a paper by surprise and there was a universal complaint that no time had been given for preparation, although it was a subject which the class had been studying for the previous month. Home work, essays, etc., are set.

Witness has examined first-year students, but has not taught them. Their knowledge of English varies considerably. In the Government College the first-year class consists of 50. A day or two ago witness looked over their English papers and found that although they had been just a year in the college, the papers did not show proper preparation. In the case of something under half the candidates the knowledge shown was most inadequate.

It is a mistake to put marks in the margin of the papers. Possibly it may be done for Pass, but certainly not for Honours papers. A rigid system of marking is perhaps one of the great defects of the present system of examinations. Having the Oxford prejudice, witness would like marks to be abolished altogether, but that would perhaps be going too far at present.

All students should be compelled to study the outline of Ancient History for the Intermediate Course. Without some knowledge of Greek and Roman History, it is impossible for them to understand the English authors they have to read.

It is difficult to realise to what a great extent most of the books are built upon a knowledge of classics and of classical history, and it is a wonder that students can understand a good many of the books at all, considering the enormous number of classical allusions given in them.

Dr. Mackichan.—Do you think it essential to put into the University curriculum everything a student should know? Would you not leave him to work a little outside the curriculum by himself? There are hundreds of things which never come into the University course.

Witness.—The question is whether they would do this or whether they would not trust to notes published in the books or dictated by the teachers.

The objection may be brought to the proposals made by witness that they constitute an attempt to graft an extraneous system on to Indian education.

English Model.

The answer is that an endeavour is being made to teach in India on the English system, and therefore that the very best English models should be followed.

The point has also been raised that specialising is not a good thing for the ordinary student, but the specialising witness has proposed, is meant for extraordinary and not for ordinary students. It is perhaps doubtful whether the taking of special subjects in the B A would be a good thing. In the M A., students should certainly be allowed to take special subjects.

Specialisation

The difficulty that professors experience in forming personal relations with the students is very great indeed. There are so many of them that it is impossible to know anything of them individually and that is why it is so very important that the tutorial system should be introduced. Each professor should have more or less under his charge, at any rate in close connection with him, a small number of students whom he will be able really to know. That is the only way in which men coming out fresh from home can get to know the students, and it is essential for the good of education that it should be carried out.

Professors and Students

Witness is Secretary of the University Sports Tournament. It has been a very great success. Witness is impressed with the great importance of athletic education in India, because the ordinary Pass man gets very little benefit out of the learning he acquires, whereas he may get the very greatest benefit if he can only learn to play games and play them properly and mix with his fellows. The proper games spirit as it exists in England is one of the most important things that can be introduced into India, but the difficulties are great. Every student in the Government College is required to take some form of physical exercise. There are four foot-ball teams, four cricket teams and one hockey team, besides a gymnasium class in the Government College.

Athletics.

Mr. Pedler.—Do you get up matches between the various years of your college?

Witness.—Our cricket accommodation is so limited and inferior in quality that it is almost impossible to play a match at all. If we get our new grounds, something of that sort can be done. I look forward in the future to a system of inter-University matches. It would be a great advantage. The Government College cricket team went on tour last year and the Aligarh College team also goes on tour.

Mr. Pedler.—In Bengal we have various colleges competing all over the Province in foot-ball.

Witness.—Here we have only one University tournament in the year. It seems to me that one thing we want in this is encouragement from Europeans. Of course that has nothing to do with the University. I merely speak about it, because there was a case, which I do not think I can mention, where encouragement was distinctly withheld.

WITNESS NO. 22.—MUHAMMAD SHAH DIN, Esq., B.A., Barrister-at-Law,
representing the Anjuman-i-Islamia, Lahore.

(Written statement No. 22 in Part II.)

The staff of the Law College is quite sufficient to meet the educational needs of the Province. Formerly the condition of the college was not quite satisfactory, but the staff has recently been strengthened by the appointment of a whole-time Principal, Dr. Serrell, who has already given evidence before the Commission.

The number of students in the college is decreasing year by year. The present number is 159, consisting of 141 English and 18 vernacular students. A serious consequence is that the expenditure now exceeds the income. The maximum income, reached in the year 1899, was Rs. 36,000. In that year the number of students on the rolls was the largest ever known. In the year 1900 the income fell to Rs. 35,000. Then there was a sudden drop in the year 1901 to Rs. 22,000. In the present year it has been calculated that the expenditure amounted to about Rs. 20,000 and the income to about Rs. 15,000, so that in 1902 there will be a loss of about Rs. 5,000. The falling off in the number of students is due to the fact that there is not the same demand as there used to be for lawyers in the Province. The practice in the law courts has recently shown a very marked tendency to decrease and therefore students who have taken their degrees in the Arts colleges are not so desirous as formerly for law degrees. The passing of the Land Alienation Act will result every year in the diminution of law cases and again the passing of the Law of Appeal, an amendment of the Punjab Courts Act, has had the effect of raising the value of the appeals which lie to the Chief Court with the consequence that many cases which used to go to the Chief Court on the appellate side, now go partly to the revisional side on which the Chief Court does not interfere on the facts but only on important points of law. There is also looming in the near distance the Punjab Pre-emption law in which it is proposed to take away jurisdiction with respect to certain cases from the civil courts and to hand it over to the Revenue courts. If this is done then so much practice will be taken away from the lawyers, because the Revenue courts do not appreciate the supposed assistance of lawyers. It is therefore to be expected that the decrease in the number of students who join the Law College will continue. The very important question therefore arises as to how to maintain the Law College on its present footing. Only recently a whole-time Principal has been appointed and unless there is a fairly large rise in the number of students on the rolls of the Law College, it will be difficult to completely occupy his time and it may be necessary to reduce the staff by dispensing with the services of some of the readers. Recently a rule was passed by the Senate to the effect that these readerships should be given only for a certain number of years and an additional reader in the Law College has been appointed for a period of one year. If the income of the college does not increase that readership will have to be abolished. At any rate the University has been doing all it can to run the Law College in a satisfactory manner.

It is very desirable that the three years' course should be reduced to one of two years and that the course on the degree side should be entirely a post-graduate course. There are two sides to the college, the diploma side under the control of the Chief Court and the degree side under the control of the University. On the diploma side the regulations only require students to have passed the Entrance Examination and on the degree side the regulations require that a student should, before joining the Law College, have passed the Intermediate Examination and that he should pass the B. A. Examination before appearing at the preliminary examination in law. If the course is reduced then no one should be allowed to join as a student on the degree side unless he has passed the B. A. This rule was recommended by the Law Faculty unanimously, and has been accepted by the Syndicate and sent to the Judges of the Chief Court for their opinion.

The establishment of a boarding-house in connection with the Law College is much needed. The proposal has been under the consideration of the Law College Committee for a considerable time and recently a report was called for from the Principal asking whether the establishment of such a boarding-house is a possibility. The report has already been received, but it has not yet been laid before the Committee. It is to the effect that 75 students are prepared to join the boarding-house, that the cost would be about Rs. 500 or Rs. 600 a month and that the University would have to pay Rs. 50 a month apart from the appointment of a Superintendent. Therefore if a Superintendent is appointed by the University and if he is allowed, say, between Rs. 40 and Rs. 50 a month, then perhaps the Law College Committee might have to make provision for a sum of about Rs. 100 a month in order that the boarding-house should be a success. The fee proposed to be levied by the Principal per head is Rs. 1-8-0. That does not seem to be a very large amount.

The opening of law classes in connection with Arts colleges would be a very undesirable thing because in the event of the number of law students decreasing, it would be suicidal to allow Arts colleges to start law classes independently of the Law College which is maintained by the University. The Law College could not be maintained on its present footing if this were done. On the application of Mr. Alnutt, then Principal of the St. Stephen's College, Delhi, asking for permission to start a law class in connection with his college, the whole question was very fully considered and it was decided that such permission ought not to be granted.

The Oriental College ought to be maintained not only because it is required to be maintained by Statute, but also because it supplies a very great want in the Province. The Oriental College of the Punjab University is almost the only institution which provides teachers in oriental languages in the Punjab and it also supplies other parts of India. The Hyderabad Education Department has been furnished with a number of oriental teachers from the Oriental College. Although the Oriental College should be maintained, yet it may be admitted that it needs to be thoroughly overhauled and that a searching enquiry should be made as to the sufficiency and soundness of the course prescribed and the methods of teaching. It would become much more popular if the standard of general education were raised and especially if a knowledge of English were required from the students who have titles conferred upon them. [Witness then referred to the rules on the subject on pages 109, 110 and 111 of the University Calendar.] Candidates who go up for the *Shastri* or *Munshi-Fazil* Examination should be required to pass either in the Intermediate or any higher examination of the Oriental or Arts Faculty of the Punjab University or an examination in English equivalent to the standard of the Entrance Examination, because a knowledge of English corresponding to that standard would add to the capacity of the students to acquire an intelligent knowledge of the eastern classical languages. Similarly candidates for *Mauvis Alami*, *Prajna* or *Munshi* should be required in substitution for clause (b)* on page 111 of the Calendar to pass an examination in English corresponding to the Entrance standard. A good knowledge of English is essential for advanced oriental students and the Entrance is the lowest standard that witness would accept.

So far as the diffusion of European sciences through the medium of the vernaculars goes, the readers and translators appointed by the Punjab University, in connection with the few endowments that exist, have not discharged their duties in this direction. [Witness then referred to the rules relating to endowed readers and translations on pages 340 to 342 of the Calendar.] The salaries which are attached to these readerships are almost ludicrously small, for instance Rs. 75, Rs. 91, Rs. 72, Rs. 41 and Rs. 60. The duties which the holders have to perform are set forth in paragraph 11 on pages 341 and 342. The readers are required to translate works of science or Sanskrit texts or any other subjects into the vernacular. The object is a very laudable one, but the Commission will see from the list which has been supplied by the Principal of the

* The clause requires candidates of the lower titles to pass an examination in English of the standard of the Middle School Examination.

Oriental College that only two books have so far been written by the readers who have from time to time held these posts. The other books referred to by the Chancellor were written by the teachers of the Oriental College. Sound vernacular literature can only be promoted in the Punjab by requiring the readers to perform their duties in the manner in which they are required to perform them by the rules, and it is to be hoped that the University will in future see that the rules are properly acted upon. But the salaries which are given to the readers are too small to encourage them to work. If the University could supplement the salaries attached to these readerships by allowances from their funds, perhaps the work would be performed more efficiently than hitherto. If the readers translate any works they become the property of the University. Mr. Madan Gopal translated "Fowler's Deductive Logic," but that book does not appear on the list.

Witness next referred to the work which has been done by the Standing Sub-Committee of the Syndicate. Witness is still acting as Secretary of this Committee. Formerly the Committee was allowed an annual grant of Rs. 2,000 to cover expenses incidental to the work of supervising the preparation of books in the vernacular. That grant has now been withdrawn owing to the financial difficulties of the University. The work which the Standing Sub-Committee was doing, is a work which ought to be continued. Clause (c) of Statute No. 7 (page 37 of the Calendar) lays it down that University funds may be applied to the bestowal of rewards for approved vernacular translations, compilations, and original treasures on works of literary merit. The work is thus one on which the University can legitimately and profitably spend money and it ought not to grudge the Rs. 2,000 which it used formerly to hand over for this purpose. So far the Standing Committee has succeeded in having three books translated—"Fowler's Deductive Logic," "Swindon's History of the World," and "Ladd's Primer of Psychology," and it is only for want of funds that they have not been able to patronise original works in the vernacular. Such patronage on the part of the University is absolutely necessary for the advancement of learning and it was with extreme regret witness had to mention one instance in which they were unable to extend such patronage. The case he wanted to allude to was that of a work prepared by Maulvi Syed Ahmed of Delhi under the auspices of His Highness the Nizam's Government. The Standing Sub-Committee wanted very much to patronise that work by rewarding the author, but owing to want of funds, they were unable to carry out their wishes. Such works ought to be rewarded and the University ought to be asked to make a provision, if possible, in its annual budget for this purpose.

There ought to be two courses after the Matriculation—the ordinary Pass course and the Honours course. For the Pass course there should be four subjects, three compulsory and one optional, and for the Honours only one subject on which the whole of the intellectual energies of the student ought to be concentrated.

The Senate of the Punjab University as constituted at present is a fairly representative body consisting, as it does, of 136 Fellows representing all classes of the community. In the interests of sound education it would not be advisable all at once to reduce this number, but means can probably be devised to reduce it gradually to a reasonable number—100 or 125. The number ought not to exceed 125. A University Fellowship is considered as a social distinction and in many cases Fellowships have been given by way of compliment. In future this ought not to be the case. Fellowships should be given as a mark of recognition of the literary ability possessed by the recipient or the deep and lively interest he takes in the cause of education. If that rule were adopted and Fellowships given on that principle, then the Senate would become a better body. Witness would decidedly be opposed to Fellowships being made terminable. The best course the Government or the University authorities can adopt is to appoint the best men in the first instance and then to leave them to do their work in the Senate for their lives.

Under the present condition of the Province, witness would hardly be prepared to recommend the election of Fellows by an electorate of the graduates of the Punjab University. The experience gained in connection with these elections in other Universities points to some very objectionable means being adopted to carry out the end in view—notably canvassing.

An important subject is the promotion of genuine University life. There is of course the Punjab University Sports Tournament, but something is wanted in addition to that, namely, a University Library, literary clubs and societies and also recreation clubs. If these societies and clubs are established, apart altogether from the clubs and societies which exist in connection with individual colleges in Lahore, University students would profit a great deal by them and a real *esprit de corps* would be brought into existence among the students of the University.

Witness is entirely opposed to the fixing of any age limit. In the first instance it has not been shown how the absence of such a limit has acted detrimentally upon the cause of sound education in the Punjab. In the second place, it has not been shown that the percentage of failures in the cases of boys who appear at the Entrance under the age of 16 is greater than in the case of older boys and unless some such reasons are established it seems inadvisable to disturb existing conditions. As to the physique of boys of tender age suffering from going up for the examination at an early age, the remedy lies in reducing the courses of study in the High Schools. Some branches of study are too heavy for the students who have to go through them. Witness has also been told that the Calcutta University imposed an age limit some time ago and that after an experience of several years the restriction was given up. If it was shown that the age limit proposal did not work satisfactorily in an advanced province, it seems too early to impose such a limitation in the Punjab.

Mr. Pedler.—There is a recommendation at present before the Senate of the Calcutta University to adopt the age limit again, but it remains to be seen what the effect of that recommendation may be.

Witness.—If it is adopted in that Presidency, then the question might come up for consideration before the Senate of the Punjab University. The question did come up for consideration in the Syndicate, but there was very strong opposition to it and the Vice-Chancellor proposed that the question should not be considered further.

WITNESS NO. 23—**SHEIKH MUHAMMAD SHAH**, Pleader, Chief Court, representing the Anjuman-i-Islamia, Amritsar.

(Written statement No. 23 in Part II.)

In Amritsar only the Khalsa College has hostels. The Municipal College has a hostel for its school, and boys of the College class can live in it. The Anjuman-i-Islamia School has a hostel with a Superintendent and 20 boarders.

Witness explained that his evidence would relate mainly to primary and secondary education. Several witnesses have said that English is not properly taught. As long as primary and secondary education are not put on a sound footing, there can be no good superstructure. One suggestion has been the separation of the School Final and the Matriculation, and that the Matriculation should be made stiffer. Such separation without providing for more efficient tuition would create grave difficulties. By raising the standard of Matriculation the value of the School Final would also be diminished.

Conversation for 12 hours a week in class is not sufficient to develop the conversational powers of the student. There should be conversation classes from the 5th class in the High School in addition to reading composition and translation. In the Punjab English has not taken such deep root that parents can assist their boys to acquire English.

Syed Hossain Bilgrami—What is the good with ill-paid native masters ?

Witness.—The headmaster of our institution is always an Englishman : the number in the class never exceeds 40.

There should be free social intercourse between teachers and students. Muhammadans have no objection to social intercourse with Europeans ; they can eat at the same table.

Some subjects should be removed to make room for English. For instance, boys know enough Geography in the Middle School, it is not necessary to retain it up to the Entrance.

Up to the third class Persian is optional. Students never take a keen interest in optional subjects. Suddenly in the 5th class it becomes compulsory for the Matriculation. In the B.A., if a man takes up Persian, he must also take up Arabic, although he may never have studied it before. The result is, he crams the prescribed 20 nights of the "Arabian Nights Entertainment," and forgets it as soon as the examination is over.

One objection to the separation of the School Final and the Matriculation is that headmasters must be very reliable for their certificates to be accepted.

Dr. Mackichan.—The examination would be under the superintendence of the Educational Department.

Witness.—The drift of the evidence is that the School Final should be easier ; will that be the case if the Department manages it ?

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—The difference between the two examinations seems to be very slight.

Syed Hossain Bilgrami.—More English is wanted for the Matriculation.

Dr. Mackichan.—It should test the fitness to enter College.

Witness.—A better knowledge of English is required ; provision will therefore have to be made for devoting more time to it.

Mr. Bell.—Other subjects are taught in English.

Witness.—That does not give language training. The questions in the examination are confined to facts.

There is no need to separate the School Final and the Matriculation. Mere Matriculation is not a passport to Government appointments. Candidates do not appear for the Matriculation simply to get employment, and Government does not accept the Entrance certificate except for ministerial work.

Dr. Mackichan.—We have been told that only one quarter go to college. What becomes of the other three quarters?

Witness.—Appointments are not the sole aim; many are prevented from going on from poverty. All go up in the hope of proceeding to the University. There is no harm in that.

Mr. Bell.—At Amritsar you pay special attention to commercial and technical education; these are pre-eminently subjects for the School Final and not for Matriculation.

Witness.—Can they get employment?

Mr. Bell.—They are snapped up.

Witness.—In so far as I know that is not the case at Amritsar, but a School Final may be kept for commercial and clerical education.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—Apart from that, up to the Entrance stage, the subjects are not very different; is it therefore desirable to multiply the examinations?

Witness.—No.

Dr. Mackichan.—There is no multiplication if they take only one or other of the examinations.

Mr. Justice Banerjee.—Many will try both.

Dr. Mackichan.—When it comes to 7,000 candidates the examination itself suffers.

High Schools should be represented on the Senate by managers or qualified headmasters. In the Punjab there are important sectarian institutions, which require to be represented. (It was here remarked that the position of the Punjab University with regard to school education is different to that of other Universities.)

It is important that sympathetic Assistant Inspectors of Schools should be appointed and that they should be above suspicion. An Inspector of Muhammadan schools should, if possible, be a Muhammadan. And if he is a Hindu, he should be sympathetic. Persons with *anti* proclivities should never be appointed.

There are 600 boys in the school. They are taught up to the Entrance standard. A Theological Department is attached to the school. There is an oriental side in which Arabic and oriental Science are studied. In the main school Persian and Arabic are both taught, one of them being optional. If a student takes Arabic as an optional, he must take Persian as a compulsory subject and *vice versa*. Persian is preferred as the easier subject. Annual prizes are given. In the Theological Department the teaching is in the old style. In the main school Arabic is taught in the modern style.

WITNESS NO. 24.—M. G. V. COLLEGE, Esq., M.A., Principal, Khalsa College, Amritsar.

(Statement No. 24 in Part II.)

An institution only preparing for half the University career can hardly be called a college. Its students experience great difficulty when they go to another college after passing the F.A. and come under different men and a different system. In the F.A. Colleges, especially when they are connected with schools, the students are treated like school-boys. No more colleges should be recognized up to the F.A. This will prevent the establishment of some colleges, but what they give is not University education. Witness would not withdraw affiliation from F.A., colleges that have already been recognised. His institution contains classes from the primary school right up to the B.A. and he finds it difficult to make suitable rules. The college has seven students in the 3rd and 4th years, five in the 3rd year and two who went up for the recent examination. They both failed. The college was recognised up to the B.A. in 1899. There are eight students in the second and twenty in the first year.

It is very difficult to arrange for courses in all subjects in a college with a small staff. Perhaps one year students want Mathematics and another year Science. Last year two students wanted Mathematics and one Science; it was not possible to teach both and the Science man had therefore to be sent away. The institution has both Mathematical and Science teachers, but the double college course could not be fitted in with the general arrangements. Syed Hossain Bilgrami suggested that the college should follow only one course. Witness replied that that would not be possible at present, the college is feeling its way.

The fees are low and neither the school or college pays its way. The college is supported by endowments. Sikhs pay at half the rate of other students; the Sikhs' rate is Rs. 2-8 0 for the second year and Rs 4 or 5 for the B.A. classes. The college receives no Government aid. The school fees vary from one anna to one rupee a month. There are so few candidates that there is little competition for the scholarships. The recommendation of the Principal is accepted.

The Sikh students do not stay long in college; they mostly want to take up Engineering. Some go to Roorkee or take up surveying after passing the B.A.

Religious education is compulsory and no boarders but Sikhs are admitted to the hostel. The institution was founded largely for the sake of the Sikh religion. The boys are supposed to read *Gurmukhi*, though in fact they take little or no interest in it. Their interest is concentrated on examination subjects.

Difficult explanations have to be given in English, because the students find it very difficult to understand spoken English. The remedy is to have an Englishman to teach in the school department. Witness cannot spare the time. The senior boys who play games understand much better than those who have not had this opportunity for conversation. There should be conversation on general subjects several times a week. It might be well in the case of boys who are determined to go in for a college career to make them pass an examination for the special purpose of showing that they will be able to understand what they are taught. Witness has not, however, devoted attention to this question.

The only remedy for the defects of isolated colleges is concentration in University towns.

Concentration in University towns.

WITNESS NO. 25 — J G GILBERTSON, Esq, M A, Superintendent, Mission High School, Lahore.

(Written statement No 25 in Part II)

The connection between the schools and the University should be severed, leaving the former absolutely under the control of the Education Department. At present they are under double control. As far as their working is concerned, they are really in the hands of the University and not in those of the Department because the teachers' credit and the grant in aid depend on the results of the University examinations. The teaching given is not education. There is a great deal of cramming but not to the extent to which it has been said to exist. The use of the vernaculars is too free especially in the High School where all instruction should be in English. The temptation is very great for the teachers to explain matters in the vernacular because they can convey their meaning in that language much more readily. The teachers try to go through their courses as frequently as possible. In some subjects witness has known them go through the course as many as five times in a year. This is not education. The best teachers are given to the Secondary Department and the Primary Department has to rest satisfied with less qualified men.

The greatest evil lies in the number of private schools that exist throughout the Province. They are the outcome of the University Examinations. They are detrimental in every way. They interfere with school discipline, and underbid the recognised schools by charging low fees and taking away the boys which the latter have refused to send up for examination. They are poorly staffed and push their pupils through in the best way they can. They are not recognised by the Department and yet they are recognised by the University. If the University were to make a rule that no school shall be recognised unless it comes up to a certain standard, they would cease to exist. Witness' contention is that if the Entrance Examination as conducted by the University were done away with they would then also cease to exist. The teachers in the recognised schools would then have a much better chance of imparting real education. They would not be induced to go several times over the course, nor to give explanations in the vernacular and they would present a better class of students to the colleges. The Code rules are much better than the University regulations.

The inferior method of teaching adopted to prepare boys for the University examinations is greatly due to the teachers' desire to get credit, for passing a large number of boys. The teachers and not the head masters regulate the work. In the Lahore Mission School five teachers are engaged in teaching the Entrance class, they teach the five different subjects of the examination. Because of this evil proper attention is not paid to the primary department. Head masters have told witness that they would consider it a degradation to teach in the primary school. That is the general idea. The Entrance Examination is the test by which the schools are judged, and it ruins education.

Mr Justice Banerjee — Is not that the fault of the teachers.

Witness — We are gradually getting better men and we are trying to get rid of the evil practice of teaching so hurriedly as to run through a particular course four or five times in a year. The evil began before the present era of trained teachers, and it is difficult to get rid of its weight.

There need be no difference between the school final and the present

The Entrance Examination.

Entrance, but schools should not be responsible for training boys for the latter. On leaving school they will not however be ill equipped for it. Schools or colleges might have preparatory classes for them. Coaches may arise to take charge of them. If an educated boy is put in the hands of a crammer it will do him good, although it would ruin an uneducated boy for life. No change in the present nature of the Entrance examination would cure the evil. The mischief is that the Government attaches a value to the examination and the University conducts it. Another aspect of the evil is the rivalry it creates between schools. That in itself is not wholesome and it injures discipline in the schools. Witness does not object to payment by results but to payment by the results of the examinations conducted by the University. For entrance to college there should be an examination by the University or no examination at all. It would not be desirable to allow each college to hold its own examination, because there would be no standard of education; some colleges would admit anyone. In the course of time when the schools have had a reasonable chance of doing their work no special preparatory classes will be needed; for the boys will be sufficiently educated to study by themselves and for themselves. They will know how to study. At present they do not. They merely commit facts to memory. The examination itself is not in special need of improvement. It does not lead to cramming so much as the school system. Besides cramming does not exist to an alarming extent. It is the private schools that are ruining the boys. It is they who are to blame for the alleged unfitness of the students. Badly manned and badly staffed as they are, they compete with institutions of a better class and seriously interfere with their discipline. There are four such schools in Lahore. Witness does not know what brought them into existence, but it is the Entrance examination that keeps them alive.

The Middle School Examination.

The Middle School Examination is open to much the same objection as the Entrance.

English teaching.

It has been said that the bad English of the boys who go from the schools to the colleges is largely due to their being taught by badly paid teachers. That is certainly not the experience of witness. Last year witness visited the five high schools of his Mission. The teachers are well paid and efficient. The head masters get Rs. 100 to Rs. 150, and there is hardly a single teacher who is paid less than Rs. 15 a month.

Training College

The Training College has done excellent work in producing good and efficient teachers. There should be a rule that all candidates coming up for the Normal College Examination should be required to have had at least three months' practice in the model school in order that they may be able to more efficiently help the Head Master. The pay of Rs. 15 is for men with the junior vernacular certificate. If they are well qualified they soon rise to higher pay.

Underselling in private schools.

There is much underselling. The objection is not so great in the case of endowed schools but witness would prefer that even such schools should be compelled to receive fees on the same basis as other schools.

Dr. Bourne—There are instances in which schools have charged fees for the purpose of the accounts and then returned them to the students.

Witness.—Such schools should not be recognised, and instances of that sort do not affect the principle.

WITNESS No. 26—Harkishen Lal, Esq., B. A., Barrister-at-Law, representing the Government College Graduates' Union.

(Writer statement No 26 in Part II)

Witness exhibited a diagram showing by curves the percentage of passes for a number of years in the B A, Intermediate and Entrance Examinations. He pointed out that since 1894 the percentage had in all cases declined, before that there were great fluctuations. He is not aware what is the reason of the decline, but it accords with the general estimate of the candidates. Witness has been told that the class of undergraduates has deteriorated. The President suggested that this may be due to the larger number of candidates. Formerly when a man sent up one of his five boys because he was clever, a man of the same class would now send up a five, because it has become the custom. Witness said that he did not think that this is the explanation. No new class has been tapped and the capacity of individual boys is not tested before they go up to the Entrance examination. If the reason is that formerly more attention could be given to the individual forming the smaller classes, than that is an evil to which a remedy can be applied. In reply to Dr Bourne witness said that he considered that the present percentage of passes (about 50) is too low. There is no reason why 70 to 75 per cent, should not pass. Witness thinks that the quality of education may have deteriorated, there are more examinations and more rush and hurry.

In schools more attention should be paid to the study of languages, this was formerly the case. Now there is too great a multiplicity of subjects in the lower classes.

School teaching

There are too many examinations—class as well as public examinations. Boys are always being worked up for examinations. Private as well as public examinations are a strain. It is only a question of degree. Herein lies the main evil. All examinations are not to be condemned but their too great frequency is open to grave objection. The Middle School and Intermediate Examinations might be abolished.

Multiplicity of examinations.

There should be more teachers and smaller classes. Boys should in the first place be well grounded to their vernacular and then they should study English.

School teaching (continued).

In witness' time they had too much mathematics and history and had to spend too much time in class—6 hours a day. There were five subjects in the Intermediate and four (with sometimes an optional) in the B A course. The dance in class should be such shorter. Witness would adopt the Cambridge rule of three hours a week in each subject *i.e.*, one hour on every alternate day.

Excess of class work.

Witness would not encourage continuous application to study from the early morning. Schools and colleges are opened at 6 o'clock in the morning in the summer, and boys may be seen coming from their homes or boarding houses, before they have had a bath, with a book of history in their hands and reading their lessons possibly from the point where they had left off on the previous night. The result is that starting with a bad morning the whole day goes badly with them and they cannot possibly be in a proper frame of mind for study. In the hot weather if schools were opened at eight or nine in the morning it would be much better. In witness' younger days the practice was to go to school in the morning, come home at 10, and go back to school at three and work there till five or six. That system still prevails in zillah schools.

Hours of study.

There is no system in the schools for regulating home tasks. It may happen that the professor in Mathematics gives ten examples to be solved, the professor of English wants some translation to be done, and the professor of history also gives a lesson to be studied, the result is that the boys have not enough time to do all the work. If the classes in each subject were held on alternate days this evil would perhaps be removed. There should be two lectures a day for an hour each so that the students may have sufficient time for thorough study.

Home tasks.

In the vacation also such heavy tasks are given that the students have very little time for extra reading. Each professor thinks of his own subject only.

The study of the vernacular should be left to the schools but in the larger examinations the translation from classical languages should be into the vernacular.

Vernacular languages. Syed Hossain Bilgrami suggested that in the M. A., one course might be a classical with the corresponding vernacular language. Witness said he would prefer a thesis. At present gentlemen in the Punjab can hardly write a letter in the vernacular. Most of their private correspondence is done in English. They hardly know their vernacular sufficiently to express their ordinary thoughts.

Witness is in favour of Romanised Urdu, Hindi and Sanskrit Characters. It will not be difficult for students to pick up this system.

Syed Hossain Bilgrami.—I think you speak from your Cambridge experience.

Witness.—Yes. I am not considering the merits of the various systems of writing. What I say is that you must have one workable character.

Religious and Moral instruction. Education in Sanskrit and Arabic should be improved and students given instruction in the religious books.

Political Economy. This subject does not receive proper attention at present. It ought to be more generally and thoroughly taught.

Referring to the B course in mathematics and science (page 159 of the Calendar) witness described an anomaly of the examination rules whereby two candidates might answer the identical questions in identical words, and yet one might pass and the other fail, the reason being that that one might have taken a certain subject as "optional," in which case 33 per cent of the maximum marks is required for a pass, and the other have taken the same subject as "compulsory" in which case 40 per cent. of marks is required.

A small percentage of grace marks should be allowed and students who have failed in one subject should be re-examined in that subject only. This supplementary examination should be six months after that in which the student failed. In the meantime his promotion should not be stopped. Re-examination might be dispensed with if the candidate was distinguished in two subjects and only just failed in the third.

Several witnesses have supported the tutorial system. Witness agrees with them and would go a little further and say that there should be a similar system in schools. There should be teachers to look after the moral welfare of the students.

On the question of fees witness' idea is that there should be no competition. The fees in the Government College are too high. Witness knows of boys who would have gone to that college but for the high fees. The parents in certain cases have no knowledge of the value of education and cannot decide on the merits of the instruction given in different colleges; their first consideration is the fees. The result is that boys are deprived, on account of no fault of their own, of the opportunity of receiving a good education by being sent to colleges where the fees are small and instruction poor.

Scholarships. Scholarships are very few as compared with the number of boys.

The B. A. course should be reduced to three years; the M.A course extended to two years, and the Intermediate examination abolished. This will give more time for specialisation and will encourage the foundation of a Teaching University. The smaller colleges will confine themselves to the B.A. and will not have to provide for the highest form of education. Combined measures for the M.

The Vice Chancellor has said that the sectarian spirit promotes the foundation of private colleges. This should not be pushed too far. Inter-collegiate lectures will to some extent counteract the sectarian tendency.

Very few students at present go in for a specialised M. A. Course. The system prepared by witness will encourage them to do so, while it may slightly lower the standard of the Pass B. A. degree. It will not be much lowered. Time and anxiety will be saved by abolishing the Intermediate Examination.

The Government of India scholarships should be utilised solely for the recruitment of the Indian Educational Service.

Government of India scholarships

IMPERIAL SECRETARIAT LIBRARY

This book was taken from the Library on the
date last stamped

--	--	--

Sec Lib. 5.

W.D.—141 D of L.H&L—19-11 28-10,000.